

**Going Global: Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology, International  
Student Recruitment and the Export of Education**

**by**

**Adrienne Diane Galway**

**A thesis submitted in conformity with the requirements  
for the degree of Doctor of Philosophy.**

**Department of Theory and Policy Studies in Education  
Ontario Institute for Studies in Education of the  
University of Toronto**

**©Copyright by Adrienne Diane Galway 2000**



**National Library  
of Canada**

**Acquisitions and  
Bibliographic Services**

**395 Wellington Street  
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4  
Canada**

**Bibliothèque nationale  
du Canada**

**Acquisitions et  
services bibliographiques**

**395, rue Wellington  
Ottawa ON K1A 0N4  
Canada**

*Your file Votre référence*

*Our file Notre référence*

**The author has granted a non-exclusive licence allowing the National Library of Canada to reproduce, loan, distribute or sell copies of this thesis in microform, paper or electronic formats.**

**The author retains ownership of the copyright in this thesis. Neither the thesis nor substantial extracts from it may be printed or otherwise reproduced without the author's permission.**

**L'auteur a accordé une licence non exclusive permettant à la Bibliothèque nationale du Canada de reproduire, prêter, distribuer ou vendre des copies de cette thèse sous la forme de microfiche/film, de reproduction sur papier ou sur format électronique.**

**L'auteur conserve la propriété du droit d'auteur qui protège cette thèse. Ni la thèse ni des extraits substantiels de celle-ci ne doivent être imprimés ou autrement reproduits sans son autorisation.**

**0-612-50012-8**

**Canada**

**Going Global: The Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology,  
International Student Recruitment and the Export of Education**

**Doctor of Philosophy, 2000**

**Adrienne Diane Galway**

**Theory and Policy Studies in Education, Ontario Institute for Studies in  
Education of the University of Toronto**

**ABSTRACT**

The Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario (CAATs) are engaged in a wide range of international activities which have not previously been the subject of any in-depth study. This thesis provides the first comprehensive examination of the international student recruitment and educational export activities of the CAATs. This study, relying on literature reviews, a survey of the colleges and interviews with college administrators, explores the historical evolution of recruitment and export activities, the motivation behind participation in these activities and the financial implications of export and recruitment. The study also reviews some of the linkages between international student recruitment and export and internationalization and globalization.

The findings of the study reveal that the international activities of the CAATs had very modest beginnings, with colleges being involved in one or two small international development projects funded by the Canadian International Development Agency. These development projects have evolved towards privately funded and secured contracts. Many of the CAATs have experienced significant

growth in their international activities and are now very active participants in the international education market. Though the colleges tend to have projects and recruit students from all over the world, much of the recruitment and export activity is focussed in the Asia-Pacific region. The study revealed that the colleges are motivated to participate in these activities by the potential for financial gains and by the opportunities for personal enrichment and intellectual growth that these activities present to students, faculty and staff.

The study also reveals that the colleges are not experiencing the high levels of financial success that they desire. The colleges are confronted by several issues which have had an effect on their international activities. These issues include the need for better marketing strategies, a lack of funds for generating international business and a relatively low international profile. Many of these issues cannot be solved by the individual colleges, and there is an obvious need for more co-operation between colleges, increased support from both levels of government and the development of an overall international marketing strategy for the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario.



## **ACKNOWLEDGEMENTS**

I would first like to thank my supervisor Professor Michael Skolnik for his kind guidance, wisdom and support for this project. I am also grateful for the support and advice of my committee members: Dr. Michael Hatton, Dr. Charles Pascal and Dr. Daniel Lang.

Without the cooperation of the international office staff and presidents of the CAATs this study would not have been possible. I deeply appreciate their participation in this study and the generous contribution of their time. I would like to give special acknowledgement to Dr. Robert Gordon whose support for this study was instrumental during the data collection process.

Thank you to my friends and colleagues who made my graduate school experience so fulfilling. Thank you Dr. Marianne Fedunkiw for your advice, support and friendship.

I owe a special debt of gratitude to my parents, Zina and Michael, and my sisters Gina and Elizabeth, without whose love, support and patience, I would not have been able to complete this project.

Finally, thank you to my technical advisor, editor and best friend Kevin Howey. Your patience, love, support and confidence in me carried me through. Thank you.

## **TABLE OF CONTENTS**

<b>CHAPTER I - OVERVIEW OF STUDY</b>	<b>1</b>
Introduction	1
Objectives of the Thesis	4
The CAATs and International Student Recruitment and Export	6
Central Research Questions of the Thesis	7
Contribution to Knowledge	8
Limitations of Study	10
<b>CHAPTER II -LITERATURE REVIEW</b>	<b>12</b>
Introduction	12
Definitions, Justification And Rationale	13
Globalization Literature	30
General Literature On The Community College	39
Public Documents	43
Conclusion	56
<b>CHAPTER III – RESEARCH METHOD OF STUDY AND SURVEY RESULTS</b>	<b>58</b>
Research Method	58
Survey Results	67
<b>SECTION 1: General Information Regarding the International Education Office</b>	<b>68</b>
<b>SECTION 2: International Student Recruitment</b>	<b>72</b>

Organization of International Student Recruitment	72
Historical Evolution of Recruitment and Motivation to Recruit and Enroll International Students	73
Recruitment Strategies and Enrollment Information	77
<b>SECTION 3: Educational Export</b>	82
Organization of Educational Export	82
Evolution of Educational Export at the CAATs	84
Financial Implications of Educational Export and International Student Recruitment	91
<b>SECTION 4: Educational Export Projects</b>	94
<b>SECTION 5: Respondents' Identification Of Major Issues In International Student Recruitment And Educational Export</b>	96
<b>Data Tables</b>	100
<b>CHAPTER IV - INTERVIEW FINDINGS</b>	114
Introduction	114
<b>SECTION 1: Historical Evolution of Export and Recruitment</b>	116
<b>SECTION 2: Motivation to Participate in International Activities</b>	120
Positive Impacts of International Activities	120
Financial Motivation to Participate in International Activities	124
Negative Impacts of International Activities	128
<b>SECTION 3: Competition and Coordination among the CAATs and the Role of Government, ACCC and CBIE in College International Activities</b>	130
Colleges Acting as Businesses	130

Role of the Federal and Provincial Government in International Activities	134
The Role of ACCC and CBIE in International Activities	140
<b>SECTION 4: Organization of International Activities</b>	<b>148</b>
Reporting Structure of the International Office	148
Faculty and Staff Participation in International Activities	151
Recruitment and Export Methods	156
<b>SECTION 5: Financial Aspects of Recruitment and Export</b>	<b>158</b>
Funding of the International Office	158
Financial Goals of International Activities	160
Cost of International Activities	163
Financial trends	165
<b>SECTION 6: Issues Affecting Recruitment and Export</b>	<b>167</b>
Degree versus Diploma	167
Human Rights and Colonization	170
<b>SECTION 7: Future Trends in Educational Export and Student Recruitment</b>	<b>177</b>
 <b>CHAPTER V - DISCUSSION and RECOMMENDATIONS</b>	 <b>182</b>
Introduction	182
<b>CENTRAL RESEARCH QUESTIONS:</b>	<b>182</b>
How did international student recruitment and international export evolve at the colleges?	182

Why are colleges engaged in international student recruitment and international educational export? How does visa student recruitment and international export of education fit within the mission and mandate of the college? What does the college hope to achieve by participating in these activities? What goals do the colleges have for these international activities?	185
What is the total revenue from educational export contracts? What are the financial expectations of educational export projects? Who pays the salary and coordinates the release time for faculty engaged in educational export activities? How are the operating costs of the international activities covered?	193
How does the college recruit visa students and secure educational export contracts? What does the organizational structure for visa student recruitment and international export look like? What types of projects and activities in visa student recruitment and international export are the colleges presently engaged in?	195
What are the trends in visa student recruitment and educational export? What are the major issues that the colleges are facing in educational export and visa student recruitment?	201
Recommendations	209
Conclusion	214
<b>REFERENCES</b>	<b>217</b>
<b>APPENDICES</b>	<b>224</b>
Appendix A - Mail-Out Survey	224
Appendix B - Accompanying Letter	234
Appendix C - Interview Schedule - International Office Chairpersons	236
Appendix D - Interview Schedule - College Presidents	238
Appendix E - Interview Schedule - ACCC	240
Appendix F - Interview Schedule - CBIE	242

<b>Appendix G - Consent Form - Other Interviewees</b>	<b>244</b>
<b>Appendix H - Consent Form - Presidents and International Office Chairs</b>	<b>245</b>

## **CHAPTER I - OVERVIEW OF STUDY**

### **INTRODUCTION**

The “internationalization of the campus” is a phrase that has become part of the vocabulary of many of those involved in postsecondary education. Educators are aware of the importance of giving students a global perspective, and preparing them to work and live in a global economy. Internationalizing the campus has also been linked to the Canadian economy as governments seek to include education as part of their foreign trade and international relations policy. This thesis examines two aspects of internationalization at Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology: international student recruitment; and the international export of education.

By the mid-1950s in Ontario, it had become obvious that the educational system needed to be reformed in order to deal with some of the significant demographic and economic conditions facing the province. These conditions included: a large number of students approaching high school age, rapidly changing technologies, and a shortage of trained workers for highly skilled jobs. The university was viewed as inappropriate to deal with these problems, at least exclusively, both because of the inherent character of the university and because of the expense involved in using the university to deal with such demands. The government clearly had to deal with the rapidly changing conditions, and thus it initiated a

series of commissions and studies into the future of education in the province. The culmination of these studies was that on May 21, 1965, the Minister of Education, The Honourable William Davis, introduced legislation for the establishment of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. In his speech to the legislature Minister Davis stated that:

In this new age of technological change and invention, it is essential to the continued growth and expansion of the economy of our Province, and of our nation, that adequate facilities be made generally available for the education and training of craftsmen, technicians and technologists . . . to achieve our goals...we must invest not only in buildings and machines; we must also invest rising amounts in research, and in the education and training of our youth. The value of our natural wealth is great, but in the present-day world, there are even greater riches in the knowledge and skills of men (Ontario, Legislative Assembly, Debates, 27th leg., 3rd sess., 21 May, 1965, pp. 5-6).

The importance of economics in the establishment of the CAATs cannot be over emphasized. The colleges were established as an arm of the Ontario Ministry of Education, and as an economic development tool for the province. Dennison and Gallagher (1989) emphasize the importance of economics in the original mandate of the CAATs:

From the beginning, the general mandate of the colleges was clear, the preparation of individuals to enter the workforce, with training of both quality and relevance, to contribute to the economic progress of the province(p. 95).

One of the major motives for establishing the CAATs was to boost the quality of the workforce in the province, with the hope that this would in turn have a positive impact on the province's economy.



Over thirty years ago, when the CAATs were established, the concept of the internationalization of the campus was relatively unknown. However, as Ontario became an increasingly multicultural society, and the importance of global interdependence and the global economy emerged, the CAATs recognized the need to educate their students in a way that would prepare them to function in this "new" interdependent world. Students must be prepared to work in an increasingly global marketplace and most educational institutions in Ontario have undertaken a process of internationalization. For the purposes of this thesis, internationalization will be defined as **the specific activities undertaken by an institution of higher education in order to fulfill the specific goal of increasing the international dimension of the institution and/or generating revenue.** This definition is most appropriate for this thesis as it reflects the idea that the institution makes a conscious decision to incorporate more international perspectives, and does so by undertaking specific activities which contribute to the mandate of increasing the international dimension of the institution.

The Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology have dealt with this responsibility to internationalize their institutions in a number of ways. They have instituted curricular reforms in order to include more international perspectives in the curriculum, institutions have introduced student and faculty exchange programs so that members of the institution can gain international experience, and study and work placement abroad and twinning programs with foreign institutions have been

instituted. There are efforts to include more language courses, international businesses courses, “world study” programs and cross-cultural training in the curriculum. In addition, many colleges have recruited international students, and engaged in educational export projects, two internationalization activities with the potential to generate revenue for the CAAT.

## **OBJECTIVES OF THE THESIS**

The objective of this thesis is to explore the reasons for the CAATs involvement in international activities, determine and document the nature and extent of their international student recruitment and educational export activities, the way they are going about these activities, and the issues which they are facing in carrying out these activities.

**International Recruitment of Students** refers to the activities that the colleges undertake to bring international students (those students without resident status in Canada) into their **regular** college programs, as opposed to programs designed and offered specifically for foreign students. International students pay international student fees which are substantially higher than the fees paid by Canadian, or landed immigrant students.

**International Export of Education:** refers to the education and training programs that colleges sell to foreign markets. These programs can include new programs

such as teaching English to a group of students who come to the Ontario college from their home country for a specified length of time and take the course together as a cohort, or a program in the students' own country where an instructor from the Ontario college travels to them. International Export also includes consulting, technical and advisory services provided by the college, often in the areas of program and curriculum design.

I will examine the question of whether or not international student recruitment and educational export can be usefully viewed as a manifestation of the phenomenon which has been called the **commoditisation of education**. The commoditisation of education is the process of turning education into an article of trade. Education is converted from a local initiative to educate the citizens of a particular nation, and packaged and marketed so it can be sold for profit in other markets.

International student recruitment and educational export have not only emerged as a means of internationalizing the colleges, but have also provided colleges with a means of coping with the other major challenge they face, the drastic decrease in government funding. Between 1992/93 and 1997/98, provincial funding for operating expenses of postsecondary education in Ontario decreased by 17.3%. In 1987-88, operating revenue at the CAATs per provincially funded full time equivalent student was \$8,454, by 1996-97 this amount had decreased to \$6,764.<sup>1</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> Ontario Universities - 1998 Resource Document, Tables 2.8, 3.1. Council of Ontario Universities, 1999.

The growing crisis in funding cutbacks has forced the colleges to find other sources of revenue. International recruitment of students and educational export are two potential revenue sources.

## **THE CAATS AND INTERNATIONAL STUDENT RECRUITMENT AND EXPORT**

There are a number of reasons why the CAATs consider themselves well positioned to be offering training and education to foreign students. These reasons include the fact that the colleges were designed with the “human capital” model in mind. The idea in Ontario was to boost the educational and training level of the workforce in order to boost economic productivity, and the colleges continue to be successful at fulfilling this mandate. The colleges offer education and training in areas in which most foreign countries are interested. Often foreign purchasers are not interested in purchasing university education, what they are looking for is specific skills training. The colleges can train the mid-level technicians that developing economies need, and can provide highly skilled training that may not be available elsewhere. Community colleges are well prepared to handle a wide range of students and the community college concept is based on adaptability and responsiveness.

## **CENTRAL RESEARCH QUESTIONS OF THE THESIS**

This thesis seeks to answer the following research questions:

1. How did international student recruitment and international export evolve at the colleges?
2. Why are colleges engaged in international student recruitment and international educational export? How does international student recruitment and international export of education fit within the mission and mandate of the college? What does the college hope achieve by participating in these activities? What goals do the colleges have for these international activities?
3. What is the total revenue from educational export contracts? What are the financial expectations of educational export projects? Who pays the salary and coordinates the release time for faculty engaged in educational export activities? How are the operating costs of the international activities covered?
4. How does the college recruit visa students and secure educational export contracts? What does the organizational structure for international student recruitment and international export look like? What types of projects and activities in international student recruitment and international export are the college presently engaged in?

5. What are the major trends in international student recruitment and educational export? What are the major issues the colleges are facing in educational export and international student recruitment.

The thesis outlines the current international programmes of the CAATs, traces the evolution of the international export of education and international student recruitment at the CAATs, and projects where these international activities are headed. The thesis sought to document how international student recruitment and educational export are perceived by college administrators, the organizational structure for international student recruitment and educational export at the colleges, and the financial impact of these programmes upon the colleges. In addition, the study delineated some of the major issues in the area of international export of education and international student recruitment. This thesis described what is happening in the CAATs in the mid-1990s in the areas of international student recruitment and international export of training and education programmes.

## **CONTRIBUTION TO KNOWLEDGE**

The Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology are an excellent subject for an investigation into international education, as most of the colleges in the province are involved to some degree with the internationalization process. Colleges are also

free of the historical and philosophical traditions of the universities that have resulted in a different attitude towards international education. Universities have always been international in their orientation. They are integrated into worldwide research networks, there has always been substantial student movement across national borders, and universities have traditionally emphasized the free sharing of knowledge and mutual learning exchanges. Universities in the present era are also looking upon international activities as a source of potential revenues.

The colleges are essentially arms of the provincial government with the specific mandate of supplying training and education to local students. However, the CAATs have displayed a growing involvement in international education and it is precisely the nature of this involvement which will be the subject of the thesis. Indeed, it is of interest that institutions whose formal mandate emphasizes local responsibility have come to play a significant global role.

As outlined in Chapter Two of the thesis, the current literature on international education is predominantly American, and mainly concerned with the "internationalization" of home educational institutions. The literature regarding overseas revenue generating projects is quite scant. This thesis brings a Canadian perspective to the literature, and paints a picture of how educational export and international student recruitment have evolved at the colleges, what is happening in the late 1990s, and where educational export and international student recruitment

is heading. Interviews with key administrators in the colleges bring their perspectives to the literature, while at the same time answering questions about emerging issues that are neglected in the current body of literature.

## **LIMITATIONS OF STUDY**

The thesis focuses on the Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. While a Canada wide study would be interesting and useful, it is too broad and varied an undertaking for a detailed study of the type undertaken for this Ph.D. thesis. The fact that this is a provincial study as opposed to a national study might be viewed by some as a limitation. However, since community college systems in Canada differ substantially from one province to another, there are some advantages to doing a provincial rather than a national study. Given the size of the Ontario college system, it is worthy of a study in and of itself. This study could, however, act as a precursor for other provincial studies in the future.

One limitation of this study is that it does not examine the impact of international student recruitment and educational export on the "purchaser." Research into this area would require a very large, longitudinal study that measures the impact of international study and educational export on the CAATs' foreign partners and clientele. Such a study is outside the bounds of this thesis. A second limitation of the study is that it looks at only two aspects of internationalization, student



recruitment and educational export. This thesis does not examine other types of internationalization on the campus such as curricular reform, faculty exchanges or work abroad programs. Only the two internationalization activities with the potential to generate revenue for the college are examined in this study. The results of the study rely on the survey and interviews. Despite the fact that survey respondents were asked to include a number of documents regarding international activities at their college, very few respondents did so. Phone calls to encourage the submission of these documents revealed that many colleges did not have the type of documents that I requested. Thus, document analysis was a very limited research methodology for this study.

## **CHAPTER II - LITERATURE REVIEW**

### **INTRODUCTION**

When situating this thesis within a particular body of literature, several decisions had to be made. First, to which body of literature is this thesis contributing: the body of literature regarding community colleges and their functions and attributes; the literature on trade and export products; the literature on globalization, or the literature regarding the internationalization of education? In some ways the thesis makes a contribution to all these areas. It is, however, the body of literature on the internationalization of education to which this thesis is most closely aligned.

While the international export of education and the recruitment of foreign students is a growing function of the community college, and education is receiving increasing recognition as an export commodity, these activities are really part of a growing trend of internationalism in education. As such, the literature on international education is very important to the topic of export and recruitment. It is also important to note, however, that foreign student recruitment and educational export have received almost no attention in the literature regarding the Canadian community college sector, despite their growing importance to the colleges. A review of the major literature regarding the history, organization and functions of Ontario colleges reveals almost no mention of international export and foreign

student recruitment. The glaring absence of any mention of these important and rapidly increasing activities reveals the need for research in this area.

