## **ACADEMIC TRANSFORMATION: THE FORCES RESHAPING HIGHER EDUCATION IN ONTARIO**

**Strategic Choices for the Future of Ontario's Universities** 

Presentation to COU Academic Colleagues August 26, 2010

**David Trick** 

## OUTLINE

- 1. Key findings
- 2. Engaging the forces of change and shaping the outcome – a few of many strategic choices
- 3. Reactions to Academic Transformation
- 4. Discussion



## Some Highlights & Key Conclusions...

- 1. Transition from "elite" to "universal" higher education
- 2. The emergence of a new research paradigm
- 3. Average total funding has not declined...
- 4. Ontario undergraduate teaching uses the world's most expensive model but...
- 5. The current reality is very different
- 6. Funding drives university behaviour One-size-fitsall

## WE HAVE FAR MORE STUDENTS AND VERY DIVERSE NEEDS

A university or college degree has become a standard step in the education of a majority of Ontario's youth

## HIGHLIGHTS AND KEY CONCLUSIONS: AN IMPLICIT MODEL OF GROWTH WITH CONSEQUENCES

based on an 1960s teacherresearcher model

> responsive to the democratic </ imperative of access

**System driven by "traditionalist-expansionist" values** (after Martin Trow, 1973)

i.e. The province's universities have embraced growth (rather than limiting enrolment) but resisted any change in the model of education

## CLEARLY EXPANSIONIST: ENROLMENTS AS A SHARE OF THE POPULATION AGE 18-24, ONTARIO



### CLEARLY EXPANSIONIST: POSTSECONDARY ENROLMENTS, ONTARIO (FTES)



HIGHLIGHTS AND KEY CONCLUSIONS: THE CHALLENGE OF ACCESS

## The move from an elite system to a near universal system of higher education is not over yet...

The Approaching I	Boom in Enrolme	ents
-------------------	-----------------	------

	Enrolments (FTEs, 2007)	Projected growth in student demand by 2021
University undergraduate	354,000	60,000-100,000
College postsecondary	183,000	35,000-50,000

# AND AS IF THAT WAS NOT ENOUGH...

9

The second force reshaping higher education in Ontario

## HIGHLIGHTS AND KEY CONCLUSIONS: A NEW RESEARCH PARADIGM

### Knowledge production: the challenge of contributing to productivity, competitiveness and sustainability

- 1. Higher education and increased productivity and competitiveness
- 2. Responding to demands for knowledge creation: the emergence of a new paradigm for university research
- 3. Universities and knowledge creation
  - the conceptual rationale of the new strategy
  - expanding graduate programs
  - colleges and applied research

## A NEW RESEARCH PARADIGM: CHALLENGES EMERGING FROM THE MODEL

- 1. The threat of institutional and individual over-commitment
- 2. The consequences of the new research paradigm for disciplines outside of its focus
- 3. With application comes commercialization
- 4. Change is hard the academy adjusts to the evolution of universities and colleges

## AND ARE RESOURCES DECLINING AT THE SAME TIME?

"No" – in relation to CPI inflation "Yes" – in relation to universities' actual costs

## HIGHLIGHTS AND KEY CONCLUSIONS: PARADOX OF STABLE REVENUES AND FINANCIAL CRUNCH



Universities' CPI-adjusted annual \$ per student has been relatively stable at about \$13,000 (\$2007) since the 1980s

## HIGHLIGHTS AND KEY CONCLUSIONS: FUNDING DRIVES UNIVERSITY BEHAVIOUR

### University funding in a nutshell – one size fits all

- 1. No allowance for inflationary costs
- 2. Enrolment growth is the only source of new revenue
- 3. External and internal pressures to pursue research university status
- 4. Inadequate resources for focus on quality undergraduate programs

**Outcome:** A largely homogenous collection of universities

## SO WHAT IS THE PROBLEM?

15

A disconnect between theory and practice...

## ONTARIO UNDERGRADUATE TEACHING USES THE WORLD'S MOST EXPENSIVE MODEL...*IN THEORY*

- 1. Almost 100% of undergraduates are at "research universities"
- 2. Norm for faculty in Ontario universities is to allocate their effort on a 40-40-20 model (teaching-research-service)
- 3. At the same time costs related to undergraduate education and for other activities are rising faster than CPI inflation, e.g.,
  - Faculty & staff compensation
  - Student recruitment, support, scholarships...
  - Information technology
  - Indirect costs of research, including faculty resources, infrastructure, administration...
  - Capital costs
  - Fundraising

## **TEACHING QUALITY: STRUCTURE AND INCENTIVES**

Research on Teaching and Learning in Higher Education

Edited by Julia Christensen Hughes and Joy Mighty

### 1. HEQCO (2010) Taking Stock

- universities (particularly research universities) not placing enough priority on teaching and learning
- 2. Explanations (pages 266-267)
  - lack of prestige associated with teaching competence
  - lack of expectation for professional competence and improvement
  - human-resource practices (selection, tenure and promotion)
- 3. Call to Action (page 275) for:
  - faculty, education developers, administrators
  - and policy makers!