The international education literature to which this thesis contributes can be divided into three major areas/themes. The first area is concerned with the justification and rationale for internationalization. The second major area in the literature examines how to internationalize the campus, and the third area in the internationalization literature describes various internationalization activities.

### **INTERNATIONALIZATION - DEFINITIONS, JUSTIFICATION AND RATIONALE**

As this section reveals, the literature contains a multitude of definitions of the terms "internationalization of education," and "international education." Internationalization of higher education is at times described as the process of incorporating international perspectives and activities into every aspect of a college or university, and at other times refers to the specific international activities in which an institution is engaged. In other instances, internationalization of higher education is defined as the complete reorientation of an institution's philosophy and mission in order to facilitate greater understanding between cultures and nations. International education is a related term that also has a number of different meanings. In some instances international education is seen as a philosophy and a mind set which seeks world peace and cooperation as its final goal:

In essence, international education is holistic, nurturing respect for the concept of interdependence and for the global community of human kind. In other words the whole is more important than the details, the whole becomes almost a prerequisite for the details (Calleja, 1995, p. 41).

In other definitions, international education is regarded as a practical, market oriented approach to education which seeks as its final goal to prepare students and the nation to participate in the global marketplace:

...given the world's increasing multipolarity and the interdependence, internationalism is now key to any country's scientific, technological and economic competitiveness. Canada's universities must become bastions of internationalism if Canada is to improve or even maintain its position in a variety of sectors through the 1990s...Internationalization will be the measure of quality of universities in the 1990s (Knight, 1994, p. 1).

A third definition of international education focuses on the direct economic benefits of international education for the institution and the country. This view of international education is best defined as education as an export commodity. Jim Fox, past president of the Canadian Bureau of International Education put it quite succinctly when he stated:

Education is trade. For Canada, educational trade amounts to \$1.5 billion. This relates to international students in this country alone. In terms of selling Canadian expertise and education and training abroad, we are earning more than \$1 billion in foreign exchange per year for this country. That adds up to \$2.5 billion. Education, in fact, ranks as an export that is next to wheat in its importance to this country. Yet, this is not being recognized and we are not beginning to realize our market potential (quoted in Holmes, 1996, p. 10).

International education is also defined as the specific activities that an educational institution undertakes in order to "internationalize" the institution:

International Education is a collective term that includes all academic related activities of an international nature that occur within and outside Canada and which affect students, faculty and administrators. Included are the recruitment and service to international (visa) students, contracted educational services, distance education, joint ventures, twinning, travel study, study abroad, work abroad, student exchanges, faculty exchanges and internationalizing the curriculum (Dodds and McNeil, 1994, p. 1).

The variety of definitions of international education and the internationalization of education can be quite confusing. Often, a combination of these definitions is necessary to capture how a particular institution conceives of internationalization and international education. Aspects of all of the definitions are often present at the same time. An institution may choose to broaden its international horizons by engaging in specific international activities while at the same time attempting to infuse international perspectives throughout the institution. An institution may view international education both as a money making venture as well as a "curricular philosophy."

There are several major justifications for internationalization that appear in the literature. In the introduction to Barbara Burns' book Expanding the International Dimension of Higher Education, Clark Kerr states that:

There is much more involved in international education than the national interest alone. Modern men and women need to be aware of their place and potential in the context of an international environment. This awareness is as essential as the continuing need for awareness of our place and progress in the context of history and of our limitations and possibilities in the context of the laws of basic science. The time long ago arrived for Americans to develop an awareness of international perspectives through the infusion of these perspectives into the curriculum and their systematic study by scholars. As we respond to the potentials of such development, the benefits will transcend the interests of both individuals and our nation. We shall also

contribute to an expansion of the culture and thought and knowledge of men and women in these increasingly international times (Burns, 1980, p. xxxviii).

The view that internationalized education is necessary to prepare students for an interdependent world is put forward by many authors including: O'Banion (1992), Gleazer (1978), and Shannon (1978). In his book, A Survey of International/Intercultural Education in 2-Year Colleges: 1976, William Shannon argues that there is a need to internationalize education in order to prepare students to function in the world:

[students] increasingly need an international education to understand and cope with local and national contemporary problems. Many of the fundamental problems of the Tucson Community, e.g. energy , inflation, drugs, undocumented aliens and crime are also international problems. It is imperative that Tucsonans be informed about international events and relations so they can intelligently determine their personal responses to these problems as well as respond intelligently to public policies proposed by their local and national leaders. In an interdependent world, an international education is a necessary component in and education for basic citizenship (Shannon, 1978,. p. 280)

The idea that international education is needed in order to produce individuals who can cope in an increasingly interdependent world is echoed by such authors as Maxwell King and Albert Koller who in 1995 wrote that:

As we move into the future, community colleges will play an increasing role in bringing to our citizens, businesses, government, industry, and ourselves the opportunity to assist in shaping the world in which we live. Every community college can serve the broader interests of their community by becoming a true citizen of the world (King and Koller, 1995, p. 25).

Other authors who have extolled the importance of internationalizing education in order to produce students who will become competent, informed citizens of the

world community include Fersh and Fitchen (1981), and Raby and Tarrow (1996). The publications of such organizations as the United Nations, Community Colleges for International Development and the Canadian Bureau for International Education, also reflect the view that the internationalization of education is a means of producing students who can be citizens of the world. Some of the literature on the internationalization of education makes note of the importance of an internationalized curriculum for military and security purposes. The "know thy enemy" philosophy emphasizes how studying the "potential enemy" can help contribute to national security. David Scanlon argues that internationalization is a pragmatic tool necessary for ensuring national security, for stabilizing an inefficient economy and for building world peace (Scanlon, 1990, p.14-15) Earl Backman, in the introduction to Approaches to International Education, a publication of the American Council on Education, argues that international education is mandatory in order to avoid armed conflict. Backman states that:

Today when a military command can trigger the destruction of our entire civilization and when both local and national decisions have a strong impact on the world beyond our own boundaries, it is imperative that the public better understand what values and what human necessities are at stake in our foreign relations and in our international conduct (Backman, 1984, p. xiv).

This view of international education as a tool for national security is also apparent in the writings of Maxwell King. In his writing, King extols the virtues of international education for fostering economic competitiveness and opening students' minds to other cultures, and he also notes the importance of international education for fostering world peace:

Paramount among reasons (for international education) was that no one can be isolated in the world today, and the better we come to understand people in other countries, and the more friendships we make, the less likely that we will be pointing guns at each other in the future (King, 1981, p. 13).

International education for world peace and national security is promoted by many other authors including Fersh (1990), and Greene (1990).

The importance of international education to economic competitiveness and success is stressed not only by Maxwell King, but by many other authors including William Shannon, who in his review of international education in 2 year colleges stated that:

Tucsonans will increasingly need an international education to compete and function in jobs because local business is often transacted in an international market, many local businessmen need to be knowledgeable about international marketing opportunities, numerous Tucson businesses are multinational, all local businessmen are directly or indirectly affected by decisions of multinational corporations, international policy-making organizations and by international events (Shannon, 1976, p. 280).

The importance of international education to the economic well being of the nation has also been noted by Canadian authors:

Global boundaries are becoming increasingly porous. The future of British Columbia, therefore, depends on how competitive we are in the world economy and on the strength of our global literacy in international discourse. Virtually all areas of activity require effective communication with other cultures and global awareness skills. Hence, the education system plays a critical role in the preparation of British Columbians for productive living and working in an increasingly diverse world (Francis, 1992, p. 2).

The emphasis in the literature on international education on economic competitiveness/survival is not limited to the importance of international education for the national interest (Harari, 1992), (Scanlon, 1990). Several authors note the



importance of international education to the economic survival of postsecondary educational institutions themselves.

In their article "From Aid to Trade," (1996), Daniel Schugurensky and Kathy Higgins point out how the internationalization of education has moved away from projects that involved postsecondary institutions providing aid projects to developing countries, and towards postsecondary institutions selling their services to foreign markets. Schugurensky and Higgins (1996) examine the growing importance of revenue generating international programs to the Canadian higher education sector and lament the shift away from helping the less fortunate of the world, towards the selling of education to those countries which can afford to pay. In a 1998 speech at the Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario Annual Conference, Huguette Labelle, then President, Canadian International Development Agency, stressed the humanitarian side of international activities. Benefits from international activities accrue not only to the Ontario college which supplies the training or educational program, but to the developing countries which receive these programs. Projects that provide human resource development and training activities to developing nations are much more than business ventures for the colleges, they are vital to improving economic and social conditions in the developing world. Labelle urges colleges to take all the benefits, not just the financial ones, into consideration when engaging in international projects:

The global marketplace provides a unique opportunity for Canadian community colleges. It's a business opportunity, yes, but it's much more than that. It's also an opportunity to spread your wings and exercise your community vocation on a wider scale. As community colleges, you provide a bridge to the future, linking both generations and knowledge. On the world stage, you can also build a bridge to the future, one that links nations and peoples along with generation and knowledge (Labelle, 1998).

Labelle clearly envisions international activities as having a purpose beyond the mere generation of revenue for the colleges. Labelle is not supporting internationalization solely as a mechanism for institutions to make a profit.

Internationalization for institutional profit is also noted by Raby and Tarrow, (1996), who are concerned by what they see to be the hidden agenda of international development projects which are not so much exercises in international aid, as money producing ventures for the "donor" institutions. Leginsky and Andrews (1994) note that there is a growing debate within the college sector regarding the appropriateness of colleges engaging in for-profit international activities:

It has been pointed out, by Smyth and others, that educational institutions seem to be caught between two philosophical platforms: the desire for monetary profit and the wish to share Canadian expertise and opportunity. On the one hand, the pressure is growing for educational institutions to be cost-effective, to reduce expenses and to generate income. To this end, some IE projects are designed to profit the sponsoring institution as it enters the "business" of education. On the other hand, many professional educators maintain that the purpose of their institution is to altruistically provide for teaching and learning. To this end, some IE projects are intended as humanitarian gestures - a sharing of the wealth for an improvement in the human condition. Some may argue that the best possible situation would be a combination of these two purposes. As a business, IE must adhere to the principles and practices of business administration. These are often vastly different from those of educational administration. However, with increasing frequency, the financial aspects of education lead educational administrators to consider the economic development impact of IE (Leginsky and Andrews, 1994, p. 2).

Not all authors have such a dim view of postsecondary institutions engaging in revenue generating international activities. In their description of the international role of the Association of Canadian Community Colleges (ACCC), Harper and Finley (1990), argue that the Canadian colleges have a very important role to play in the international arena that is beneficial not only to the foreign country, but to Canada and the local college as well:

In the international sphere, the Association specializes in the overseas transfer of technical, professional and vocational skills and the export of educational consultancy and management services, through cooperative projects and institutional linkages that draw on the resources and capabilities of ACCC's member colleges. ACCC's international activities are designed to be flexible, culturally sensitive and mutually beneficial, and are based on the philosophy that human resource development is fundamental to any nation's progress and eventual self-sufficiency, and that Canada's colleges have the experience, expertise and entrepreneurial spirit to assist other countries in their development objectives. ACCC is supported in its international efforts by the Government of Canada, the Canadian International Development Agency, the World Bank and other international and regional banks, the Commonwealth Foundation, client governments and their agencies and other non-governmental organizations (Harper and Finley, 1990, p. 144).

Authors such as: Hatton (1995), Holmes (1996), and Knowles (1995), explore the importance of these revenue generating activities for the college sector. Hatton (1995) not only promotes the idea of community colleges engaging in revenue generating international activities, he presents a number of suggestions on how colleges can go about securing a foothold in the international market. Arthur (1994-95), like Hatton, recognizes that postsecondary institutions need to develop a

strategy and a plan in order to successfully compete in the international education market:

International training is an integral part of the mission, mandate and objectives of most colleges across Canada. However, as interest in international markets continues to grow, colleges need to examine some of the realities of doing business internationally. One current reality is the reduction of government aid available to support international training programs. As a result, colleges must develop effective strategies to market their services and products (Arthur, 1994-95, p. 9).

Like Hatton, Holmes and Arthur, Knowles (1995), notes that international export activities can be an important and needed source of revenue:

In some colleges, international education is a highly lucrative business. It is not uncommon for the revenue from international education activities to represent between 10 per cent and 20 per cent of the entire college budget. Revenue from the participation of foreign students in college programs represents the largest portion of international education activity. Additionally, colleges benefit from the professional development opportunities for faculty and students who participate in international exchanges. They also gain from the value-added quality of their educational programs when their curricula become more internationalized and, hence, more marketable (Knowles, 1995, p. 196).

As Holmes (1996) notes, the sale of Canadian educational products to international markets is an increasingly important facet of Canadian trade. In 1983, Goodwin and Nacht made a similar observation about American involvement in international education:

Others (Goodwin and Nacht, 1983, p. 14) observe that higher education is one of the few export industries left to the United States that commands international respect and shows significant growth potential (Greene, 1990, p. 64).

Other authors have noted that revenue generating international activities can bring more than mere financial benefits to the college/university and can help to

internationalize the curriculum, provide international experiences for students and faculty, give faculty opportunity to improve their course materials, as well as numerous other benefits Hatton (1995), Holmes (1996), Leginsky and Andrews (1994). However, authors such as Jane Knight (1997) express concern that using international activities to generate revenue may overshadow what should be their primary function, the internationalization of the postsecondary institution:

At the institutional level, the economic motive or market orientation is becoming more prevalent as well. A rigorous debate is now under way as to whether the export of education products to international markets is in fact contributing to the international dimension of teaching, research and service. Clearly, there can be a direct and beneficial relationship between an international market orientation and the internationalization of the primary functions of a university/college or institute. However, the key phrase is 'can be' which implies that this is not always the case. If one is to ensure that improving the quality of higher education is the primary goal of internationalization, not the development of international export markets, it is essential to find the balance between income-generating motives and academic benefits. Is the benefit of increased funding for international initiatives (given that a portion of the income earned is invested in other internationalization activities) sufficient to describe a commercial international education activity as contributing to the international dimension of scholarship and research? Or are there other factors to be considered? How do we differentiate an international export/trade activity which does not make a significant contribution to the international dimension of the exporting institution from those international activities which are income generating and also have a positive impact on the teaching, research, and service functions of the institution? (Knight, 1997, p. 6).

The concerns expressed by Daniel Schugurensky and Kathy Higgins (1996), Jane Knight (1997), and Leginsky and Andrews (1994), are further illuminated by Fidelis Njide Ubadigbo (1997), who expresses grave concern over what he sees as a dangerous trend in international student enrollments in the United States. Ubadigbo points out that university and college recruiters are targeting countries

where there are students who can afford to pay high international student fees. As a result, students from poor countries are being ignored:

This dramatic variation in student enrollment from certain regions into United States institutions of higher learning will affect global education and development. Regions of Africa and Latin America with sharp decline in enrollment, will witness low quality education, limited transfer of modern technology, less economic development, decreased literacy rates, and low standards of living. In regions of Asia, Europe, and North America, life will be different. Community colleges with their open door policy and quality education system, will make a difference if they recruit students from regions of the world with declining enrollment (Ubadigbo, 1997, p. 5).

Though the literature pays a significant amount of attention to the tension between revenue generating and non-revenue generating international activities, a recent study by Jane Knight (1997) reveals that universities and colleges in Canada do not consider money making international activities to be a particularly important priority for internationalization. In fact, in her survey of the rationale for internationalization, Knight found that the education sector ranked educational export eighth out of ten priorities for internationalization. Knight further found that:

According to the overall ranking of reasons to internationalize, income generation at the individual education institution level ranked ninth out of ten. However, given the new emphasis on the promotion and export of Canadian education products and services by the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade and several provincial governments, it is not too surprising that the government sector has ranked this reason slightly higher than the other two sectors (Knight, 1997, p. 31).

The apparent indifference to money making activities revealed in Knight's study appears to be at odds with what seems to be a rapidly growing involvement of colleges in international revenue generating activities. Given the growing number

of international education consortiums and a growing body of literature on developing international revenue generating activities, it appears that Knight's conclusion regarding the education sector's indifference to money making activities may not be correct. In addition, authors such as Daniel Schugurensky and Kathy Higgins (1996), and Leginsky and Andrews (1994) point out that in many institutions, disagreements over the appropriateness of the institution participating in money making activities have caused tensions to arise. Apparently there is a great difference of opinion regarding whether or not colleges should be involved in international revenue generating activities!

The articles by Hatton (1995), Holmes (1996), Leginsky and Andrews (1994) and others, have dealt with how colleges and universities can go about establishing revenue generating international activities. There is, however, a much larger body of literature regarding general ways in which a postsecondary institution can internationalize. Many of these articles include foreign student recruitment and international educational export as just a couple of activities in a 'laundry list' of techniques for internationalization. Authors such as Barbara Burn (1980) stress the importance of having an integrated plan for internationalization at the postsecondary institution. She cautions against a series of haphazardly organized "international" activities, and advocates that the institution must have a central commitment to internationalization to which their international activities contribute. Like Burn, Jane Knight (1994) advocates a process approach to internationalization

which brings international perspectives into every aspect of the postsecondary institution. Knight argues that internationalization must not be an "add on," but

must be entrenched in the culture, policy, planning and organizational processes of the institution so that it is not treated, nor does it become, a passing fad (Knight, 1994, p. 5).

Knight emphasizes the link between organizational factors and internationalization. She stresses the importance of including internationalization in institutional mission statements, the commitment and support of senior administrators, an international office or position with experienced personnel, an annual review, systematic planning, multi-year plans, fundraising, faculty recognition and rewards, support of senate and board of governors, funds for faculty and curriculum development and the setting of annual goals and objectives, to the success of an internationalization effort.

The view that internationalization must be more than a series of haphazard activities but a committed, organized institutional effort (Raby and Tarrow 1996; Backman, 1984; Emerson and Newsom, 1995), is most clearly articulated by Greenfield (1990) when he lists what he sees as the most important factors in a college's internationalization process:

For any community college or district to have a viable and effective international education program, regardless of affiliation with a consortium it needs the following:

1. A strong commitment by the president and key academic leaders and interested faculty
2. A commitment from the board of trustees via a supportive policy statement



3. Inclusion of international education in the mission-and-goals statement of the college
4. A process for ongoing involvement of interested faculty and staff
5. An adequate structure to administer or coordinate programs and resources with qualified, knowledgeable personnel. A full-time director of international education, or at least a faculty member with substantial released time, a clearly visible office, and clerical support are absolutely necessary, as are funds for publicity, program development, and travel. This is true even if the college is part of a consortium and does not attempt to launch its own programs.
6. A good public information system to keep the college and community aware of the program and its activities
7. Participation by community advisory and support groups (Greenfield, 1990, p. 2-3).

Greenfield's sentiments are echoed by Emerson and Newsom (1995), who developed a model taxonomy of international education in order to assess international education in the public community colleges in Texas. The model taxonomy was based on existing literature on international education and included four components, administration, instruction, international student support services and outreach. This model taxonomy includes many of the suggestions and theories of writers such as Greenfield (1990), Burn (1980), Backman (1984) and Raby (1996). In addition to the suggestion that international education be a fully incorporated part of the college, much of the literature offers suggestions about and examples of international education activities.

Study abroad, curricular orientation, faculty and student exchanges, foreign language study, area studies, foreign student recruitment, and international export are all components of international education (O'Banion, 1989; Gleazer, Jr, 1989; King and Fersh, 1992; Francis, 1993). Invariably, international student recruitment

and international export (commonly referred to as technical assistance), are the last items on these long lists of ways in which to internationalize the community college. However, as mentioned earlier in this chapter, many authors are taking a closer look at these two components. Late in 1998, a thesis was published at the University of Alberta that goes a long way in filling the void in the literature regarding the international activities of the college sector in Canada.

Canada's Public Colleges and Postsecondary Technical Institutions Involvement in International Education, by Jacques Pierre Emile Hurabielle, is based on a survey of Canadian colleges and provides basic information regarding the history of international education, current demographics and future trends. Hurabielle reviews the data collected through five interviews at one college in Western Canada, and surveys from sixty-one institutions across Canada. The information that he presents helps to fill in the blanks in the current literature, and establish a picture of what is happening in the international education area at Canada's colleges. While Hurabielle is particularly interested in the neo-colonial, imperialistic consequences of international education, he provides only limited data pertaining to the rationale and motivation for colleges' involvement in international activities.

Hurabielle's thesis provides some badly needed information regarding the general characteristics of international education activities at Canadian colleges. Hurabielle collected information regarding the nature of international practitioners, institution

demographics, and the staffing and activities of international education. Hurabielle also provided data regarding international students and the marketing and coordination activities of the institutions. This particular study provides a strong background for more in-depth analysis of international education activities. Hurabielle's data is not broken down by province and is based on sixty-one institutions across Canada. Hurabielle's work raises questions worthy of further study and reinforces the fact that much more study is warranted in this area.

Another study on foreign student recruitment and international export was undertaken by Dick Dodds and Gordon McNeil in 1994, on behalf of the Education Summit in cooperation with the Municipality of Metro Toronto Economic Development Division and the Asia Pacific Foundation. In their study, Dodds and McNeil report on a November 1993 mission to Asia. On this mission a team of educators representing all three levels of education in Metropolitan Toronto, accompanied a business mission to Hong Kong. This study reports on this mission and makes several recommendations to strengthen the Metro Toronto presence in Asia. The Dodds and McNeil report is very interesting as it is one of the most explicit examples of the linking of business and international education to appear in the literature. Like Hatton (1995) , Holmes (1996) and Leginsky and Andrews (1994), Dodds and McNeil are strong in their support of international activities.

The literature on international education and internationalization ranges from general discussions on the importance of international education, justifications and rationales for international education, descriptions of ways in which to internationalize, and a small, but hopefully growing, body of literature, to which this thesis most directly contributes, on the financial aspects of international education. This international education literature is mainly American, but there is a growing Canadian component to it. This thesis helps to expand this Canadian perspective and take a closer look at revenue generating international activities.

## **GLOBALIZATION LITERATURE**

There is a second body of literature, related to internationalization, which has a direct relationship to this thesis. Although the majority of the literature regarding globalization and the emergence of global economic markets is American and focuses on the university sector, it still has a great deal of relevance for this thesis and deserves some attention. Phillip Jones (1998) distinguishes between globalization and internationalization in the following way:

The logic of globalization contrasts markedly with that of internationalism. The latter, with its intrinsically democratic foundation, looks to a world ordered by structures supportive of that functionalism which is embedded in accountability. Globalization, by contrast, implies few logical imperatives in favour of accountability, but rather looks to the pursuit of interest on the global level through the operation of unfettered capitalism. . . In essence, globalization is seen as economic integration, achieved in particular through the establishment of a global market-place marked by free trade and a minimum of regulation. In contrast, internationalism refers to the promotion of global peace and well-being through the development and application of international structures, primarily but not solely of an intergovernmental

kind. Despite important conceptual difficulties in formulating the case for internationalism and despite the world's patchy record in putting its principles into effect, the essentially pro-democratic logic of internationalism stands in sharp contrast to the logic of globalization (Jones, 1998, pp. 143-44).

Jones is careful to distinguish between the pro-capitalist agenda of globalization and what he sees as the humanistic agenda of internationalism. Like the term internationalism, there are a number definitions of globalization, however, most of the definitions focus on the economic aspects of globalization. Jones (1998) uses a model of globalization which emphasizes what he believes to be the most obvious and fundamental feature of globalization - the organization and integration of economic activity at levels which transcend national borders and jurisdictions.

Currie and Newson (1998) are careful to point out the difference between:

globalization as a process that has indeed made communication instantaneous and encouraged people to think in more global terms, and a conception of globalization that combines market ideology with a corresponding material set of practices drawn from the world of business (Currie and Newson, 1998, p. 1).

Almost all of the literature regarding globalization and higher education pertains to the impact of the economic aspects of globalization on higher education.

Dudley (1998) outlines what she believes to be some of the forces that have led to globalization, and the consequences of this new global order:

Globalization is a narrative of incorporation into a world system. The central premise of this narrative is the new world order of a truly global economy. The new global order is argued to be the culmination of a number of interdependent developments, which include the following:

1. The aspirations of virtually all societies throughout the world toward Western materialist/consumer-based lifestyles

2. The penetration and near hegemony throughout the world of Western popular culture, particularly American expressions of this mass culture
3. The increasing dominance of Western, and particularly U.S., models of production and consumption
4. Increasing integration of world economies into a single global international market
5. Free trade and the new international division of labour (Dudley, 1998, p. 22).

Dudley sees some very negative consequences of globalization on public policy.

She believes that public policy is being re-engineered in order to serve the globalization agenda and:

policies almost without exception, require states to reduce public spending, deregulate capital and labor markets, minimize welfare provision, and either eliminate or privatize as much as possible of the welfare state (Dudley, 1998, p. 25).

The impact of globalization on public policy has several implications for higher education. Though most of the literature refers specifically to universities, many of the findings are also applicable to community colleges.

Authors such as Kerr (1994), Shumar (1997), Slaughter and Leslie (1997), Currie and Newson (1998), Slaughter (1998) and Cruikshank (1995) have argued that globalization has several significant impacts on higher education. These authors argue that as a result of the globalization of national economies, there are significantly smaller amounts of public money available for expenditure on the public sector which includes higher education. Governments are focused on making their country competitive in the global market, and in order to become competitive and an attractive member of the global marketplace, they have sought

to reduce budget deficits and eliminate national and provincial debts. This agenda of debt reduction has resulted in decreased public funding for such things as welfare, health care and education. Kerr (1994) argues that:

Financial resources from governments are more difficult to obtain. This reflects both the reduction by about one-half across the industrialized nations in the annual increase in productivity, which is the basic source of such resources, and the fact that higher education is by now a much heavier burden on resources (Kerr, 1994, p. 3).

The reduction in public expenditure on higher education has resulted in chronic underfunding of postsecondary institutions in many industrialized countries (Shumar, 1997), and as a result, higher education has had to bow to the agenda of globalization.

In addition to reduced public expenditure on higher education, globalization has several other impacts on higher education. These impacts include: the emergence of business practices in higher education administration, the increased focus on programs and disciplines with relevance to the marketplace, and the increasing efforts of postsecondary institutions to secure funds from the private sector. Currie and Newson (1998) and Newson (1998) explore the business style of management and organization that is creeping into higher education. Currie and Newson argue that:

Managerialism represents more than the expansion of administrative personnel in universities and more than a style of leadership. It involves entire institutions in new ways of conceiving of and accomplishing their business: indeed, of defining its activities in terms of business rather than of education. Managerialism represents changes in practice that have a

profound impact on the nature of education itself (Currie and Newson, 1998, p. 142).

Shumar (1997) is highly critical of the increasing corporatisation of universities:

Coming under different names, (TQM, responsibility centre management) this culture of assessment is the logic of the marketplace directly brought to bear on the university department or college. Work must be rationalized in order to make the university more efficient and less wasteful . . . The effect of this has been to create a university where the knowledge and courses that sell are the only ones the university will support - knowledge that does not draw students and/or research money must be either eliminated or reduced to general curriculum where it can be taught by the flexible workforce (Shumar, 1997, p. 98).

Like Shumar (1997), other authors have suggested that globalization has forced governments to focus their attention on the educational areas which have the most relevance to the market. Higher education institutions are pressured to make their educational offerings relevant to the “real world” and provide students with skills and training that can serve the country’s need to become economically competitive in a global market.

Slaughter and Leslie (1997) point out that as pressure mounts for countries to become globally competitive, attention is focused on higher education programs which can contribute to this agenda:

National policy makers in advanced industrialised countries are moving discretionary research and training moneys into programs focused on the production aspects of higher education, programs that complement areas of innovation in multinational corporations, such as high technology manufacturing. In other words, policy makers at the level of the nation state, whether responding to pressures from the market, international capital mobility, or the business class, are concentrating state moneys on higher education units that aid in managing or enhancing economic innovation and thereby, competitiveness (Slaughter and Leslie, 1997, p. 14).



This shift towards emphasis on academic endeavours linked to the market is also noted by Fisher and Rubenson (1997). In their discussion of Canadian universities Fisher and Rubenson point out that in some ways universities are beginning to assume the vocational training role traditionally filled by the community colleges.

Fisher and Rubenson note that there has been:

a further blurring of the vocational part of the boundary that has traditionally separated the universities and colleges. The education-versus-training labels will no longer characterize the binary structure of the postsecondary sector as in the past. On the surface, two contradictory trends seem to be at work: academic drift as colleges become more like universities; and vocationalism, as universities take on more responsibility for training the highly skilled technical employees in, for example, computer science, and for retraining professionals. The increase in university transfer courses and the extension of degree-granting status to colleges are indicators of the former trend. The long-established trend toward vocationalism is exemplified by the expansion of commerce and business administration over the past two decades (Fisher and Rubenson, 1997, p. 93).

The alignment of educational offerings to market needs has also been noted by Kerr (1994) who points out that the pressures of the global economy have created a situation where:

Governments are guiding higher education more in the direction of applied research, of applications of research and of polytechnic skill training, and away from "pure scholarship." More research and more skill training is taking place outside higher education, as a related development. These tendencies reflect intensified worldwide economic competition (Kerr, 1994, p. 3).

Globalization has forced universities to shift their focus towards more vocationally oriented programs in order to secure public funding. This shift has tremendous implications for universities, but also has implications for community colleges.

While community colleges have traditionally offered vocational training programs linked to market needs, globalization has increased the pressure on colleges to offer vocational programs that are of a highly skilled nature and can fulfill global market needs.

The infiltration of business attitudes and practices into higher education has caused some authors to lament the increasing commoditisation of education. Authors such as Shumar (1997) point to a changing environment in the universities which has resulted in the university turning itself into an "industry" in order to generate enough revenue to survive. Shumar argues:

While the university does not produce a commodity in the traditional sense, the service it provides is taken as product and the institution uses capitalist institutional arrangements to produce it. This for me is the commoditization of higher education, the evolution of a vision of education as, not just a product to be bought and sold (which is itself a semiotic in the process of change and very important), but the entire institutional rearrangement of higher education into a productive industry (Shumar, 1997, p. 31).

The cutbacks in public funding and the resulting need for postsecondary institutions to generate alternate sources of revenue are perhaps the two biggest impacts of globalization on higher education. As Shumar (1997) argues, institutions have been forced to behave as businesses, selling education as their product:

It is now no longer books and ideas that people read and share and teach about, education has become a thing to package and distribute to consumers. In a sense it has become a commodity, one of the many new commodities that young people must line up for in their quest for a better social position. In this way, mass-culture, upward mobility, the reification of cultural capital, and the commodification of education can be seen as inter-linking processes. In a real way the production of education and the production of mass-market commodities are both linked to the same processes of expanding

industrial commodity production and are both driven by the politics of a liberal, market-exchange polity (Shumar, 1997, p. 151).

The transformation of education into a “product” and the business like behaviour of postsecondary institutions is also noted by Slaughter and Leslie (1997) who have called this transformation academic capitalism. The authors explain that academic capitalism emerged as faculty tried to maintain and expand resources and in order:

To maintain or expand resources, faculty had to compete increasingly for external dollars that were tied to market-related research, which was referred to variously as applied, commercial, strategic, and targeted research, whether these moneys were in the form of research grants and contracts, service contracts, partnerships with industry and government, technology transfer, or the recruitment of more and higher fee-paying students. We call institutional and professorial market or marketlike efforts to secure external moneys academic capitalism (Slaughter and Leslie, 1997, p. 8)

Slaughter and Leslie go on to define the market-like behaviours of universities as:

institutional and faculty competition for moneys, whether these are from external grants and contracts, endowment funds, university-industry partnerships, institutional investment in professor's spinoff companies, or student tuition and fees. What makes these activities marketlike is that they involve competition for funds from external resource providers. If institutions and faculty are not successful, there is no bureaucratic recourse, they do without. Market behaviours refer to for-profit activity on the part of institutions, activity such as patenting and subsequent royalty and licensing agreements, spinoff companies, arm's-length corporations, and university-industry partnerships, when these have a profit component (Slaughter and Leslie, 1997, p. 11).

The increasing market-like behaviour of postsecondary institutions is also noted by Currie (1997) and Dudley (1997). Fisher and Rubenson (1997), point out that postsecondary institutions are moving towards full cost recovery programming, and predict that the “the marketing of programs at profit-making rates to foreign elites will become the norm”(Fisher and Rubenson, 1997, p. 96).

Like Fisher and Rubenson (1997), Currie and Newson (1997) draw a direct link between internationalization activities such as international student recruitment and educational export and an emerging trend towards market-like behaviour and the privatization of universities. Currie and Newson write that:

Packaging knowledge for overseas consumption, recruiting "foreign students" into specially designed programs that charge full cost recovery or even profitable tuition fees, and selling self-teaching, do-it-at home course modules to local students are forms of privatization. Although students have always traveled abroad to study, and private universities in particular have traditionally appealed to an international student contingent, public universities and governments are now relying, more than in the past, on the foreign exchange and the differential tuition rates they receive from nondomestic students. Whereas several decades ago, programs to assist foreign students to study abroad were sponsored by governments and foundations, the latter now play only a small part in bringing foreign students to Western countries. Moreover, the rationale for attracting these students has changed. Although cultural and intellectual exchange remains a by-product of attracting international students, it is much less emphasized while greater emphasis is placed on foreign exchange to increase export earnings (Currie and Newson, 1997, p. 148).

Though Currie and Newson's comments are directed towards universities, they are clearly applicable to the college sector as well.

Like the university sector, the college sector has felt the impact of globalization. Four of the major impacts of globalization on the community college sector include: (a) the increased pressure for the colleges to prepare students to live and work in a global economy, (b) the need for colleges to become more entrepreneurial and generate their own source of funds in order to make up for the shortfall in public funding, (c) colleges are developing partnerships with local industry to help them

improve their human resources so they can better compete in the global market and (d) the colleges have found a market niche in aiding foreign countries in preparing their workforce for a global economy. Ironically, one of the impacts of globalization on the college sector is that the colleges are training foreign workers so that they can compete successfully in a global market. In a sense, the colleges are training groups of students who will ultimately compete against each other in the global marketplace. In some instances, one could argue that international student recruitment and educational export, while providing financial resources for the local college, and exposing local students to new cultures and ideas, are in reality helping foreign countries gain the skills to compete successfully against Canada. The significance of the impact of globalization on higher education and in particular, its relationship to the international activities of the CAATs, make the globalization literature of particular relevance to this thesis. This thesis provides examples of the impact of globalization on the higher education sector in Ontario.

## **GENERAL LITERATURE ON THE COMMUNITY COLLEGE IN CANADA**

There is a very large body of literature regarding the history, functions and organization of the community college sector in Canada. This literature includes descriptions of college curriculums, governance, and variations in community college organization across the country. Interestingly, despite the large volume of work on the Canadian community college sector, there is almost no mention of

international education in this literature. John Dennison and Paul Gallagher's 1986 book on the state of community colleges in Canada makes only a very brief reference to the international activities of the colleges. The Dennison and Gallagher book purports to give a general overview of the state of community colleges in Canada yet limit their examination of the internationalization of colleges to a passing note that colleges can play an important role in leading Canada into an improved foreign market position, and can help find solutions to international problems such as malnutrition and pollution. Dennison and Gallagher provide an extremely brief history of internationalization at Canadian community colleges, and an acknowledgement of the link between revenue generating international activities and entrepreneurship at the colleges:

The initial internationalization of colleges which had been designed to meet provincial if not local or regional needs attracted very little public attention in Canada, but what attention it did receive was largely favourable; Canadians were hardly opposed to the virtues of broadening the horizons of their college students and campuses, particularly when international education initiatives usually covered all their costs and in some cases generated modest profits. By the mid-1980s, international education was a major growth area for several colleges and one of the favoured choices for the exercise of entrepreneurialism and revenue generation.(Dennison and Gallagher, 1986, p. 160).

Acknowledgment of entrepreneurship at Canadian community colleges is evident not only in Dennison and Gallagher's work, it is also found in other general texts on the Canadian community college sector. Pascal (1980) discusses the potential danger of entrepreneurship at the colleges:

There are dangers in such "entrepreneurism," if you wish to call it that. There may be criticism, based on the claim that these peripheral activities receive more focus than educational endeavors. Bureaucrats may feel that

administrative budgets are too high overlooking the fact that the "extra" salaries come from "extra" earnings. Ministry officials may misunderstand the difference between colleges and try to balance things by awarding projects to other colleges. Resentments may arise in other colleges because the kind of activities outlined may provide many part-time jobs for students and a higher level of hiring in the community. There is also the human factor—an aggressive approach may cause resentment in some who may genuinely disagree with the basic philosophic tenets and find such an operation hard to accept.

Nevertheless, if a college is to justify its existence it must be memorable in the lives of its students and an ongoing blessing to its various communities. Hence, it must endeavour to respond fully and joyfully to its prime and to its peripheral mandates. If it does attempt this, the resulting climate in the college will have a positive effect on its students, its faculty and its staff. Is such a course of action not in accordance with its basic philosophic aims(Pascal, 1980, p. 66).

Pascal's discussion of entrepreneurism provides an interesting new perspective from which to view revenue generating international activities as it indicates that these activities can be viewed both as a component of the internationalization of the college, and as a part of the colleges' entrepreneurial activities.

Janet Knowles (1995) points out that there has been increasing entrepreneurship at Canadian colleges, though almost nothing has been written about it. Knowles cites the emergence of the global economy as one of the factors forcing colleges to become more entrepreneurial, but also points out that since their inception, colleges have had close ties with business and industry. Knowles groups the current entrepreneurial activities of the colleges into five areas of activity; advocacy and lobbying, fiscal management, fund-raising, international education and business and industry training. According to Knowles:

One of the most significant developments in higher education over the past decade has been the establishment of increased linkages between colleges,

other organizations such as labour and community agencies, and business and industry. One such prominent and fast-growing linkages is in the area of contract training. Contract training programs and services can generally be clustered around the following areas; apprenticeship training, community-wide collaboration, training for industry, labour market adjustment, and faculty return-to-industry programs (Knowles 1995, p. 197).

Knowles identifies five organizational models that the colleges have used for their entrepreneurial activities, these models include: an integrated approach, single division responsibility, a college-wide unit, a subsidiary organization and regional or national partnerships and consortia. Common to all of these organizational models is that their central purpose is to serve the training needs of business, industry and government agency organizations. In Knowles' view, international activities are an extension of the entrepreneurial activities of the colleges.