## FUNDING DRIVES UNIVERSITY BEHAVIOUR: APPROACHING THE LIMITS OF A UNIFORM SYSTEM

- 1. University funding forces uniformity
  - expand undergraduate enrolments
  - pursue competitive research grants
- 2. International experience is clear: if a differentiated system is desired, deliberate and sustained government action is necessary
- 3. Meeting the impending undergraduate enrolment increase (especially in the GTA) requires system change

### The Contradictions of Isomorphism

(Trends in Global Higher Education: Tracking an Academic Revolution, Altbach et al., UNESCO, 2009, p 19)

In the 21st century, the trend toward isomorphism can still be observed and tends to restrict the development of differentiated academic systems. Public authorities need to ensure diverse academic models to serve varied societal needs, while many academic institutions still tend to emulate the research universities at the top of the system. Academic staff often press the university to emphasize research as its key mission, knowing that a research orientation and productivity in this area promise the highest prestige and (often) the best salaries for academics.

If the universities remain the sole decision makers, many more academic institutions would seek to improve their status by becoming research intensive. In most cases, this strategy does not serve the interests of academe in general nor is it widely achievable.

Often, it takes governmental "steering" to keep the academic system diversified and institutions within the system serving larger national goals...The essential problem of isomorphism involves unbridled competition among academic institutions pursuing the same goals. This trend may undermine efforts to develop a system of institutions that is appropriately differentiated, based on the specific needs of a given system-with different goals and responsibilities, patterns of funding, admissions policies, and other characteristics.

## THE RETREAT OF THE TRADITIONAL MODEL

- 1. Dependence on larger classes and part-time faculty in our undergraduate programs
- 2. Impact on the educational experience
  - variability in instructor quality
  - limited student accessibility/engagement with itinerant, contract faculty
  - part-time faculty often not embedded in evaluation, support and development structure
- 3. Sustainability?
  - labour relations
- 4. Value for money for government, for students?

## **CAN WE DO BETTER?**

**Pursuing strategic options...** (A very few of many possibilities)

## PURSUING NEW OPTIONS:

## A NEW TEACHING-FOCUSED UNIVERSITY SECTOR

## Use expected growth in demand to create new sector of baccalaureate institutions that focuses on teaching

- 1. Institutions need not all be identical
  - some new; some converted from CAAT status
  - some baccalaureate-only; some offering degrees and diplomas
  - some exclusively career-focused; some including liberal arts
- 2. Benefits
  - cost effective (higher faculty course load; faculty expected to be current in their fields but not to do discovery research)
  - enhanced student engagement better for many students, especially from underrepresented groups
- 3. Key to success is to create these institutions as a separate sector erect barriers to prevent mission drift
  - models: Alberta, B.C., Florida, California

### PURSUING NEW OPTIONS:

FOSTERING INCREASED EFFICIENCY AND EFFECTIVENESS IN THE UNIVERSITY SECTOR

## • Different roles among institutions

- Financial incentives: use substantial portions of the operating grant for distinct mission-related envelopes
- Supporting change within institutions
  - widespread utilization of different appointment categories that promote role differentiation among members of faculty
  - less reliance on part-time faculty
  - continuously improving the processes of teaching and learning

## PURSUING NEW OPTIONS: AN OPEN UNIVERSITY FOR ONTARIO

- 1. A university with a distinctive philosophy
  - open admissions
  - flexible credit recognition
  - flexible use of resources and infrastructure to best meet the learner's needs
- 2. A formal relationship with Athabasca University?
- 3. Primary but not exclusive focus: online distance education

Benefits

- degree completion for graduates of the colleges
- degree completion for former students who dropped out
- education for learners who work full-time or do not live near a university

## PURSUING NEW OPTIONS:

## A COMPREHENSIVE APPROACH TO FUNDING

- 1. Governments and institutions need explicit discussion on rising per-student costs of higher education
  - agree on "cost to continue"
  - agree on additional costs for expanded enrolments, research and scholarship, other priorities
  - agree on sources of revenue (grants and tuition fees)
  - update student assistance programs every year to reflect inflation
  - benefit: end to processes that have tended to ignore inflation
- 2. Real incentives for teaching-focused shift in existing universities
- 3. Detailed public reporting on factors related to efficiency, effectiveness and quality
  - for example: compensation, teaching loads, class sizes, the use of temporary instructors

## **RESPONSES TO ACADEMIC TRANSFORMATION**

A range of reactions...