A 1987 study by Dennison and Levin makes no mention of internationalization in the stated goals of Canada's community colleges. Dennison and Levin reported that Chief Executive Officers of Ontario colleges and officials of the Ministry of Education, agreed that the primary goal of the Ontario colleges was to prepare students for employment. It is interesting to note that despite the involvement of Ontario colleges in internationalization and entrepreneurial activities, they were not found to be significant goals of the colleges in the Dennison and Levin study. The absence of any significant mention of internationalization in the general literature on Canadian community colleges is not unusual. In fact, the large body of



government documents and studies on community colleges in Ontario also contain very few references to internationalization.

## **PUBLIC DOCUMENTS**

The first important documents regarding Ontario community colleges are what are known as the "Basic Documents." These documents include the actual legislation establishing the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario in 1965, the regulations under this legislation, and the speech of the Minister of Education to the Legislature of Ontario regarding the establishment of the CAATs. In his speech to the legislature in May, 1965, The Honourable Bill Davis, Minister of Education, outlined the rationale behind the establishment of the CAATs:

And the policy is to provide, through education and training, not only an equality of opportunity to all sectors of our population, but the fullest possible development of each individual to the limit of his ability. In this new age of technological change and invention, also, its essential to the continued growth and expansion of the economy of our province, and, I suggest, of our nation, that adequate facilities be made generally available for the education and training of craftsmen, technicians and technologists (Ontario, Legislative Assembly, Debates, 27th leg., 3rd sess., 21 May, 1965, pp. 5-6).

In his speech to the legislature, Davis emphasized the link between education and the province's economy and outlined the three major responsibilities of the CAATs.

These responsibilities were to:

1. Provide courses of types and levels beyond, or not suited to, the secondary school setting
2. meet the needs of graduates from any secondary school program, apart from those wishing to attend university

3. meet the educational needs of adults and out of school youth whether or not they are secondary school graduates (Ontario, Legislative Assembly, Debates, 27th leg., 3rd sess., 21 May, 1965, pp. 5-6).

Nowhere in the Basic Documents is there any reference to the CAATs involving themselves in international activities. Despite the clear link that is made between the education and training the colleges provide and the economic development of the province, there is never any mention of using the colleges as an economic development tool for international economies, nor any suggestion that the colleges could generate their own revenue by pursuing international activities. According to the legislation and supporting documents, the CAATs were intended to provide a range of program offerings and opportunities for Ontario students. There is an indication that the colleges were to engage in some contract education projects, but these were envisaged as contracts to help local businesses and government train workers for specific local employment needs.

The government documents pertaining to the establishment of the CAATs pay no attention to the question of whether or not the CAATs would have a role outside their own local jurisdiction. It is clear from the "Basic Documents" that the CAATs had a local mandate to serve local Ontario training and education needs. Silence on the international activities of the CAATs is typical of most of the government documents pertaining to the colleges. In some documents this omission is quite noticeable.

In 1990, Vision 2000, the first major review of the mandate and future of the CAATs was published. The report put forth a new mandate for the CAATs which advocated the creation of a dynamic, learner driven system. The report acknowledged the need for students to be “educated in the major issues facing the world,” but did not examine the relationship of international activities to this goal. The report did acknowledge, in a small way, the revenue generating possibilities of contract training, but the focus was on local/national rather than international training projects. The authors of Vision 2000 expressed concern that the fee-for-service area could become a drain on the public funds of the colleges and advocated that this area of college activity be well regulated. The report acknowledged the important source of revenue that contract training can be for the colleges, but made no mention of the international element.

Vision 2000 does acknowledge the growing diversity of Ontario’s population, and the increasing globalization of economies and cultures. There is one brief mention of international agencies as purchasers of contract training, and a brief mention that the Human Resource Development component of the colleges will have to help the colleges support and expand international activity and increase the colleges’ ability to engage in partnership activity with local, provincial and global communities. However there is no direct references to the international activities of the CAATs. This omission is very interesting, given that Vision 2000 was the largest study on the mission, mandate and activities of the CAATs carried out since the colleges were

founded. The omission of any significant reference to international activities could have several implications. The first being that international activities at the CAATs were rather insignificant in the late 1980s, or the omission can reflect the marginal position of international activities at the CAATs, despite their growth and revenue generating capabilities. Subsequent government studies have also not paid a great deal of attention to international activities.

In 1993 a report on the finances of Ontario Colleges was released by the Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario. The report examines the difficulties resulting from the decrease in government support for the colleges. The report offers several suggestions of how the colleges could deal with the shortage of government funding and acknowledges the growing source of revenue that international educational services can be for the colleges:

The provision of educational services internationally has resulted in significant revenue for some Colleges. Programs in small business development, entrepreneurship and healthcare have been successfully marketed to a number of countries. This may be a source of sustained revenue growth in addition to increased enrollment of international students (particularly in "topping up" classes) (ACAATO, 1993, p. 18).

The explicit acknowledgment of the revenue generating potential of international activities is an interesting inclusion in a report on the finances of the colleges. The reference to international activities in the association's report signifies the growing importance and potential of international education activities from a financial

perspective, making the absence of any reference to these activities in Vision 2000, even more notable.

The next major government publication regarding the CAATs after Vision 2000, was No Dead Ends, the 1993 report of the Task Force on Advanced Training to the Minister of Education and Training. The task force was to identify the needs of the province for advanced training from the viewpoints of students, employees and employers. The task force was also to report on ways of ensuring more effective transfer between colleges and university, and determine the need for an expansion of current training opportunities. The report fulfills this mandate, but does not delve into the issues of whether or not the training curriculum needs to include more international perspectives, nor does it examine the development of training programs which can be marketed overseas. The report has a very narrow local focus on how the colleges can improve training opportunities for local students and businesses. The next government sponsored study on the college sector, released in 1996, however, does make several more direct references to internationalization.

In July 1996, the Ministry of Education and Training of Ontario published a discussion paper on the future goals for Ontario colleges and universities. In the discussion paper, the government set out five objectives for the college and university system, excellence, accessibility, a range of programs and institutions, accountability and responsiveness. The paper refers to international education in

relationship to the objectives of responsiveness and excellence. The paper states that one of the objectives of the postsecondary system is responsiveness to evolving requirements and circumstances, international educational trade could be viewed as the colleges' attempt to respond to financial shortfalls and the reality of an evolving global economy.

The discussion paper's reference to the objective of excellence, also has implications for international education. The paper recognizes the importance of education to making Ontario more competitive internationally, and explicitly acknowledges the need for Ontario to maintain high educational standards in order to preserve and enhance its international reputation:

It is also important, in a global economy and society, to preserve and enhance the reputation for high educational standards that Ontario holds in the international community. A commitment to excellence will enable us to do so by ensuring the integrity of the credentials offered in the province's postsecondary educational institutions (Ministry of Education and Training, 1996, p. 5).

These rather oblique references to international education and the absence of any direct reference to international contract education is incongruous in view of the fact that this document is replete with calls for more private sector funding for postsecondary education. The document pushes the concept of institutions working to generate their own revenue, solicit donations and develop partnerships with business and industry. The omission of international contract education and international students as sources of revenue is quite glaring. This omission may

indicate that government is relatively unaware of the potential of international contract education as a source of revenue. It was during the time that this document was released that the government made the decision to allow the colleges to keep the fees generated by international students, thereby creating a financial incentive for colleges to recruit international students.<sup>3</sup> In addition, this paper was published shortly before the Canadian Trade Mission to Asia which included community college leaders among the delegates. The omission of any reference to international contract education in the government documents cited is even more significant given the very strong statement regarding international education included in the November 1994 Report of the Special Joint Committee of the Senate and the House of Commons reviewing Canadian foreign policy.

The November 1994 report on Canada's Foreign Policy includes a very important chapter regarding the role of Canadian education in Canada's foreign policy. The report states that:

The projection of Canadian culture and learning abroad should be regarded as a fundamental dimension of Canadian foreign policy. The promotion of Canadian values and interests depends on the image Canada projects abroad. The stronger the image, the greater Canada's capacity for effective and independent action in foreign affairs (Special Joint Committee Reviewing Canadian Foreign Policy, 1994, p. 62).

---

<sup>3</sup> Prior to 1997, international fees were higher than domestic fees but regulated as domestic fees were. The international fees were paid into a provincial pool and were not institutional revenue. These fees were then distributed back to the colleges on the basis of total enrolment. After 1997, the pool was abandoned. Tuition fees for international students were totally deregulated and international enrolment became ineligible for operating grant funding. Institutions now keep the actual fees that they collect from international students. In some cases this means more revenue in total if the actual fee revenue is greater than the lost grant revenue. However, in some cases, it could mean less total revenue if the actual fee revenue does not exceed or offset the lost grant revenue. However, this scenario was not reported by any of the colleges in this study.

The report voices very strong support for the active recruitment of foreign students into Canadian postsecondary institutions, and the export of Canadian educational products abroad. The report acknowledges the revenue generating capabilities of these two activities as well as their potential to enhance Canada's reputation abroad and to forge many new trade links. The recommendations that the committee makes regarding the role of education in Canada's Foreign Policy is important to quote at length as it is a clear expression of federal government support for the international activities in which the CAATs are presently engaged:

...the Committee strongly recommends that international cultural, scientific, and educational affairs should be treated as a fundamental dimension of Canadian foreign policy. The Committee further recommends that Canada's international cultural, scientific, and educational foreign policy seek to: affirm Canada's cultural sovereignty; assist Canada in becoming a major participant in the global knowledge-based economy; contribute to the vitality of the arts and higher education; promote the export of Canadian cultural and educational products; and facilitate the transfer of knowledge (Special Joint Committee Reviewing Canadian Foreign Policy, 1994, p. 63).

The explicit recognition of the importance of education to Foreign Policy and International Trade was further emphasized by the October, 1998 announcement by International Trade Minister Sergio Marchi that a new Education Marketing Advisory Board has been established in order to promote Canadian educational services abroad. This board is to be chaired by the president of an Ontario CAAT, Sheldon Levy of Sheridan College. In an address to the Canadian Education Industry Summit in Toronto, Minister Marchi stated that:



Education is now an industry. Canada needs to approach the international marketplace for educational services with the same discipline and commitment that we bring to other sectors. I will look to the new advisory board for guidance on how to do that (Marchi, 1998)

Additional measures that the Federal Government of Canada are taking to support the international marketing of Canadian education include the establishment of a special support group set up in the Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade to work with Canadian educational organizations on export marketing, and a Web site to provide a "focal point on the Internet for information on government services and other intelligence in the international educational services marketplace" (Marchi, 1998).

The commitment that the Canadian Federal Government has made and is making to international education is quite remarkable. The establishment of advisory boards and websites, the inclusion of community college presidents on Federal trade missions and the explicit recognition of the role of higher education in Foreign Policy in the 1994 report, illustrate the Federal Governments' awareness of and support for the international activities of postsecondary institutions. It is clear that the Federal Government recognizes the significant financial benefits of these activities and their importance to overall trade and diplomatic relations with foreign countries. The Federal Governments' position regarding the international activities of postsecondary institutions as evidenced in the literature stands in stark contrast to the provincial government literature which makes almost no mention of

international education activities. While it is true that foreign affairs are the purview of the federal not provincial government, the provinces also have an interest in promoting themselves abroad and fostering international relationships. Despite this interest, the first Ontario Government paper that deals at any length with international education activities was published in 1996, two years after the release of the Federal Governments' Foreign Policy Report.

The 1996 report, entitled Excellence, Accessibility, Responsibility, was released by the Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education. The report contains the recommendations for the future of postsecondary education in Ontario developed by an advisory panel consisting of college and university educators and administrators. Cathy Henderson, (then) President of Centennial College served as the college sector representative on the advisory committee. Among the recommendations in the report are calls for greater flexibility and autonomy for colleges and universities. This document contains some interesting and important references to international education, all the more notable as this is the first provincial government document to examine international education issues in any detail.

The report contains several major recommendations for the future of postsecondary education in Ontario and calls for a less regulated postsecondary environment which will allow colleges and universities to have more autonomy in their decision

making. A key recommendation of the report regarding the elimination of regulations that have an impact on the international education activities of the CAATs is the call to allow colleges to grant a unique credential which would be internationally recognizable. This is a key issue for educational export and is dealt with at some length in the report:

Part of the colleges' concern was that "diploma" is a widely-used credential in Ontario which has no single standard. As a result, in the competitive world of vocational education, students and employers are left to make their own judgments about the relative calibre and quality of diploma programs. . . A number of Ontario colleges asked that their established programs be recognized with a unique credential that would signal to students and employers the distinct level and nature of the Ontario college curriculum. The designation of a unique credential would strengthen the currency of the education provided by colleges and reinforce their recognition in the provincial, national and international marketplaces (Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education, 1996, p. 45).

In their discussion of the need for a recognized college credential, the Panel examined the issue of whether colleges should be given degree-granting authority. Ultimately the Panel decided that rather than allowing the CAATs to grant degrees, it would be better to focus on strengthening the recognition of the college diploma as a "distinctive credential." To this end the report recommends that:

an Ontario College Diploma (OCD) be developed as a unique designation, backed by a review process on standards, and allowing for modifications to the credential to recognize particular specializations and accomplishments. The continued development of standards should be treated as a urgent matter. At this time, the OCD should be confined to Ontario's Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology and to programs of these colleges that meet the established standards (Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education, 1996, p. 45).

This recommendation has very important implications for international education as a recognized diploma could make an Ontario college program a much more attractive product to international students. The importance of an internationally recognized credential to the marketability of educational programs can not be overemphasized, and the Panel is clearly sensitive to this issue.

The report is clear in its support for the revenue generating international activities of CAATs and by advocating that the colleges be given more autonomy and become more specialized in particular areas, there is an implicit message that international activities will be fostered by a less regulated, more specialized college environment. The Panel recognizes the significant revenue generating potential of international activities and unlike previous government reports regarding postsecondary education in Ontario, acknowledges a need to coordinate international education with government as "it develops and implements its strategic plans for advancing Ontario's economic position in the international marketplace." The report explicitly spells out the importance of international activities to the college sector in its recommendation that:

colleges explore more actively private and international training programs and that the provincial government's coordinating and regulatory role be supportive. The terms of centralized collective agreements in the colleges should take into account the need for flexibility to develop these programs. More broadly, there are growing opportunities for partnerships with private institutions on education and research programs. It is the responsibility of all colleges and universities to have guidelines that preserve the integrity of their institutions in such partnerships (Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education, 1996, p. 39).

To date, the 1996 Report of the Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education is the only provincial government document which has dealt at any length with international education.

Many government documents concerning postsecondary education in Ontario have been published in the past ten years. Very few of these documents however, make any significant mention of the international education activities of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. The absence of significant policies, discussion papers and reports on international activities is notable. The lack of documentation could be due to several factors, not the least of which is the fact that revenue generating international activities are a relatively new phenomenon, and secondly, that the colleges have been carrying out these activities on their own, without the aid of government run coalitions. The strongest message in the government documents is that international education is an activity that is still very marginal, but, as evidenced by the October 7, 1998 Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade press release, of growing importance to both the federal and provincial governments.

## CONCLUSION

As this chapter has illustrated, there are a number of bodies of literature to which this thesis makes a contribution. The thesis contributes a Canadian perspective to the mainly American literature regarding the internationalization of higher education. This thesis brings together both the internationalization literature and the globalization literature by examining international student recruitment and educational export as two manifestations of the impact of globalization on higher education.

The thesis also contributes concrete examples and information to the literature regarding revenue generating international activities. In addition, the general literature regarding community colleges in Canada is totally lacking in any in-depth examination of the internationalization and international activities of the colleges. This thesis will help to fill this void. By the same token, there are very few provincial and federal government publications that deal specifically with the international revenue generating activities of the colleges. The federal material tends to be very general and does not provide examples of what types of export activities colleges are involved in, nor does it explore possible benefits and drawbacks of these activities, beyond the generating of revenue and trade links.

It is the goal of this thesis to fill in some of the blanks in the existing literature, and more importantly, to provide some baseline information on the state of international revenue generating activities at Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. The establishment of basic information is crucial for future research and planning in the area. Though the literature regarding international revenue generating activities is sparse, it is clear from the evidence presented in the thesis that this is a growing area of involvement for the colleges which has been recognized by both the Federal Government, the Canadian International Development Agency, the Canadian Bureau of International Education, and such writers as Hurabielle (1998), Holmes (1996), Hatton (1995) and Dodds and McNeil (1994). There is clearly room and a need for more research in this area, and this thesis is an attempt to provide a springboard for future research.

## **CHAPTER III – RESEARCH METHOD AND SURVEY RESULTS**

### **RESEARCH METHOD**

The research method used for this thesis includes a survey sent to the international office director at each of the twenty-five CAATs in the province and in depth interviews with the president and international office chairperson at five selected colleges. The survey (see Appendix A) comprised thirty-three quantitative and qualitative questions, and collected information regarding the evolution of international activities at the college, the motivation behind these activities, the organizational structure of international activities at the college, and some basic information regarding the financial aspects of the activities. Respondents were assured on the first page of the survey that no information would be included in the thesis that would identify individual survey respondents. Respondents were asked to indicate whether or not information which identified the college could be included in the thesis. Because the vast majority of respondents did not want information identifying their college included in the thesis, all colleges were assigned a letter to identify them.

The survey was divided into three sections. The first section asked general questions regarding the origins and organizational structure of international student recruitment and educational export. The second section of the survey focused on international student recruitment and asked questions regarding how international



student recruitment is organized at the college, the trend in international student enrollment, the number of international students enrolled and the cost of tuition and incidental fees for international students. Respondents were also asked to rate certain objectives of international student recruitment, and for their perception of the commitment to international student recruitment of certain stakeholders. The third section of the survey concerned educational export, and asked the same questions about educational export as were asked about international student recruitment. The third section also asked some additional questions regarding funding of the international office, and the financial expectations of educational export projects. The final question on the survey asked respondents to identify what they perceived to be the major issues in international student recruitment and educational export. Respondents were asked to include a list and brief description of current educational export projects, a copy of the college organization chart, a copy of the international office mission statement or mandate, and any documents pertaining to the historical evolution of international activities at the college.

The survey was piloted with a former CAAT president, a CAAT international office chairperson, and an international education consultant. The survey, accompanied by a letter from the Chairperson of the Committee of Presidents of the Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario (ACAATO) introducing the study and encouraging participation, and a letter from the researcher further describing the study, was sent by mail to the twenty-five international office

chairpersons in the middle of August, 1998. Survey respondents were asked to return the completed survey and accompanying materials by September 21, 1998. Respondents who did not return surveys by September 21, 1998 were called and reminded to return the completed surveys.

After the surveys were returned, the data were analyzed and put into tables which appear in chapter three. In order to gather more information and specific examples of international activities at the CAATs, five colleges were selected for in-depth interviews with the international office chairperson and the college president. The colleges were selected according to four incremental criteria. The first was the location of the college so that rural (located in a setting with a population less than 100, 000) and urban, northern, southern, western and eastern parts of Ontario were covered. The second criterion was that the college had participated in at least three educational export projects in the previous three years. The third criterion was that the college must have had a minimum of 10 international students enrolled at the college. The fourth criterion was that the college had displayed a willingness to participate in an interview. Willingness to participate in an interview was measured through informal contacts with the college during the survey development and collection phase.

In total, sixteen colleges met all of the criteria. When these colleges were divided into the four regions, colleges for interviews were selected on the basis of whether

there had been an indication from the college that they were interested in participating in an interview, whether or not it was feasible to travel to the college for an interview, and the degree of involvement that the college had in international activities. This final criterion was based on information from people closely involved in the international scene including the chairperson of the Ontario Colleges International Committee (OCIC), the Chairperson of the Committee of Presidents of ACAATO and an administrator/faculty member at a CAAT involved in international activities.