## MEDIA REACTIONS



### obsolete in crowded colleges

By Ian D. Clark professor in the School of Public Policy, Governance at the University of Toronto

Wed Dec 2 2009

The standard model of undergraduate education in Canada is no longer sustainable.



#### RELATED:

- Underfunding shortchanges students
- Traditional teaching model obsolete in crowded colleges

#### OPINION

### Underfunding shortchanges students

### By Mark Langer

### Wed Dec 2 2009

In the recently published book, Academic Transformation: The Forces Shaping Higher Education in Ontario , co-authored by Ian D. Clark, Greg Moran, Michael L. Skolnik and David Trick, the authors argue that the current model of university education in...

### THE GLOBE AND MAIL | EDITORIALS

Politics World Opinions

#### Globe editorial

National

Article

The book is thoughtful and well-

written. But the conclusion it

teaching is not enriched by

reaches, simply put, is wrong...

The authors assert that university

university professors conducting

original research in addition to

teaching. But their assertion is

Council of Ontario...University

depend on one another...So,

assertions, their model is not

quality education...It will give

education, a degree on the cheap.

students only a lower-cost

contrary to the authors'

research and university teaching

going to offer our students a better

belied by another publication from the Higher Education Quality

### The elusive ideal of the scholar-teacher



Comments (12)

Universities are oft

always to their ber

but it is long past t

undergraduates up

It is long past time to bring the quality of teaching offered to undergraduates up a notch

### THE GLOBE AND MAIL OPINIONS

 From Tuesday's Glob
 National
 Politics
 World
 Opinions
 Arts
 Tech

 Published on Monday,
 Last updated on Wed
 Margaret Wente
 Margaret Wente
 Margaret Wente

### Universities are sitting ducks for reform

According to one 2008 survey, Canadian faculty were the highest-paid among 15 countries studied.

Comments (224)

Column

Arts

Tech



#### Margaret Wente

Published on Tuesday, Apr. 13, 2010 5:00AM EDT Last updated on Tuesday, Apr. 13, 2010 5:28AM

hat is the most pressing problem facing Canadian universities today?

If you ask the professoriate, the answer is likely to be: massive underfunding, combined with creeping corporatization and growing threats to academic independence.

If you ask Dalton McGuinty, Ontario's Premier, the answer is: poor accountability, and not enough bang for the buck. Last week, he fired a warning shot, saying he plans to have "honest conversations" in the coming months about what universities and colleges can expect in return for the extra money they're getting to educate another 30,000 students. Translation: You folks are in the service business.

The trouble is that universities aren't set up for that. The principal job of today's university and college system is not to push forward the frontiers of knowledge, but to efficiently deliver mass undergraduate education to 30 or 40 per cent of the population.

Universities now do this job in the most expensive way possible, argues

Advertise Su Search Article

## MORE COMMENT

**UAAU** University Affairs Affaires universitaires

With the federal budget still in the news. Steve and Dianne have agreed to prepare opening remarks for next week's constituency roundtable organized by their local when the provincial minister assistant to the provincial minister

Advertise Suble topic is "How can we preserve high quality universities

ce to fiscal sustainability?" Steve and Di are to comment on

rance company in a division that has been through its

organization in three years. Dianne works with a team

ministry of health. Her group has been downsized as

alth care services under contract to the local integrated

laptops and send a joint e-mail to their two undergraduate

ir evening's research plan. They say they intend to use the

ternet to help them make judgements about the benefits of

ing on higher education and to assess whether universities

ch as other institutions to adapt to the changed economic

Steve will begin with Statistics Canada's complex but

ney learned at university to evaluate facts and arguments

Features UA Home > Columns & Opinions > A taxpayer view of university funding March 8, 2010 A taxpayer view of university funding Or, Steve and Di's evening on the Internet.

NEXT PAG

by lan D. Clark

It's budget season in Canada.

Search Articlemight be warranted.

shrunk.



OPTIMUM ONLINE

### ONTARIO HIGHER EDUCATION AS GOVERNANCE FAILURES

## Gilles Paquet UAAU University Affairs Affaires Universitaires

Features News

UA Home > Columns & Opinions > Improve the wheel, don't reinvent it

February 8, 2010

### **Columns & Opinions**

Blogs

### Introductio

When one exa stress, it is rar difficulties. Us to an array of way. Recogniz focus on probl punished. This scapegoat: it rather than on commissions d almost natura finger toward s those in charg

The Clark et. a Ontario has be state of affairs necessary aca naming name that has led to is not sustaina



People on the Move

Sign Up Now!

### Improve the wheel, don't reinvent it

Canada's universities should build on what they've already created.

by Roseann O'Reilly Runte

Current times of fiscal restraint call for creativity, increased cooperation and flexibility. Rather than build new institutions and establish hierarchies which stifle innovation, it is time for Ontario and Canada to seek ways to support existing institutions, to encourage them to create viable networks and to share ideas and talents in pursuit of the highest quality education possible.

The recently published book, Academic Transformation: The Forces Reshaping Higher Education, by Ian D. Clark, Greg Moran, Michael L. Skolnik and David Trick, offers research as well as commentary and conclusions. It sees underfunding of education as the root of most problems. The authors argue that Ontario's model for providing undergraduate education, the research-university model, is no longer sustainable. Among the proposed solutions are greater differentiation among existing universities and creating new institutions -



e-mail counselling implistic ch to the question. urance companies or ey are not there r applied research. costs, preserve ry can flourish. ssors have told freedom needs led if universities are of corporate agendas. the link to the Google ory of academic ing free access to ides.

olitical science and



#### ACADEMIC TRANSFORMATION CLARK, MORAN SKOLNIK and TRICK

David Trick and Associates, consultants in higher education strategy and management.

The large scale publicly funded system of postsecondary education in Ontario developed in the 1960s has been largely successful in fulfilling

important societal needs in the areas of education, human resource development, and research. Existing approaches, however, are unlikely to be sufficient to address the challenges of the coming decade. Academic Transformation: The Forces Reshaping Higher Education in Ontario examines the developments that are re-shaping the province's post-secondary system, including higher enrollment, further development of a knowledge-based economy, and ncreased demands for research focused on competitiveness and productivity. Universities and colleges are also adjusting to internal changes in the composition of the student body and staff, faculty work profiles, and funding arrangements. The authors suggest changes in the system's structure, policy, and

Ian D. Clark (id.clark@utoronto.ca), former federal deputy minister and president of the Council of Ontario Universities, is a professor in the School of Public Policy and Governance, University of Toronto. Greg Moran (gmoran2@uwo.ca), former Dean of Graduate Studies and Academic Vice-President, is a professor and member of both the clinical and developmental groups within the Department of Psychology, University of Western Ontario. Michael Skolnik (mskolnik@oise.utoronto.ca), former William G. Davis Chair in Community College Leadership in the University of Toronto, is professor emeritus in the Ontario Institute for Studies in Education, University of Toronto. David Trick

(david.trick@gmail.com), former Assistant Deputy Mininster of Postsecondary Education and founding CEO of Guelph-Humber, is president of

IAN D. CLARK





McGill-Queen's University Press www.mqup.ca

funding to respond to these developments.

#### Higher Education in the News

- » The Twilight of the Guilds? (Walter Russell Mead, The American Interest, 17 Feb 2010)
- » Mandelson says academics are 'set in aspic' (Guardian, 11 Feb 2010)
- » Squeeze Play 2010 (National Centre for Public Policy and Higher Education, Feb 2010)
- » Obama Calls for Cutting College Costs, Chronicle of Higher Education, 28 Jan 2010
- » Stop funding Mickey Mouse degrees, says top scientist (Guardian, 10 Feb 2010)
- » Recession Spurs Interest in Graduate, Law Schools, NYT, 9 Jan 2010
- » California Reeling, A Crown Jewel of Education Struggles With Cuts, NYT, 19 Nov 2009