In the case where more than one college from each region fulfilled all four criteria, the college that had displayed the most willingness to participate in an interview was selected. On the basis of these four criteria the following five colleges were selected:

**College M** is located in an urban setting in southern Ontario. It is involved in many international export activities and has 125 international students enrolled at the college. College M indicated through informal discussions with the college president and international office chairperson, a willingness to participate in an interview.

**College U** is also located in an urban setting in southern Ontario and is very involved in both educational export activities and in recruiting international

students into regular college programming. It presently has 800 international students enrolled. The college president and international office chairperson indicated a willingness to participate in an interview.

*\*Because the colleges in the southern Ontario area have the greatest number of international students enrolled and the highest value for their educational export contracts, it was decided that at least two of the colleges in this area should be interviewed. College M and College U are the two widely acknowledged leaders in the international activities area, and as they also fit the four criteria, were selected for interviews.*

**College X** is located in southwestern Ontario, has participated in at least three educational export projects and has 103 international students enrolled in college programmes. Through conversations with the college president and international office chairperson a willingness to participate in an interview was indicated.

**College W** is located in a rural, eastern Ontario location. The college has been involved in at least three educational export projects, has 40 international students enrolled at the college and the international office chairperson indicated a willingness to participate in an interview.

**College S**, has five campuses spread over 58000 square miles in Northern Ontario. International activities occur at three of these rural, northern campuses. The college has been involved in at least three educational export activities, and has 15 international students enrolled at the college. The college indicated an eagerness to share more information regarding its international projects in an interview.

The interviews with college presidents and international office chairpersons took place between March and May of 1999. With the exception of the international office chairperson at College X, interviews were obtained with the college president and international office chairperson at each of the five colleges that were contacted. All interviews were conducted in person with the exception of the interview with the international office chairperson at College S which was conducted by telephone.

An interview schedule (see Appendices C&D) was followed, and given to the interviewees in advance of the interview. The interviewees were also given a consent form in advance of the interview which indicated three levels of consent. The first level of consent was that information gathered through the interview which identified the interviewee by name, his/her position at the college and the college affiliation of the interviewee could be included in the thesis. The second level of consent was that information gathered through the interview that did not identify the interviewee by name, but did identify his/her position and college affiliation could be included in the thesis. The third level of consent was that only information collected during the interview that did not identify the interviewee or their college could be included.

All but two interviewees gave the first level of consent. However, two individuals from the same institution chose the third level of consent, and it was decided that in

order to protect the anonymity of all participants, the colleges would be coded and no identifying information would be included in the thesis.

The interview schedule for the college presidents consisted of sixteen questions and covered such issues as how international activities evolved at the college and how they fit into the overall college mission, the goals that the college has for the activities, the role of outside agencies in international activities and some questions regarding the financial aspects of these activities. The interview schedule for the international office chairpersons included many of the same questions that the interview schedule for college presidents did, and it also included eight additional questions covering specific questions regarding the operation of the international office, financial implications of the international activities and staffing arrangements for international projects.

Each of the interviews with the international office chairpersons ranged between one hour and one and three quarters hours in length. Each of the interviews with college presidents lasted approximately one hour. All interviewees were very forthcoming and candid, and eager to share their opinions and perspectives on what they feel to be a very important aspect of the CAATs. Interviewees not only answered the questions on the interview schedule, but shared their opinions on a range of issues pertaining to international activities and what they believed to be

items of crucial importance to the success of international student recruitment and educational export.

Two additional interviews were conducted with personnel involved in international student recruitment and educational export. Ms. Jennifer Humphries, Program Manager at the Canadian Bureau of International Education (CBIE) and Mr. Gerald Brown, President of the Association of Canadian Community Colleges (ACCC) were interviewed in Ottawa in May, 1999. Both Ms. Humphries and Mr. Brown were asked some of the same questions posed to college presidents and international office chairpersons, as well as questions pertaining to the role of their organizations in international student recruitment and educational export. Both interviews were approximately one hour in length, and the interviewees were given a copy of the questions in advance of the interview.

ACCC is the national membership organization of Canadian colleges and institutes. ACCC represents its members to government, business and industry both in Canada and abroad. ACCC divides its functions into four main areas, forum, advocacy, marketing and partnerships. The forum allows member of colleges to exchange ideas and information, advocacy includes ACCC lobbying various levels of government in matters pertaining to the colleges, marketing involves the promotion of college services both domestically and overseas, and partnerships concerns the establishment of links between member institutions and non-

governmental organizations, other educational institutions, and with business and industry. ACCC has a fairly large role to play in the international activities of the colleges, as ACCC brokers a large number of international projects funded by such third party agencies such as CIDA and the World Bank. In 1998, ACCC secured over \$28, 000, 000 in international contracts for its members.

CBIE is a national organization of colleges, universities, corporate partners, governmental organizations and individuals dedicated to international education and “the free movement of ideas and learners across national borders”(CBIE Annual Report, 1998, pg. 1). Like ACCC, CBIE includes advocacy, and research and information services among its many activities. The mission of CBIE is “to promote international understanding and development through the free movement of people and active exchange of ideas, information and technologies across international borders” (CBIE Annual Report, 1998, pg. 3). One of the stated functions of CBIE is to promote the international trade of Canadian educational goods and services. Both CBIE and ACCC are closely involved with some of the international activities of the colleges and thus it is appropriate to include the perspectives of both of these organizations in this thesis.



## **SURVEY RESULTS**

Twenty-one out of twenty-five surveys were completed and returned. All of the surveys were useable, though in some cases, the respondents indicated that the college was not involved in certain activities and did not answer the questions pertaining to those activities. The reporting of the survey results is organized into four sections. The first section provides general information regarding the international education offices at the colleges. Information on such things as what prompted the creation of the international education office and the functions performed by the office are reported. The second section identifies the international student recruitment activities of the colleges. The third section of this chapter presents on the educational export activities of the CAATs. The final section of the chapter reports the results of the open-ended question regarding what respondents perceived to be some of the major issues in international student recruitment and educational export.

The data from the survey were analyzed so that descriptive statistics could be generated for almost every question. The comments provided in response to the qualitative questions have been summarized. In order to present the data in an easy to read and understandable format, 33 tables were created. The tables appear at the end of this chapter.

## **SECTION 1: GENERAL INFORMATION REGARDING THE INTERNATIONAL EDUCATION OFFICE**

Just over 90% of the institutions that responded to the survey had an international programs office, and both of the institutions that reported they did not have an international education office did have some college personnel devoted to the administration and coordination of international activities (**Table 1**).

The name of the college international offices was usually some variation on International Programs Office, International Development Office, or International Education Office. The majority (83.3%) of the offices were founded between 1985 and 1998, with only 16.7% being founded prior to 1985 (**Table 2**). Of the three colleges that did not indicate the year the international office was founded, two were the colleges that reported that their college did not have a specific international programs office.

When asked to indicate the major factors that prompted the creation of the international office (**Table 3**), 76.2% of the respondents indicated that the need to coordinate college international projects was a factor in the creation of the office. Two thirds indicated that the desire to increase revenue was a factor, 57.1 % indicated that the office was created at the direction of the college president. One third indicated that a desire for more enrollment or the need for an outlet for faculty expertise were factors prompting the creation of the office. Only 14.3% of

respondents indicated the need to compete with other colleges and direction from the college board of governors were factors, and only 4.8% felt that pressure from other administrators was a factor prompting the creation of the international office. No respondent indicated pressure from faculty as a factor in prompting the creation of the international office.

Thirty-three percent of the respondents cited other factors as prompting the creation of the international office, including advances in distance learning, direction from the vice-president of marketing and communications, initiative of a single faculty member, the need to accommodate international students, a desire to internationalize the college and the potential to generate revenue.

When asked if there was a key initiative that initiated international programming at the college, a variety of answers were elicited. Several respondents simply stated no, there was not a key initiative. However, the majority of respondents indicated that there was a key initiative that prompted international programming. Many colleges mentioned that existing projects that had been brokered through agencies such as the Canadian Bureau of International Education (CBIE) and the Association of Canadian Community Colleges (ACCC) formed the basis of the international programming that subsequent projects were built upon. Several colleges mentioned that international programming at the college was a result of organizational restructuring and the creation of a formal international mandate. Respondents also

mentioned that there were key administrators or faculty members at the college who were instrumental in initiating international programming.<sup>4</sup> College presidents were cited by three respondents as being initiators of college international programming. According to the responses, the three major initiators of international programming at the colleges were: (1) the pre-existence of a few particular international projects, (2) a restructuring of the college organization which recognized internationalization, and (3) the efforts of a key individual at the college.

When asked to identify the person in the college organization to whom the head of the international office reports (**Table 4**), 28.6% of the colleges indicated that the head of the international office reported directly to the president of the College, 19% reported to the vice-president of Academic Affairs, 5.7% to the chief financial officer of the College, and 52.4% indicated other.

Under the category "other", respondents indicated a wide variety of college officers to whom the director of the international programs office reported. Over 72% of the college officers indicated in the "other" category were deans or vice-presidents of business, ventures, training or community development. In the "other" category, the majority of the international education office heads report to a college officer who is responsible for the "revenue generating" aspects of the college.

---

<sup>4</sup> Specific examples are found in the interview data presented in Chapter Four.

Just over a quarter (26.3%) of the international offices had a formal mandate approved by the Board of Governors (**Table 5**). This relative lack of a formal mandate seems to fit with the fact that the position of the international office in the college structure tends to be unclear.

When asked what functions the office performs (**Table 6**), 90.5% of respondents indicated that the office recruits international students to the college generally. Selling education and training programs to developing economies with funding support from non-governmental organizations was a function performed by 85.7% of the college international offices and 76.2% of respondents indicated the office was engaged in selling education and training programs directly to foreign markets and recruiting international students into programs specifically designed for them. The internationalization of the college community was a function performed by 71.4% of the offices, while only 47.6% of the respondents indicated that it was a function of the office to internationalize the college curriculum.

The above responses indicate that the primary function of the international office is to recruit international students and sell education and training programs. The fact that such a high percentage (71.4%) of respondents indicated that internationalizing the college community was a function of the international office is very interesting as it could indicate that the revenue generating functions are seen as a means to

internationalize the campus, or it could indicate that the offices are engaged in activities beyond recruitment and export that serve to internationalize the college community. However, the fact that only four respondents indicated that the international office had more than 20% of its activities concerned with something other than recruitment and educational export (**Table 7**), could indicate that the internationalization of the college community is a by-product of the student recruitment and educational export activities. The low emphasis on activities other than student recruitment and educational export is also demonstrated in **Table 8**, which indicates that the average percentage of international activities concerned with something other than student recruitment and educational export was only 11.7%.

## **SECTION 2: INTERNATIONAL STUDENT RECRUITMENT**

### **Organization of International Student Recruitment**

When asked what description of the organizational structure of international student recruitment best fit their college (**Table 9**), 75% of respondents indicated that one international office undertakes all of the international student recruitment activities. One college (5%), indicated that each department undertakes its own initiatives and the central international office undertakes all of the administration and organization of the recruitment process. One college (5%) indicated that

different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives to recruit international students and undertake all the administration and organization of the recruitment activities.

Of the three colleges (15%) that indicated that their college had another type of organizational structure for international student recruitment, one indicated that international student recruitment is part of the overall student recruitment the college, headed by the Director of Student Services. The Director of Student Services specifies the international student recruitment policy and the international office then carries out the activities. A second college stated that the international office identifies objectives and develops strategies, then works with the Registrar's Office to implement the strategies. Finally, a third college stated that the international office initiates and follows-up on international student recruitment, but the central administration of the college was responsible for the students' registration and integration into the college.

### **Historical Evolution of Recruitment and Motivation to Recruit and Enroll International Students**

Respondents were asked to describe their college's earliest international programmes or initiatives to recruit international students. Some colleges stated

that there had been an international student presence at the college as early as the 1970s, when CBIE sponsored students from Libya and Nigeria began attending the college. Respondents indicated that CBIE and ACCC sponsored projects were some of the earliest international student recruitment programs. CIDA and the Aga Khan foundation were also cited as early sources of international students. Programs with particular countries such as St. Lucia, Venezuela, Hong Kong and African countries were cited by respondents as some of the earliest international student recruitment activities. Other respondents mentioned that attendance at educational fairs, the use of agents and special programs designed to attract international students such as English as a Second Language programs were used to recruit international students. One respondent reported that development programs, the use of agents, articulation agreements, and staff exchanges formed the basis of early recruitment activities. In general there are three major themes regarding early recruitment activities: sponsorship by an agency such as CBIE, ACCC or CIDA, a more recent (post 1985) focus on Asia as a source of international students, and the promotion of specific college programs as a means of recruiting international students.

When asked to indicate how important particular objectives were in motivating the college to participate in international student recruitment (**Table 10**), 100% of respondents felt that generating revenue for the college was a very important (75%) or important (25%) objective of international student recruitment. Seventy percent of



respondents felt that bringing foreign perspectives to the local student body was a very important (45%) or important (25%) objective. Close to sixty per cent of respondents felt that fostering international trade links was a very important (31.6%) or important (26.3%) objective. Respondents indicated that bringing foreign perspectives to the curriculum was an important (35%) or very important (30%) objective. Forty-five per cent of respondents felt that fostering a sense of world community was a moderately important objective, while 55% felt that it was important (35%) or very important (20%). The creation of exchange opportunities for students and faculty was cited by 60% of respondents as moderately (35%) or somewhat important (25%) objective, and 50% of respondents indicated that fostering professional development for faculty was a moderately (30%) or somewhat (20%) important objective. Interestingly, maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs was the only objective that some colleges (20%) indicated as not important. However, another 20% found this to be a very important objective! This distribution indicates that this objective varies from college to college, depending on the use that their facilities and programs are experiencing.

The responses to the question regarding perceptions of the commitment to international student recruitment of various college stakeholders are shown in **Table 11**. When asked about their perception of the commitment to international student recruitment of their college president, 80% of respondents indicated that they felt that the president was very committed (65%) or committed (15%). Three

respondents (15%) felt that the president was moderately committed, while one college (5%) felt that the president was only somewhat committed. The board of the college was perceived to be very committed (30%) or committed (40%), by 70% of the respondents, while 20% felt the board of the college was moderately committed. A quarter of respondents felt that the board of the college was somewhat committed (15 %), or not committed (10%) to international student recruitment. In summary, it appears that the major locus of commitment was perceived to be the president and the board.

The students at the colleges and the Provincial Ministry of Education and Training were perceived by the respondents to be the least committed to international student recruitment of all the college stakeholders. Fifty-five per cent of the respondents felt that the students were committed (30%) or moderately committed (25%), to international student recruitment, while 10% felt the students were only somewhat committed and 35% felt students at the college were not committed to international student recruitment.

The Provincial Ministry of Education and Training was perceived by 70% of the respondents to not be committed (45%) or only somewhat committed (25%) to international student recruitment. One college (5%) felt that the Ministry was very committed, and two colleges (10%) felt that the Ministry of Education and Training

was moderately committed. Three colleges (15%), were unsure of the commitment of the Ministry of Education and Training.

### **Recruitment Strategies and Enrollment Information**

When asked what strategies the college uses to recruit international students (**Table 12**), 100% of respondents indicated that the college advertised on the Internet, 90% used print advertisements in foreign markets and 85% made use of Canadian embassies and consulates to disseminate information. Three quarters of respondents indicated that a representative of the college attended education fairs in foreign countries, and 70% participated in the Canadian Education Centres.<sup>5</sup>

Other recruitment strategies used by the CAATs included collaborating with other institutions in order to recruit students (60%), attending federal or provincial trade missions (50%), and the use of professional marketing firms (25%). In the “other” category, two respondents indicated that the college used agents to recruit

---

<sup>5</sup> The Canadian Education Centre Network is based in Vancouver and is a wholly-owned subsidiary of the Asia Pacific Foundation of Canada. The network is run in conjunction with the Government of Canada and the mission of the centres is to promote and market Canadian education to international students and people interested in contract and group training. For a fee, Canadian educational institutions, including the CAATs, can avail themselves of the services of the Canadian Education Centres (CEC) which are located in Bangkok, Hong Kong, Jakarta, Kuala Lumpur, Mexico City, New Delhi, Singapore, Seoul, Taipei, Beijing, Canberra, Buenos Aires, São Paulo and Santiago (Canadian Education Centre Web Page).

international students, and institutional linkages and business relationships were also cited as strategies to recruit international students.

When asked to indicate the trend in international student recruitment at their college over the past ten years (**Table 13**), 55% of the respondents stated that there had been a slow increase in the number of international students enrolled at the college. Only 10% of the respondents indicated there had been a rapid increase in the number of international students enrolled at the college, and a further 10% indicated that there had been a slow increase in the number of international students enrolled at the college, followed by a rapid increase in international student enrollment in the past four years. One college (5%) indicated that there had been no change in the number of international students enrolled at the college, and one respondent (5%) indicated that there had been a decrease in the number of international students enrolled at the college. The three colleges (15%) that indicated that there had been another trend at their college in the past ten years cited such trends as a shift in the mandate of the college to include international student recruitment, and one college noted a rapid increase in the enrollment of international students in the English as a Second Language courses, but not in other programs at the college.

The two colleges that indicated a rapid increase in the number of international students enrolled were the two colleges that reported the highest number of international students enrolled at the college.

International student tuition fee policy was changed by the provincial government in 1996, giving the college the right to keep the entire tuition fee paid by international students. Respondents were asked if this change in government policy had led to changes in recruitment policy and practice at the college and to describe any changes that may have occurred. There is no corresponding table for this question, but some of the responses are outlined below.

Nine of the nineteen respondents indicated that recruitment policy and practice has changed. One respondent stated that "there is more pressure to increase the numbers," while another stated that "when the college was allowed to retain all revenue, it became more attractive to pro-actively recruit internationally." A third respondent stated that recruitment activities have been increased as the "fees associated with international students have become very attractive." Two respondents mentioned that as a result of the governmental policy change, the college provided the international office with a marketing budget in order that they might significantly increase recruitment activity. Other respondents indicated that the recruitment of international students has become more strategic and systematic.

Ten of the nineteen respondents to the question stated that recruitment policy and practice had not changed. Some respondents stated that the international student enrollment at the college has always been quite small and there was no plan to increase the numbers, while other colleges stated that they “had always recruited international students, only now it is more rewarding.” Two colleges stated that because of the way they handled international students, they always kept all of the revenue, thus the change in government policy did not affect their recruitment policy and practice. One respondent stated that international student recruitment is a low priority for the college because of the high cost involved, while another respondent stated that the college had chosen to focus on a limited number of specialized program areas, rather than an overall increase in international student recruitment. Clearly, there has been some strategic planning by some of the colleges regarding which international activities should be focused on. It is also obvious that some colleges have not made international student recruitment a high priority.

The split in responses between colleges that experienced a change in recruitment policy and practice and those that did not is interesting. Apparently the increased revenue potential of international student recruitment influenced some colleges to recruit more aggressively, while other colleges which did not have a great interest in international student recruitment were not influenced by the change, and other colleges simply maintained their current practices. It appears as if the revenue

potential of international students did not have a big impact on recruitment policy and practice.

Over forty per cent of the colleges have fifty or fewer international students enrolled. The majority of colleges (73.7%) have between one zero and one hundred and fifty international students enrolled. Twenty-one percent of the colleges had over three hundred international students enrolled than had between one hundred and fifty-one and two hundred and ninety-nine international students enrolled (Table 14). On average, the colleges enrolled one hundred and forty-eight international students (Table 15). The college with the highest number of international students also had the highest number of full-time postsecondary enrollments, and the college with the second highest number of international students had the third highest number of full-time postsecondary enrollments. Generally, the number of international students at the college was in direct proportion to the number of full-time postsecondary enrollments at the college. At fourteen of the CAATs, international students accounted for less than two percent of total full-time enrollment. Two colleges reported that international students accounted for between two and five percent of total full-time enrollment, and only two colleges reported that international student enrollment accounted for more than five percent of total full-time enrollment.<sup>9</sup>

The average combined tuition and incidental fee paid by an international student enrolled in a standard diploma program at a CAAT was \$9646.56 (Table 16). Three quarters of respondents indicated that health insurance was not included in the incidental fee (Table 17).

## SECTION 3: EDUCATIONAL EXPORT

### Organization of Educational Export

The organizational structure for educational export at the majority (76.2%) of the colleges followed a model similar to the international student recruitment structure in that the international office secures the contracts and undertakes the administration and organization of contracted programs (Table 18). Two colleges (9.5%), indicated that different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives and are responsible for all of the administration and organization of

contracted programs. Only one college (4.8%), has an organizational structure whereby the department undertakes its own initiatives, and the central office takes care of all of the administration and organization of the contracted program. In the “other” category, two colleges indicated that the organizational structure was a

---

\* Total enrollment figures taken from the Ministry of Training, Colleges and Universities, Full-time Postsecondary Headcount for Fall 1998.



blend of the international office taking full responsibility for the securing and administering of projects and departments undertaking their own initiatives with the international office taking responsibility for administration and organization of the programs.

Close to 80% of the colleges put each international training activity through some sort of post-program evaluation (**Table 19**). Respondents were asked to describe these post-project evaluations, and a variety of evaluation methods, including debriefing sessions, surveys, written evaluations and informal discussions with project partners were mentioned. Several respondents noted that there is often a formal review process mandated by funding and brokering organizations such as CIDA, CBIE and ACCC. Several colleges mentioned that the post-project evaluation was a time to not only review the services that the college had provided, but to discuss possibilities for future projects. The evaluation process was seen as “good business” practice, and an assessment of not only client satisfaction, but the college’s performance. It is clear from the responses that the 78.9% of colleges which have a post-project evaluation process do so not only because some funding organizations require it, but because they believe it to be good business practice.

When asked whether or not the college requires a business plan for each project (**Table 20**), 61.9% of the respondents responded in the affirmative. Four colleges (19.05%) answered “other” to this question and indicated that while the college

might not require a specific “business plan” for each project, each activity did have some sort of a report, budget or contract that contained essentially the same type of information that would be contained in a business plan. Because these “other” answers indicated that the colleges did require some sort of financial plan for each activity, the percentage of affirmative answers is really 81.0%. It is clear that the vast majority of colleges require that educational export activities be conducted as business activities, and as such, expect that every project will have a business plan.

### **Evolution of Educational Export at the CAATs**

Respondents were asked to describe the evolution of educational export activities at the college. Not surprisingly, there was great variation in the answers provided by respondents. Six respondents noted that educational export projects were initially brokered through agencies such as CBIE, ACCC and CIDA and were mainly development aid projects in developing countries. The respondents noted that there has been an evolution from these “brokered” aid projects to private sector projects where the college bills the purchaser directly. One respondent noted that the evolution of educational export projects at the college was interrupted when the international work became contentious during a period of large staff layoffs at the college. During this period of layoffs, some members of the college community expressed resentment that resources were allocated to what they perceived to be

“non-essential” activities such as international projects. The respondent felt that much of the momentum of and support for international export was lost, and it is only recently that it has become a growth area for the college with a move towards articulation and exchange agreements with international institutions, rather than “contract” projects.

Other respondents noted a change in how the college has gone about securing international projects. Respondents indicated that now there is a more strategic approach to marketing the college and providing services. A shift from aid projects to more lucrative private sector projects was noted by respondents. Generally, the respondents noted that the educational export activities had taken on a more business-like structure involving strategic planning, central organization and higher value contracts.

The evolution of international export contracts has taken many forms at the colleges. Some have experienced a progression from projects brokered through organizations such as ACCC and CBIE to private contracts that the college negotiates itself. Some colleges reported a shift to more strategic business approaches to educational export projects, while other colleges have seen a shift in the areas of the world where the projects are concentrated. One respondent noted that the college was initially working in Asia, but was now expanding into Europe and Latin America. Some respondents noted that the evolution of educational export at their college was

characterized by an increase in the number of projects. However, there were two colleges which reported a decline in educational export activities. Both colleges that reported a decline in export activities are very small, located in rural settings and have a total student enrollment of less than three thousand students. One of these colleges also reported a decrease in the number of international students at the college.

The variety of responses regarding the evolution of educational export activities makes it difficult to generalize. However there are three trends that stand out: the growth in the number of export activities at most colleges, the move away from brokered projects towards directly negotiated contracts, and the trend towards more strategic business approaches to educational export.

The respondents were asked to report the principal stimulus that led the colleges to become involved in exporting training and education to foreign markets. This question also elicited a wide variety of answers. However, some general trends emerged. Six colleges stated that the original stimulus was an ACCC, CBIE or other NGO project. One respondent stated that the "influx of student training programs brokered through agencies such as ACCC, CBIE and foreign governments (created) a niche market for ESL training at the college." Another respondent commented that "the focus started with ACCC projects in the early 1980s. Giving us experience to develop further."

Five respondents mentioned that it was the international connections and activities of an individual college officer that was the specific stimulus. Two respondents mentioned the efforts of the college president as being very important, while two colleges mentioned that there were key faculty members who provided the stimulus. One respondent cited himself as the initiator of educational export activities. One respondent mentioned that: "In the beginning (early 1990s), it was the international connections of a faculty member and then her dean who became the inaugural international director (that stimulated educational export)."

Four respondents stated that the opportunity to generate revenue and the professional development opportunities for faculty and administration helped to prompt college involvement in export activity.

Two colleges stated that international export activities were not the result of some critical event/stimulus, but a natural evolution. One respondent stated that "the college does domestic contract training so international contract training is a natural step. It is all part of the college's international plan." One college cited the expertise in new technology of information as the stimulus which initiated international export activities.

Respondents gave a variety of answers regarding the principal stimulus behind educational export activities, however, three major stimuli were revealed: a project or projects brokered by an NGO, the efforts of a single member of the college community, and the desire for revenue and professional development for faculty and staff.

When asked to indicate how important particular objectives were in motivating the college to participate in educational export (**Table 21**), generating revenue for the college was considered by all respondents to be a moderately to very important objective in motivating the college to participate in educational export. Eighty-five per cent of respondents felt that it was a very important objective, 10% felt that it was an important objective and 5% felt that it was a moderately important objective. Sixty-five per cent of respondents indicated that fostering international trade links was a very important (25%), or important (40%), objective. Twenty per cent of respondents felt that it was a moderately important objective, and 15% of respondents felt that it was only a somewhat important objective. Fostering professional development for faculty was perceived by 65% of the respondents to be a very important (20%) or important objective (45%), while 35% found it to be a moderately (30%) or somewhat important (5%) objective.

Creating exchange opportunities for faculty and students was perceived by 50% of the respondents as a very important (15%) or important (35%) objective, while 30%

found it to be a moderately important objective, and 20% found it to be a somewhat important objective.

Fostering a sense of world community was perceived by 42.1% of the respondents as a moderately important objective, while 42.1% of respondents perceived it as a very important (10.5%) or important (31.6%) objective. A further 15.8% found that it was only a somewhat important objective.

Bringing foreign perspectives to the local student body was perceived by 42.1% of the respondents as a very important (10.5%) or important (31.6%) objective, while 36.8% found it to be a moderately important objective, 10.5% a somewhat important objective and 10.5% found it not to be an important objective. It is interesting to note that as many respondents who found it to be a very important objective, found it not to be an important objective! The objective of bringing foreign perspectives to the curriculum elicited a similar sort of pattern: 5.3% of respondents felt this to be a very important objective while 36.8% found it to be important. However, 26.3% believed it to be only a moderately important objective, while a further 36.8% found it to be only a somewhat important objective. These statistics support the finding reported earlier in the thesis that international education offices spend very little time on activities designed to "internationalize the college."

The objective of maximizing underutilized college facilities was perceived by 75% of respondents as moderately (25%), somewhat (15%), or not (35%) important. Only

25.3% of respondents perceived this to be an important (15%) or very important (10%) objective of educational export.

**Table 22** illustrates the respondents' perception of the commitment to educational export of various college stakeholders. The college president was perceived by 85% of respondents to be very committed (55%) or committed (30%). The remaining 15% of respondents felt that the college president was moderately committed to educational export. The board of the college was perceived by 70% of the respondents to be very committed (20%) or committed (50%) to educational export, while 20% of respondents felt that the board of the college was moderately committed. Just 5% of respondents felt that the board was only somewhat committed, while another 5% felt that the board was not committed to educational export.

The college administration (including deans and department chairpersons) was seen by the majority of respondents (60%) to be very committed (30%) or committed (30%) to educational export. A quarter of respondents found the administration to be moderately committed and 15% believed that the administration was only somewhat committed to educational export. The majority of respondents (65%) felt that college faculty was moderately (25%) or only somewhat (40%) committed to educational export. However, 35% of respondents felt that the faculty was very committed (10%) or committed (25%) to educational export.



No respondent indicated that the students at the college were very committed to educational export, though 30% felt that students were committed to it. Fifteen per cent of respondents felt that students were moderately committed, while the majority of respondents (55%) felt that students were only somewhat committed (20%), or not committed (35%) to educational export.

The perception of the commitment of the provincial ministry of education to educational export, elicited the greatest disparity in responses. One respondent (5%) perceived the provincial ministry of education to be very committed to educational export, while 50% felt that the provincial ministry of education is not committed to educational export. A further 35% of respondents felt that the ministry of education was moderately (10%) or somewhat (25%) committed to educational export. The remaining 10% of respondents indicated that they were unsure of the provincial ministry of education's commitment. The majority of respondents feel that the provincial ministry of education is not committed to educational export.

### **Financial Implications of Educational Export and International Student Recruitment**

Respondents were asked to indicate the college's financial expectations of educational export projects (Table 23). The majority of respondents (71.4%)

indicated that the college expects that the project will produce net revenue over expenses. The remaining 28.6% of respondents indicated that projects are generally expected to produce net revenue over expenses, but occasionally some projects are expected to operate in the red. One college selected both of these answers, and another college indicated "other" stating that at a minimum, projects revenue must equal expenses.

When asked how the operating costs of the international office are covered (**Table 24**), 66.7% of respondents indicated that costs were covered with money from project revenue, 52.4% of respondents indicated that money was provided from central allocations of the college, 47.6% indicated that a percentage of the recruitment expense was allocated to cover costs of international office, and 9.5% indicated that another method was used. These other methods included using a percentage of international tuition to cover operating costs, and another college stated that revenue from educational export, plus a percentage of individual international fee revenue was the method used to cover the operating costs of the international office.

Information regarding the total yearly revenue of international educational export contracts presents some problems, as many respondents did not give complete information. However, some patterns did emerge. The average yearly total revenue from international educational export for 1994 was

\$299, 614 and grew to a projected average of \$574, 875 for 1998 (**Table 25**).

The wide disparity in reported total revenue from the colleges is quite striking. Some colleges reported no revenue, while other colleges reported as much as \$2, 000, 000 in total revenue. In 1994 and 1995, the majority of colleges reported total revenues of between \$0 and \$300, 000. In 1996 and 1997, the majority of colleges (81% and 86% respectively) reported total revenue of between \$0 and \$600, 000 (**Table 26**). Projections for 1998 show that 50% of the respondent colleges estimated total revenue of between \$0 and \$300, 000, two colleges (13%) estimated total revenues between \$301, 000 and \$600, 000 and another 13% of respondent colleges estimated revenues of between \$601, 000 and \$900, 000. Only four college estimated total revenue of more than \$900, 000. It appears that the majority of colleges have earned total revenues of less than \$600, 000 per year from their international educational export contracts. Generally, the smaller the total full-time postsecondary enrollment at the college, the lower the total reported revenue. The majority of these smaller colleges are located in rural areas (total population of less than 100 000). There appears to be a direct correlation between college size, location and level of international involvement.

## SECTION 4: EDUCATIONAL EXPORT PROJECTS

Survey respondents were asked to describe three of the major international projects in which their college had been involved during the previous three years. Respondents were asked to include the title or major theme, the initiator, the number of faculty, local students, and college administrators involved, the number of contracted students enrolled, and the length of the program, in the project description. Respondents also included the geographic location of the project in their description.

Respondents gave the location of 51 projects, which were situated in 32 countries (**Table 27**). Twenty-four of these projects (47%) were located in Asian countries. Ten projects (19.6%) were located in Africa or the Middle East, eight projects (15.7%) were in Europe, and nine projects (17.6%) were located in South America/Mexico or the Carribean. Countries where projects were located included: Barbados, Bosnia, Botswana, Brazil, Chile, Cuba, Dubai, Ecuador, Egypt, France, Hungary, India, Indonesia, Japan, Jordan, Korea, Kuwait, Malaysia, Mali, Mexico, Panama, People's Republic of China, Poland, Russia, St. Lucia, Saudi Arabia, South Africa, Thailand, Ukraine, United Arab Emirates, and Zambia.

Respondents were asked to identify the initiator of the international projects, and they indicated that college administration initiated 60% of the projects (**Table 28**).

CIDA or another non-governmental organization initiated 30.9% of the projects, 16.4% of the projects were initiated by the purchaser of the program, 10.9% of the projects were initiated by a college faculty member, and 7.3% of projects were initiated by the college president.

The average number of college faculty members involved in the international projects was 6.4 (**Table 29**). The majority of the projects (81.6%) involved between zero and ten faculty members and 14.3% of projects involved between eleven and twenty faculty members. Only two projects involved more than twenty faculty members. The average number of college administrators involved in an international project was 3.14 (**Table 30**).

The vast majority (61.7%), of international projects that were described (**Table 31**), did not involve any local college students. However, 31.9% of the described projects involved between one and ten local college students, and only 3 projects (6.4%) involved more than ten local students.

The number of contract students enrolled in the international projects varied greatly (**Table 32**). It is reported that 31.8% of the projects did not enroll any students, 34.1% enrolled between one and twenty students, 11.4% enrolled between 21 and 99 students, and 22.7% of projects enrolled more than 99 students. Contracted student enrollment ranged from two to three-hundred and eleven students.

The duration of the projects ranged from three week summer projects, to an eleven year, on going international project. As **Table 33** shows, 18 out of 44 projects (40.9%) were of a duration of one year or less. Ten out of 44 projects (22.7%) were three years in duration, and 7 out of 44 (15.9%) projects were two years in duration and 7 out of 44 projects (15.9%) were four years in duration. Only two projects (4.54%) had a duration of more than four years. Overall, there were more international projects with a duration of two years or more than projects with a duration of less than one year.

## **SECTION 5: RESPONDENTS' IDENTIFICATION OF MAJOR ISSUES IN INTERNATIONAL STUDENT RECRUITMENT AND EDUCATIONAL EXPORT**

The respondents were asked to share their thoughts regarding what they perceived to be some of the major issues in international student recruitment and educational export. A wide diversity of views was elicited by this question. However, some common concerns, ideas and viewpoints emerged. Thirteen respondents mentioned that government support is a major issue in international education. The issue of government support fell into two major areas, immigration policy and the marketing of Canadian education.

In the area of immigration, respondents revealed great frustration in dealing with Immigration Canada in order to secure visas for international students. One

respondent stated that: "to get student authorization (visa) is very time consuming and difficult. As a result we lose potential students going to the USA." Other colleges mentioned the difficulty in securing visas for students from countries such as China and India and felt that there is a lack of "real support from Immigration Canada."

The second area regarding the government's role in international activities that was mentioned by respondents, is the role of the federal and provincial governments in the marketing of Canadian education. Respondents indicated that there is a "lack of cohesive government support" for international education, and were critical of the lack of provincial government support for the marketing of Ontario's educational system and the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. Respondents were also critical of the federal government's role (or lack thereof) in international education, and one respondent pointed to the "lack of a national vision/focus on international education, the lack of Canadian presence in international markets, (and the) lack of a national education system. (This lack) leaves international program purchasers confused." Another respondent called for the inclusion of Ontario education in policy formation at the Departments of Foreign Affairs and International Trade. Several respondents mentioned the need for a provincial and federal marketing approach to international education, and one respondent suggested that the: "Ontario government needs to become an active player in the promotion of colleges and Ontario educational systems." The responses reveal a clear message that both

levels of government need to play a more supportive role in helping colleges secure international students and business.

Nine respondents mentioned economics as a major issue in international activities. The financial crisis in Southeast Asia was seen by a number of respondents as a significant problem for the colleges. One respondent mentioned that the: "economies of developing nations are under pressure. The (subsequent) reduction of government funded educational projects is a problem for Ontario college international projects." A second respondent pointed to the volatility of foreign currencies, while another respondent expressed concern about the "Asian Flu."

Respondents also expressed concerns about the escalating costs of project development and recruitment and the increasing competition with other colleges in Ontario, Canada and the world. The increasing competition for students and projects and the lack of money to develop marketing tools is seen as a problem by some respondents. One college mentioned that it is not only the lack of money that is a marketing problem for the college but the lack of effective articulation and recognition of college credentials are also a major problem.

Two colleges stated that joint international marketing of the Canadian colleges and greater cooperation between educational providers were important issues in international education.



In summary, there were two major issue areas identified by respondents, the need for government support, and the financial pressures impacting international activities. Both issue areas are concerned with the “business” of international activities: what is needed to promote business, and potential threats to the business.

**Table 1**

College has an international programs office:

	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>%</b>
Yes	19	90.5
No	2	9.5

**Table 2**

Year International Office was founded:

<b>Year of founding</b>	<b>Number (18)</b>	<b>%</b>
1975-1978	1	5.6
1980-1984	2	11.1
1985-1989	4	22.2
1980's	1	5.6
1990-1994	6	33.3
1995-1998	4	22.2

Three colleges did not respond to the question.

**Table 3**

Factors prompting the creation of the international office:

<b>Factor</b>	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>%</b>
Need to coordinate college international projects	16	76.2
Desire to increase revenue	14	66.7
Direction from college President	12	57.1
Other	7	33.3
Desire for more enrollment	7	33.3
Outlet for faculty expertise	7	33.3
Need to compete with other colleges	3	14.3
Direction from the Board	3	14.3
Pressure from administrators	1	4.8
Pressure from faculty	0	0

\* Percentages add to more than 100 because respondents gave multiple answers.

**Table 4**

Person in college organization that the head of the international office reports to:

<b>Reports to:</b>	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>%</b>
President	6	28.6
Vice President of Academic Affairs	4	19.0
Chief Financial Officer	1	5.7
Other	11	52.4

\*One college stated that the office chairperson reports to two college officers

**Table 5**

International Office has a formal mandate approved by the Board of Governors:

	<b>Number (19)</b>	<b>%</b>
YES	5	26.3
NO	14	73.7

Two colleges did not respond to this question.