#### Academic Tranformation Announcements

Baxter and McMillian paper on Need for Kesearch Universities       3/3/2010 6.56 FM <ul> <li>A taxpa;</li> <li>Y and Clark</li> <li>Enic Baxter and Charles McMillan have produced a working paper which makes the case for bold plan to create stronger research universities. A rod Version&gt; of the paper</li> <li>PowerPoint Presentations at University of Ottawa and at U of T</li> <li>1/4/2010 9:04 PM</li> <li>Consider Constraints</li> <li>A Review</li> <li>Possas</li> <li>A Review</li> <li>Possas</li> <li>Consider Constraints</li> <li>A more down of the case of the paper</li> <li>Consider Constraints</li> <li>A regit version&gt; of the slides used by lan Clark and Greg Moran on December 3 as part</li> <li>Tradition</li> <li>The elu</li> <li>Book ar</li> </ul>	Higher Education as Governance Failures (Gilles Paquet, Optimury er view of university funding (Ian D. Clark, University Affairs, Mar 8, 2 it he wheel, don't enivent if (Roseann Runte, University Affairs, Feb condary in perit: why higher ed in Ontario is stuck in the past (CACL w of Academic Transformation (Elizabeth Church, Adjunch Nation, N erations of policy issues for higher education rarely make compellin es. (Michael Ridley, ClO University of Guelph, Jan 4, 2010) comes to undergraduate education, we can do better (Globe and M nat teaching model obsolete in crowded colleges (Toronto Star. De	
Academic Transformation Calendar <ul> <li>Sustain</li> <li>3/3/2010 12:00 AM Meeting with Ontario Academic Vice Presedents</li> <li>Radical</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Radical</li> <li>How to Order</li> <li>How to Order from McGill-Queen's University Press</li> <li>Glendo</li> </ul> <ul> <li>Glendo</li> </ul>	In teaching include scholar-teaching in Cower Colleges (notion Stat, De sixe ideal of the scholar-teaching (Globe and Mail, Iead editorial, Dec gues Ontario university model unsustainable (Globe and Mail, Nov ng' universities proposed for Ontario (Western News) ability of Ontario's Model for Baccalaureate Education Questioned (i rethink of Ontario universities (University Affairs) s University System is Unsustainable, Says New Book (Chronical o n advisory committee member co-authors book on transforming act gining undergraduate education (Western News)	
How to Order from chapters.indigo.ca	New book proposes transforming the undergradute experience (Ylife)	
Author's and Publisher's Web Sites Subject	ary from the Authors and Colleagues	
Greg Morans web page at the University of vesterm Unitano     Michael Skolnik's web page at OISE/U of T     David Trick's web page on David Trick and Associates     Queen's School of Policy Studies New Books     The endu     HEQCO Research Publications     Would mm	igher Education as Governance Failures (Gilles Paquet) g differentiation in university missions in UOIT degree granting authority ring myth of the teaching-research relationship oving away from the model of the teacher-scholar lead to a reduction duate education?	
The Ontar	io Economic Statement underscores the need for system change	

#### Print

Pr	int and Web Commentary
⊳	Universities are sitting ducks for reform (Margaret Wente, Globe and Mail, April 13, 2010)
*	In tough financial times, how do we pay the bill for free inquiry? (Ian D. Clark, LRC review of Selling Out, April 1, 2010)
⋟	Ontario Higher Education as Governance Failures (Gilles Paquet, Optimum Online, March 2010)
≫	A taxpayer view of university funding (Ian D. Clark, University Affairs, Mar 8, 2010)
≫	Improve the wheel, don't reinvent it (Roseann Runte, University Affairs, Feb 8, 2010)
≫	Post-secondary in peril: why higher ed in Ontario is stuck in the past (CACUSS Reads, Feb 6, 2010)
⊳	A Review of Academic Transformation (Elizabeth Church, Adjunct Nation, Nov/Dec 2009)
*	Considerations of policy issues for higher education rarely make compelling and satisfying reads. This one does. (Michael Ridley, CIO University of Guelph, Jan 4, 2010)
⊳	When it comes to undergraduate education, we can do better (Globe and Mail Op Ed, Dec 10, 2009))
≫	Traditional teaching model obsolete in crowded colleges (Toronto Star, Dec 2, 2009)
≫	The elusive ideal of the scholar-teacher (Globe and Mail, lead editorial, Dec 1, 2009)
≫	Book argues Ontario university model unsustainable (Globe and Mail, Nov 30, 2009)
⋟	'Teaching' universities proposed for Ontario (Western News)
≫	Sustainability of Ontario's Model for Baccalaureate Education Questioned (Canada News Wire)
≫	Radical rethink of Ontario universities (University Affairs)
⋟	Ontario's University System Is Unsustainable, Says New Book (Chronical of Higher Education)
⋟	Glendon advisory committee member co-authors book on transforming academia (YFile)
≫	Redesigning undergraduate education (Western News)
≫	New book proposes transforming the undergradute experience (Ylife)
Co	mmentary from the Authors and Colleagues
8	bubject
C	Intario Higher Education as Governance Failures (Gilles Paquet)
F	romoting differentiation in university missions
E	irratum on UOIT degree granting authority
Т	he enduring myth of the teaching-research relationship
v	Vould moving away from the model of the teacher-scholar lead to a reduction in the quality of

Internet | Protected Mode: On

### Thank you.

### Keep in touch at:

### www.academictransformation.ca