**Table 6**

Functions performed by the international office:

<b>Function</b>	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>%</b>
Recruit international students to the college generally	19	90.5
Sell education and training programs to developing economies with funding support from NGOs.	18	85.7
Sell education and training programs directly to foreign markets	16	76.2
Recruit international students into programs specifically designed for them	16	76.2
Internationalize the college community	15	71.4
Internationalize the college curriculum	10	47.6

\* Percentages add to more than 100 because respondents gave multiple answers.

**Table 7**

Breakdown of percentage of international office activities spent on each program:

Program	Percentage of international office activities									
	0-20%		21-40%		41-60%		61-80%		81-100%	
	n (18)	%	n (18)	%	n (18)	%	n (18)	%	n (18)	%
International student recruitment	6	33.3	2	11.1	3	16.7	6	33.3	1	5.6
Training and education programs delivered in a foreign country	9	50.0	6	33.3	0	0	1	5.6	2	11.1
Training and education programs for a specific group of foreign students delivered at the college	13	72.2	3	16.7	0	0	1	5.6	0	0
Other	14	77.8	3	16.7	1	5.6	0	0	0	0

Three respondents incorrectly answered the question.

**Table 8**

Percentage of international office activities that concerned the following programs over the past twelve months:

<b>Program</b>	<b>Average %</b>	<b>Low %</b>	<b>High %</b>
International student recruitment	42.2	0	90
Training and education programs delivered in a foreign country	28.1	0	100
Training and education programs for a specific group of foreign students delivered at the college	18.1	0	85
Other	11.7	0	55

Three respondents incorrectly answered the question.

**Table 9**

Organizational Structure of International Student Recruitment:

<b>Organizational Structure</b>	<b>Number (20)</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
One international office undertakes all of the international student recruitment activities	15	75
Department undertakes its own initiatives and central international office undertakes all the administration and organization of the recruitment process	1	5
Different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives to recruit international students and undertake all the administration and organization of the recruitment activities	1	5
Other	3	15

\*One respondent did not answer the question

**Table10**

Importance of objective of international student recruitment:

<b>Objective</b>	<b>Very Important</b>		<b>Important</b>		<b>Moderately Important</b>		<b>Somewhat Important</b>		<b>Not Important</b>		<b>No Answer</b>
	<b>n</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n</b>
Bringing foreign perspectives to local student body	9	45.0	5	25.0	4	20.0	2	10.0	0	0	1
Fostering international trade links	6	31.6	5	26.3	7	36.8	1	5.3	0	0	2
Bringing foreign perspectives to curriculum	6	30.0	7	35.0	5	25.0	2	10.0	0	0	1
Generating revenue for the college	15	75.0	5	25.0	0	0	0	0	0	0	1
Fostering sense of world community	4	20.0	7	35.0	9	45.0	0	0	0	0	1
Fostering Professional Development for Faculty	4	20.0	6	30.0	6	30.0	4	20.0	0	0	1
Creating Exchange Opportunities for Faculty and Students	3	15.0	5	25.0	7	35.0	5	25.0	0	0	1
Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs	4	20.0	4	20.0	6	30.0	2	10.0	4	20.0	1

**Table 11**

Respondents perception of the commitment to foreign student recruitment of college stakeholders:

Stakeholder	Very Committed		Committed		Moderately Committed		Somewhat Committed		Not Committed		Not Sure	
	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%
Your college president	13	65.0	3	15.0	3	15.0	1	5.0	0	0	0	0
College faculty	0	0	7	35.0	7	35.0	6	30.0	0	0	0	0
College administration including deans and department chairpersons	6	30.0	5	25.0	7	35.0	1	5.0	1	5.0	0	0
Students at the college	0	0	6	30.0	5	25.0	2	10.0	7	35.0	0	0
The Board of the college	6	30.0	8	40.0	4	20.0	3	15.0	2	10.0	0	0
Provincial Ministry of Education	1	5.0	0	0	2	10.0	5	25.0	9	45.0	3	15.0

**Table 12**

Strategies used to recruit international students:

<b>Strategy</b>	<b>Number (20)</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Advertising on Internet/Website	20	100
Using print advertisements in foreign markets	18	90
Use of Canadian embassies and consulates to disseminate information	17	85
Attending education fairs in foreign countries	15	75
Participating in Canadian Education Centres	14	70
Collaborating with other institutions in order to recruit students	12	60
Attending federal or provincial trade missions	10	50
Using professional marketing firms	5	25
Other	4	20

**Table 13**

Trend in international student recruitment over the past ten years:

<b>Trend</b>	<b>Number (20)</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Slow increase in the number of international students enrolled at the college	11	55
Rapid increase in the number of international enrolled at the college	2	10
Slow increase in the number of international students enrolled in the college, followed by a rapid increase in international student enrollment in the past four years	2	10
No change in the number of international students enrolled at the college	1	5
Decrease in the number of international students enrolled at the college	1	5
Other	3	15

\*One respondent did not answer the question



**Table 14**

Number of International Students Enrolled at the College:

Number of Students enrolled	Number (19)	Percentage
0-50	8	42.1
51-100	2	10.5
101-150	4	21.1
151-200	1	5.3
200-300	0	0
301-400	3	15.8
>401	1	5.3

\*Two respondents did not answer this question

**Table 15**

Average Number of International Students Enrolled at the College:

Average	High	Low
148	800	0

**Table 16**

Average combined tuition and incidental fee paid by an international student in a standard diploma program:

Average	High	Low
\$9646.56	\$11300.00	\$7250.00

\*Two respondents did not answer the question

**Table 17**

Health Insurance is included in the incidental fee:

	Number (20)	Percentage
YES	5	25
NO	15	75

\*One respondent did not answer the question

## EDUCATIONAL EXPORT

**Table 18**

Organizational Structure of Educational Export:

Organizational Structure	Number (21)	Percentage (%)
One international office secures the contracts and undertakes the administration and organization of contracted programs	16	76.2
Different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives to develop and deliver contracted programs and undertake all the administration and organization of contracted programs	2	9.5
Other	2	9.5
Department undertakes its own initiatives and central international office undertakes all the administration and organization of contracted programs	1	4.8

**Table 19**

Is there a post project evaluation of each training activity?

	Number (19)	Percentage
YES	15	78.9
NO	4	21.1

\*One respondent said that whether or not there is a post-project evaluation depends on the project, and a second respondent indicated that the college had no activities at the time of survey.

**Table 20**

College requires business plan for each project:

	Number (21)	Percentage
YES	13	61.9
NO	4	19.05
OTHER	4	19.05

**Table 21**

Importance of objective of educational export:

Objective	Very Important		Important		Moderately Important		Somewhat Important		Not Important		No Answer	
	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%	n	%
Bringing foreign perspectives to local student body	2	10.5	6	31.6	7	36.8	2	10.5	2	10.5	2	
Fostering international trade links	5	25.0	8	40.0	4	20.0	3	15.0	0	0	1	
Bringing foreign perspectives to curriculum	1	5.3	7	36.8	5	26.3	6	36.8	0	0	2	
Generating revenue for the college	17	85.0	2	10.0	1	5.0	0	0	0	0	1	
Fostering sense of world community	2	10.5	6	31.6	8	42.1	3	15.8	0	0	2	
Fostering Professional Development for Faculty	4	20.0	9	45.0	6	30.0	1	5.0	0	0	1	
Creating exchange opportunities for Faculty and Students	3	15.0	7	35.0	6	30.0	4	20.0	0	0	1	
Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs	2	10.0	3	15.0	5	25.0	3	15.0	7	35.0	1	

**Table 22**

Respondents perception of the commitment to educational export of college stakeholders:

Stakeholder	Very Committed		Committed		Moderately Committed		Somewhat Committed		Not Committed		Not Sure	
	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%	n (20)	%
Your college president	11	55.0	6	30.0	3	15.0	0	0	0	0	0	0
College faculty	2	10.0	5	25.0	5	25.0	8	40.0	0	0	0	0
College administration including deans and department chairpersons	6	30.0	6	30.0	5	25.0	3	15.0	0	0	0	0
Students at the college	0	0	6	30.0	3	15.0	4	20.0	7	35.0	0	0
The Board of the college	4	20.0	10	50.0	4	20.0	1	5.0	1	5.0	0	0
Provincial Ministry of Education	1	5.0	0	0	2	10.0	5	25.0	10	50.0	2	10.0

\*One respondent did not answer the question

**Table 23**

College's financial expectation of projects:

<b>Expectation</b>	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Produce net revenue over expenses	15	71.4
Pay for expenses only	0	0
Occasionally operate in the red	0	0
Projects are generally expected to produce net revenue over expenses, but occasionally some projects are expected to operate in the red	6	28.6
Other	1	4.8

\* Percentages add to more than 100 because one respondent gave two answers

**Table 24**

Method for covering operating costs of the international office:

<b>Method</b>	<b>Number (21)</b>	<b>Percentage</b>
Money from project revenue	14	66.7
Money provided by central allocations	11	52.4
Percentage of recruitment money allocated to cover costs of international office	10	47.6
Other	2	9.5

\*Percentages add to more than 100 because respondents gave multiple answers

**Table 25**

Average yearly total revenue from international educational export contracts:

<b>Year</b>	<b>Number</b>	<b>Average \$</b>	<b>High \$</b>	<b>Low \$</b>
1994	14	299 614.21	750 000	0.00
1995	14	328 784.35	1 000 000	0.00
1996	16	374 814.06	1 000 000	0.00
1997	15	511 066.66	2 700 000	0.00
1998(projected)	16	574 875.00	2 000 000	0.00

**Table 26**

Yearly total revenue from international educational export contracts:

Total Revenue	1994		1995		1996		1997		1998 (projected)	
	(n) 14	%	(n) 14	%	(n) 16	%	(n) 15	%	(n) 16	%
\$0-\$300 000	8	57	9	64	8	50	6	40	8	50
\$301 000-\$600 000	4	29	3	21	5	31	7	46	2	13
\$601 000-\$900 000	2	14	1	7	2	13	1	7	2	13
>\$901 000	0	0	1	7	1	6	1	7	4	25

**Table 27**

Region of World International Project located in:

Region of World	Number (51)	Percentage
Asia	24	47
Africa/Middle East	8	15.7
South America/ Mexico/ Caribbean	9	17.6
Europe	8	15.7

**Table 28**

Initiator of the International Project:

Initiator of Project	Number (55)	Percentage
Administration	33	60
CIDA/NGO	17	30.9
Purchaser of Program	9	16.4
Faculty Member at College	6	10.9
College President	4	7.3
Other	3	5.5

\* Percentages add to more than 100 as respondents gave multiple answers

**Table 29**

Number of Faculty involved in the International Project:

Number of Faculty involved in Project	Number (49)	Percentage
0-10	40	81.6
11-20	7	14.3
21-30	1	2.04
31-40	1	2.04
Average Number of Faculty involved in Projects: 6.35 Low: 0 High: 35		

**Table 30**

Average Number of College Administrators involved in the International Project:

High	Low	Average
10	0	3.14

**Table 31**

Number of Local College students involved in the International Project:

Number of Local Students involved in Project	Number (47)	Percentage (%)
No Local Students	29	61.7
1-10 Local Students	15	31.9
More than 10 Local Students	3	6.4
Average number of local students involved in projects: 4.38 Low: 0 High: 30		

**Table 32**

Number Contract students enrolled in the international project:

Number of Contract Students Enrolled	Number (44)	Percentage
No Contract Students	14	31.8
1-20	15	34.1
21-99	5	11.4
>99	10	22.7
For Projects that did enroll contract students, and average of 71.1 students were enrolled. (Low 2 High 311)		

**Table 33**

Duration of the International Project:

Duration of Project	Number (44)	Percentage
1 Year or Less	18	40.9
2 years	7	15.9
3 years	10	22.7
4 years	7	15.9
More than 4 years	2	4.54

## CHAPTER IV - INTERVIEW FINDINGS

### INTRODUCTION

In this chapter, the results of the interviews conducted with five college presidents (CP), and four college international office chairpersons (IOC) as well as the President of the Association of Community Colleges Canada and a Program Manager from the Canadian Bureau of International Education are reported.

The interviews were conducted with the college president and international office chairperson at the five colleges listed in Chapter Three. These colleges are:

**College M:** located in an urban setting in southern Ontario. It is involved in many international export activities and has 125 international students enrolled at the college. In the fall of 1998, College M had over 10, 000 full-time postsecondary students enrolled at the college.

**College U:** also located in an urban setting in southern Ontario and is very involved in both educational export activities and in recruiting international students into regular college programming. It presently has 800 international students enrolled. In the fall of 1998, College U had over 12, 000 full-time postsecondary students enrolled at the college.



**College X:** located in southwestern Ontario and has 103 international students enrolled in college programmes. In the fall of 1998, College X had just over 5, 000 full-time postsecondary students enrolled at the college. The international office chairperson was not available for an interview.

**College W:** located in a rural, eastern Ontario location. There are 40 international students enrolled at the college. In the fall of 1998, College W had just over 5, 000 full-time postsecondary students enrolled at the college.

**College S:** has five campuses spread over 58, 000 square miles in Northern Ontario. International activities occur at three of these rural, northern campuses. There are 15 international students enrolled at the college. In the fall of 1998, College S had approximately 1, 500 full-time postsecondary students enrolled at the college.

The results of the interviews are presented in seven sections. The first section deals with the historical evolution of educational export and student recruitment at the colleges. The second section examines why colleges wish to participate in these activities, and how they see them fitting into the college mission and mandate. The third section looks at competition and coordination among the colleges. The fourth section deals with the internal organization of export and recruitment, and the role of outside organizations in these activities. The fifth section of the chapter examines some of the practical aspects of recruitment and export as well as the financial

implications of these activities. The sixth section examines the interviewees' opinions on what they see as the major issues facing international recruitment and export activities and the seventh and final section explores what the interviewees believe to be some of the future trends in export and recruitment.

### **Section 1: Historical Evolution of Export and Recruitment**

College presidents (CPs) and international office chairpersons (IOCs) were asked how their colleges became involved in international export and recruitment, how these activities fit into the college mandate, and what they hope to gain from their participation in these activities. Many of the CPs and IOCs cited that the international activities of their colleges began in a very small way. The CPs and IOCs stated that the earliest college international activities began as a result of a personal relationship between the college president or a faculty member and an international group. IOC (M) stated that contract projects began in the early 1970s through the college president's involvement with the Rotarians. College M sent used college equipment and educational materials to the Caribbean at no charge. CP (M) referred to this arrangement with the Caribbean country of St. Vincent as "a labour of love." The early activities at college M evolved into projects in Africa and Asia brokered through ACCC and funded by CIDA. Gradually the college moved "beyond ACCC" and away from government funded projects. College M now

focuses its attention on “countries that can afford to pay.” A recent development in the history of educational export and recruitment at College M was the hiring of a full-time student recruitment officer in 1997.

College W reports a similar sort of historical evolution of its international activities. According to IOC (W), the college became involved in international activities in the mid-1970s when it undertook some small projects brokered by CBIE. Once these original projects in Libya and Nigeria were completed, the college began looking for other projects. According to CP (W) the person who was president of College W in the early 1980’s “was very instrumental, and brought a big focus to international activities.” The international office evolved from relying on government sponsored projects, to a situation where “80% of the business is through private contracts.” CP (W) stated that there has been a shift in the activities of the international office away from projects in Africa where they were very involved in post-Apartheid restructuring projects, towards activities in South America and Mexico.

The president of College X told a very similar story regarding the origins and evolution of international export and recruitment at his college. CP (X) stated that College X had a “long-standing interest in international education” and its earliest activities were international projects brokered through ACCC and CBIE and often funded by CIDA. These early projects were concentrated in Asia and the Caribbean and involved faculty members using sabbatical time to help with the educational

process in countries such as Thailand, Bangladesh, and Trinidad. CP (X) noted that the college has shifted away from CIDA funded projects as the revenue from these projects has decreased and the competition from other colleges for these projects has increased. These projects are “less lucrative and therefore less attractive.” The college has shifted its focus away from Asia and towards South America in order to secure “more lucrative” projects and recruit students.

IOC (U) stated that the college has been involved in international activities for the “past 15-20 years, and got heavily involved 8-10 years ago.” IOC (U) links the international activities of the college to the “college’s reputation for being ruthlessly entrepreneurial.” The IOC stated that in some ways the international activities grew out of an early college initiative to bring education to Canadians. The initiative, known as Mobile Intensive Learning Experience (MOBILE), involved the college taking people on buses for learning experiences, and these trips eventually became international. According to the CP (U), the college was involved with CIDA/ACCC projects “years ago,” but no longer works with these organizations.

Both the IOC (U) and the CP (U) cited the significant impact the current college president has had on the evolution of international activities at the college. The IOC stated that the major commitment to expand international activities made by the President in 1992 is the main reason behind the creation and success of the international office. When interviewed, the President acknowledged that when

s/he took over as President in 1992 s/he recognized the importance of international activities. The CP (U) stated that s/he:

really pushed for international student recruitment and chose staff that shared this vision and created an international office. (This was) a strategic decision on the part of the President and staff was hand picked. We didn't know what we were doing when we started and we learned from our mistakes. The international activities were driven by the President's decision. Now it could sustain itself beyond the current President. It is the future.

According to CP (U), international student recruitment and export has evolved at the college to the point where a wholly owned subsidiary company of College U has been incorporated in order to handle international work.

The international activities of College S evolved in a slightly different way than they did at the other colleges. Though many of the early projects at the college were similar to projects at the other colleges in that they were CIDA funded and brokered through CBIE and ACCC, the origins of international activities at College S actually pre-date the college. According to CP (S) and IOC (S), when the college was founded in 1967 an existing provincial school of mining and an institute of technology were integrated into College S. The school of mining was already involved in international student recruitment and international projects. These activities were due to the international nature of the mining business and the fact that "Canadian mining companies involved in other countries needed a trained local workforce." These international activities continued after the integration of the

school of mining into the college. It was these existing programs which formed the basis of the college's international activities.

The IOC (S) stated that in 1989, as the result of an initiative by the college president at the time, an international office was started. Most of the projects were brokered through CIDA/ACCC and included a four year CIDA funded project in Zimbabwe which involved College S in the design and building of a school of mines in that country. According to IOC (S), succeeding college presidents have not been as committed to international projects and participation in student recruitment and educational export has significantly slowed down. The IOC (S) stated that in his/her opinion the current President "has no interest in international activities, and is not willing to put any money into it." Interestingly, shortly after I conducted the interviews with the college president and international office chairperson, the international office was eliminated.

## **Section 2: Motivation to Participate in International Activities**

### **a) Positive Impacts of International Activities**

When college presidents and international office chairpersons were asked to explain why their colleges participate in international export and recruitment, and how they

see these activities fitting into the overall college missions, almost all of them gave identical answers. The respondents cited the positive outcomes of bringing foreign cultures into the college and exposing students, faculty and staff to new ideas and international perspectives. IOC (M) stated that:

working in these developing countries is an excellent eye opener. We should be helping these countries - there is a moral obligation. (These experiences) change faculty and are a growth opportunity, this transfers into the local classroom. The faculty talk about their experiences and use them in the classroom. The college can't ignore peoples' needs. These countries want and need College M's experience and expertise.

The CP (M) echoed the sentiments of the IOC (M) and stated that international activities are exciting for the faculty and the institution and contribute to a positive and happy college environment. The president also mentioned that these international activities help to raise the profile of the college both internationally and domestically. CP (M) believes that the inclusion of international students at the college helps to break down racial and cultural barriers and international work makes faculty better at dealing with a multicultural local student population. CP (M) believes that international activities fit into the college mission in terms of the opportunity it provides for faculty development and the fact that it gives the college the opportunity to aid the developing world.

CP (X) referred to the important need to prepare students for a global economy as a major motivating factor for including educational export and recruitment activities in the college mission. CP (X) stated that it is:

part of the mission to prepare people for the global economy. People need to understand the impact of international trade and be sensitive to the culture and language of others.

CP (X) also stated that the international projects have an impact on the community surrounding the college who have supported the humanitarian efforts undertaken by the college in countries such as Nicaragua. CP (X) noted that one of the most positive benefits of the college's international activities was that they "clearly signal that the institution is sensitive to diversity in all its aspects and tells the community that racial and cultural differences are valued. This is an important part of the social mandate of the colleges."

CP (W) states that international activities are an integral part of the college mission. However, the IOC (W) notes that international activities are not part of the college's mission statement. Despite its omission from the college mission statement, CP (W) feels that there is almost an expectation that colleges are involved in international activities. These activities give great prestige to the college and it "looks good that the college is seen as an international player. The college can use its links and knowledge to help business to work in foreign countries." CP (W) outlined four major purposes for international activities:

1. Broaden the horizons of local students and staff by having an international presence on the campus.
2. Establish opportunities for students and staff to travel overseas.
3. Create global citizens and get students to think about how they can assist in the world.
4. Revenue generating possibilities.



CP (W) was very quick to point out that international activities are not seen as a profit centre, and indeed the “real goal is to break even, they are basically enrichment activities.” Like the president of College X, CP (W) commented on the impact that international activities can have on the surrounding community. CP (W) described the community surrounding the college as very homogeneous and noted that the college’s international activities have a positive impact by making the community more diverse. The IOC (W) mentioned that the international students billeted with local families have forged long-lasting friendships in the local community, and both local students at the college and members of the surrounding community have had their eyes opened to the rest of the world.

College S is located in a rural, northern Ontario community. Both CP (S) and IOC (S) noted the importance of introducing students in a rather isolated community to people from other parts of the world. The international activities of the college are integrated into the college mission statement which acknowledges that globalization is making a huge impact on all aspects of Canadian life. According to the IOC, “College S is adapting to fulfill this global orientation. It is a policy of College S to adapt to a global orientation. International activities fit into this policy. The CP and IOC stated that international activities enhance the college’s reputation, provide professional development opportunities for faculty and staff, create overseas learning and employment opportunities for local students, and occasionally provide revenue for College S.

## **b) Financial motivation to participate in international activities**

Both the CP and IOC of College U view international activities as being fundamental to the mission of the college. College U sees its mission as “providing education and training so students can meet demands of a global community. Students are being trained for jobs anywhere in the world” (IOC U). CP (U) pointed out that the recruitment of international students is not only good for the college, but is also good for the country:

I have a fundamental belief that the friends you make during your education are your friends for life. The friendships between Ontario students and international students will pay significant dividends for Canada. Students who have studied at College U and gone home to their own country to work have hired Ontario students to work for them. These programs creating lasting links and global business opportunities for Canada.

All of the interviewees referred to the potential financial benefits of international activities.

The interviewees made reference to the fact that the revenue generating potential of educational export and recruitment motivated the college to participate in these activities. However, all interviewees were quick to point out that revenue generation was not the sole or even the most important factor motivating educational export and recruitment. CP (X) stated that the money that is generated from international students helps make up the shortfall in government funding and therefore helps local students. IOC (W) stated that the international office has to

view the activities as revenue generators, but at the same time hopes the projects have a positive impact on the college as a whole. The president of College W stated that "revenue generation is really a secondary consideration, the college needs to be fiscally responsible, but revenue generation is not the prime motivation." The president of College M made a similar point when he stated that "revenue generation is desperately needed by the college, however they do not want to make the primary focus of the activities to make money." Respondents pointed out that the recruitment of international students in no way impacted on the enrollment opportunities available to local students as no local student would be denied a place so that an international student could be enrolled.

CP (U) expressed the view that "providing education to the world is an emerging mandate." IOC (U) was quick emphasize that the revenue generating aspect of international activities was very important and they were not a "charitable organization." For the most part however, most of the interviewees stressed that while revenue was important to them, the goals of professional development, enriching the college community and preparing local students for a global economy were equally or more important motivating factors for participation in international activities.

In order to assess how important the revenue generating aspects of international activities are to international office chairpersons, the IOCs were asked whether or

not they agreed with the statement that “the purpose of international activities is financial rather than educational.” The IOCs were then asked if the international activities at their college were making major “financial contributions to the college that the college cannot do without in the absence of increased government funding.” All four of the IOCs stated that the purpose of international activities is financial rather than educational. However, all of the IOCs were emphatic that the “other” educational benefits of international activities were also very important. Despite the importance that the IOCs attached to revenue generation, with the exception of IOC (U) all of the IOCs stated that the international activities of their colleges were not making major financial contributions to the college, and in some cases were not making very significant contributions at all. The fact that international activities are not making major financial contributions to the colleges was confirmed by the college presidents. With the exception of CP (U), all of the CPs interviewed stated that international activities did not generate much revenue, and CP (M) warned that many colleges falsely inflate their college’s international revenues in order to create an illusion that the college is highly successful in the international arena.

College U provides an interesting contrast to the other colleges as both the CP and IOC are adamant that international activities are a business for the college and generate significant amounts of revenue. In fact, College U reported revenue from international activities which was ten times the average revenue reported by the other colleges. College U presents a special case as international education is clearly

a business at the college. College U is the largest college in the province and is located in a urban setting which puts it in the position to aggressively pursue international revenue generating activities. IOC and CP of College U acknowledge that the revenue generating potential of international activities are of primary importance to the collage. However, they are both careful to stress that there are “other” important reasons they engage in international activities such as professional development for staff and faculty and cultural experiences for students.

There is a clear contradiction regarding how important revenue generation is in motivating the CAATs to participate in international activities. The college presidents and international office chairpersons state that the college participates in international activities for the educational benefits, while at the same time the IOCs state that the primary purpose of the international activities is financial. The reason for this contradiction may be the fact that many international offices are self-funding, therefore in order to exist, they must generate revenue. If the primary focus is financial, the fact that the IOCs and CPs state that the international activities only make minor financial contributions to the colleges is quite remarkable. This fact may be seen as a contradiction of the IOCs statement that the primary focus is financial, or it may simply mean that most colleges are not successful in achieving their financial objectives. The myriad of issues surrounding the financial aspects of international activities will be explored further in this chapter.

### c) Negative Impacts of International Activities

Interview respondents were quick to point out what they perceived to be the positive benefits of international activities. When asked if there were any negative consequences of international activities, most respondents replied that the positive aspects far outweigh any negative impacts. Respondents did however outline a few negative aspects of international activities. One negative impact which was cited by four of the respondents is that international activities can be misunderstood by the college community. IOC (U) stated that:

people don't understand what they are doing...people in the community who believe that international students deprive local students of seats, the truth is that the dollars from international are providing seats for local students and lets the college offer great programs.

This misunderstanding of international activities and the perception that international students take seats away from local students and drain college resources is not confined to College U. IOC (W) stated that in years of fiscal restraint at the college, members of the college community may see international activities as a drain of college resources, not realizing that these activities are self-funded. CP (W) described dealing with the misunderstanding as "fighting a battle," and lamented the fact that it takes time and resources to deal with prejudices and confusion in the college community over why "the college wants to serve people in Asia." Like College U, College W has found itself that there is a controversy over enrollment spaces in the college and a fear among some members

of the college community that spots that should be for local students are being sold to international students. CP (W) stated that while this misunderstanding can be frustrating, it is not necessarily a bad thing that the issue of racism comes out into the open as it can be a learning experience for the college.

Two college presidents stated that international activities can on occasion cause some jealousy among staff and faculty member. CP (X) stated that:

international is very misunderstood and often equated with people going on trips. People often have difficulty connecting international office activities with its contribution to the college. There is a need to make the value of international activities known to the college community.

CP (M) also referred to the problems that can occur when it comes time to send faculty and staff overseas to participate in a project:

It is a chicken and egg problem. There is a need to send people who understand and can cope with the cultural differences. There is a tendency to send the same people and other faculty can become jealous. Teaching faculty in certain faculties don't get much of a chance. Internal competition for jobs can be a problem.

The negative impacts of international education do not appear to be particularly serious and generally are internal to the college. However, CP (U) did outline one negative of international activities which affects all of the colleges. According to CP (U):

there is a danger in international that if you don't do it right you ruin your own reputation and the reputation of the province and country. A negative profile of the institution and country could develop. A relationship with someone who is less than credible, poor business practices and not delivering good quality can be big mistakes. I have

seen this happen with other institutions, though it has not happened with College U.

The IOCs and CPs outline rather minor negative impacts of international activities. Avoiding misunderstanding in the college community and maintaining a good international reputation are the two most serious issues that colleges face. It seems clear that the respondents perceive the benefits of international activities to far outweigh any possible negative consequences.

### **Section Three: Competition and Coordination among the CAATs and the role of Government, ACCC and CBIE in College International Activities**

#### **a) Colleges Acting as Businesses**

In order to further explore how college presidents and international office chairpersons view the international activities of their colleges, they were asked if they believe that colleges are beginning to act as businesses in the international marketplace and if they see any problems with such behaviour.

The response to this question was fairly uniform, most CPs and IOCs feel that colleges are acting as businesses, and do not see any major problems with this type of behaviour. Many of the interviewees pointed out that colleges have been forced to act more “business like” in order to survive. CP (X) stated that:

college are starting to act more business like and they need to because of the huge erosion in the past decade of funding for colleges. This



lack of funding has forced colleges to find a way to get dollars to prop up the colleges.

CP (S) emphasized the fact that colleges have been encouraged to act as businesses within Ontario and seek partnerships with the private sector and acting as a business internationally is just an extension of this behaviour. IOC (M) agreed that:

Colleges are beginning to act as businesses, they don't receive the money to develop projects and need to generate money to develop projects. There is a lot of work without a huge infrastructure behind them. There is more work than there is time to do it and there is an expectation that the office is self-sufficient.

The president of College M stated that colleges are acting as businesses because they see the international arena as a source of funding to make up the shortfall in funding at the colleges. However, the president was quick to point out that many colleges are inflating what they are doing for publicity purposes. CP (M) emphasized that College M is "not a business, but an educational institution that is trying to be more business like in order to supplement the dollars that "are received from the taxpayer." CP (M) stressed that "College M strives to maintain our standards and stand by our quality, we want to meet the needs of the client."

Two interviewees stated that it is essential for colleges to act as businesses if they want to be successful in their international activities. IOC (W) stated that the colleges which are not treating international activities as a business are not doing very much international work. The president of College U stated that "all colleges should be acting as businesses, but not necessarily all colleges are acting that way.

Colleges that aren't acting as businesses are not successful." CP (U) went on to state that colleges that do not act in a businesslike manner can "create a mess" making it difficult for other colleges to do business. Gerry Brown, President of the Association of Canadian Community Colleges emphasized the need for colleges to act as business and argued that not only are colleges acting as businesses, they are big business. Brown pointed out that:

there is a perception that colleges are totally academic, but in reality they are very involved in the private sector and need to have a business mentality. The colleges need to survive and become entrepreneurial so academic functions can be maintained.

Not all interviewees believed that it is healthy for colleges to act as businesses. The president of College W expressed concern that there is a danger that college leadership may become too focussed and dependent on the international monies. Jennifer Humphries of the Canadian Bureau of International Education cautioned that if colleges act as businesses they must act in a good, positive and ethical way, treat international students well, support them and orientate them to life in Canada. According to Humphries, "if colleges don't perform these functions while acting as businesses, problems will arise." CP (W) expressed further concern that by acting as businesses, colleges are forced to compete with each other and this competition can be problematic and pointed out that the larger colleges are taking all of the work and shutting smaller colleges out of the business.

Other interviewees did not express the same level of concern regarding the competition between colleges for international projects. Both the IOC and CP at College U stated that the competition between colleges is healthy and IOC (U) stated that College U actually enjoys the competition and the opportunity to act in an entrepreneurial manner. IOC (W) stated that the colleges are not really “competing” as each college has its own strengths which it brings to international activities. IOC (M) agreed that competition between colleges was not a significant problem and pointed out that there is often quite a bit of cooperation between colleges and they help each other with big international projects. According to IOC (M) the colleges “don’t hate each other and there is both cooperation and competition and support for each other.” IOC (W) echoed these sentiments and stated that there has been some very good collaborations between the colleges.

IOC (W), IOC (M) and CP (S) stated that there is a need for better coordination among the CAATs for international activities. IOC (M) noted that the CAATs’ efforts to work together at the provincial level were largely unsuccessful as they relied on volunteers and did not receive funding support from the government. IOC (W) affirmed the need for colleges to coordinate and expressed concern that colleges are missing out on “a lot of business because they are not presenting themselves as a united whole.” IOC (W) attributes the difficulties in fostering cooperation and coordination among the CAATs for international activities to the fact that the CAATs are all at different stages in their international activities.

According to IOC (W) who has been the chairperson of the Ontario Colleges International Committee (OCIC), the attempt to organize the colleges has been a slow process and has been stalled by the fact that there has been a great deal of difficulty in coming to a decision regarding what exactly the colleges want to market. IOC (W) pointed out that it has been very hard for the colleges to establish common ground in the area of international activities. The difficulty in creating a coordinating body among the colleges for international activities may be explained by the attitude expressed by IOC (U) who was adamant about not wanting more coordination and cooperation. According to IOC (U), the "other colleges are competitors." IOC (U) asks why should College U share with its competitors strategic information that it has spent a great deal of money collecting? This statement may go a long way in explaining why there is a lack of coordination among colleges for international activities.

#### **b) Role of the Federal and Provincial Government in International Activities**

The lack of formal coordination between colleges for international activities is evident. In order to further explore the coordination (or lack thereof) of the international activities of the CAATs, college presidents and international office chairpersons were asked to share their opinions on what role the provincial and federal governments should have in respect to these activities. Almost all

interviewees called for both levels of government to take a much more active role in international activities.

Interviewees felt that the provincial government should help to promote Ontario education internationally. IOC (W) stated

that the provincial government should be doing much more than what it has been. Education is a provincial mandate and Ontario needs to be marketing itself internationally. I would like the provincial government to have a supportive marketing role. In general, the Canadian provinces where the provincial government is more involved in international are more successful. The Ontario government has not been involved.

These sentiments were echoed by CP (X) who stated that:

Some provinces strongly support international. This is very valuable for marketing provincial institutions and education. International education should be part of an educational strategic plan and vision for the province. It should be part of the province's education plan. There is a role for strong, provincial leadership. Four years ago the Province changed the international fees process and that act provided a great deal of freedom for institutions in terms of recruitment and was a very important move on the part of the Provincial Government.

The international office chairperson of College S suggested that the provincial government should:

establish an international secretariat similar to what they have in British Columbia and Alberta. OCIC is trying hard for this but have not been successful. There should be an international office for the whole province dealing with international education. There needs to be a strong mandate from the provincial and federal governments and a strategy to promote international education.

A marketing and promotional role for the provincial government in the area of education was also advocated by the presidents of College S and College W as well

as the international office chairperson at College U. Jennifer Humphries of CBIE stressed that the province has to play an active role in the marketing of education internationally and be a voice for the institutions. CP (W) and IOC (U) praised the efforts of the provincial government to include the colleges on the international trade missions. However, CP (M) pointed out that the colleges have to pay their own way on the trade missions which is very expensive and the trade missions are very time consuming. This president did concede that the trade missions have been helpful in raising the college's international profile.

IOC (U) pointed out that College U has worked very hard at establishing a good working relationship with the provincial government and is happy with this relationship. Interestingly, the president of College U stated that he believes that the college does not need the government's help and in fact the college is helping the government in terms of economic development. CP (U) does not see a marketing role for the provincial government and stressed that the institutions need to do more on their own. CP (M) stated that the provincial role should be to help colleges form links with Canadian companies doing overseas business. IOC (M) expressed frustration that while the colleges are helping the province economically, the province is not helping the colleges internationally. IOC (M) stressed that the provincial government is keen to learn what the colleges are doing internationally, but won't provide money to help the colleges of Canada develop an international

profile. The majority of interviewees envisioned the provincial government playing a much larger promotion and marketing role than it currently does.

Though education is a provincial mandate, IOCs and CPs had many suggestions of the type of role the federal government could play with respect to international educational export and recruitment. Many of the suggestions stressed very practical things that the federal government could do to facilitate the colleges' international activities. Almost every interviewee stressed the need for the federal government to improve immigration regulations regarding student visas. IOC (U) pointed out the irony of colleges being included on federal trade missions only to find that their student recruitment efforts are thwarted by unwieldy federal immigration regulations. One IOC stated that his college has been very careful to ensure that immigration regulations are observed and abided by and have had no incidents of students mis-using their visa privileges. Despite this good record however, immigration regulations are still very rigid and don't appear to recognize the negative impact they can have on student recruitment efforts.

Several interviewees stated that the federal government could use existing resources such as embassies more efficiently in order to promote Canadian education internationally. CP (M), CP (W), CP (X) and IOC (W) all stated that while the federal trade missions are useful and have provided some excellent opportunities, they are very expensive, and therefore not all that practical. Though many

interviewees feel that the federal government recognizes the value of Canadian education as a component of international trade and foreign policy, it could do more to promote Canadian education. CP (W) felt that the Canadian embassies abroad could be made more available to the colleges, and that the federal government should help the colleges build relationships with other countries. IOC (W) stated that the federal government could be useful in promoting education in Canada in a “general sense.” CP (X) offered the suggestion that while promoting Canada internationally, the federal government should promote Canadian education and link education to international business partnerships. CP (X) further suggested that the federal government should link Canadian colleges with Canadian employers abroad to provide on site education and training. This type of advocacy and marketing role for the federal government was advocated by all interviewees.

IOC (M) pointed out that the lack of a federal Minister of Education who could deal with their counterparts in foreign countries was a significant problem. Jennifer Humphries of CBIE pointed out that:

Australia has marketed themselves really well. Canada is seen as the poor cousin to the United States. There is no brand name recognition for Canadian institutions, so it is needed for the whole country. The Federal government will have to take a lead role in representing Canada abroad and promoting everyone. The Department of Foreign Affairs needs to clarify what “third pillar” means and put money and effort into supporting it. Maybe there is a need for a marketing kit for Canadian Immigration and a team in foreign affairs.



The lack of a federal international education policy and coordination between the provinces for international activities was seen by IOC (S) as a serious problem. IOC (S) pointed out that the federal government has “not followed up on their statements about education as product for trade and needs to help the colleges.” There was also criticism of the federal government’s existing initiatives to promote Canadian education. CP (U) was very critical of the Canadian Education Centres (CEC) which receive some funding support from the federal government. CP (U) stated that the CECs “basically contain a bunch of brochures written in English (about different institutions) and no one who works there knows what they are talking about.” Despite that fact that the CECs have shortcomings, IOC (M) was critical of the fact that the federal government is withdrawing funding from the centres which have been helpful to College M in recruiting students.

Two interviewees commented on a particular model for the promotion of international educational activities that the federal government could adopt. According to IOC (S), Australia has created a very successful international education mandate. IOC (S) pointed out that the Australian educational system has made a major commitment to international education and has worked really hard in their embassies to facilitate international education.

The Australians have made changes in their curriculum and policies and as a result are becoming a very popular destination for foreign students. Ontario and Canada needs a secretariat so it can also compete. Canada needs to give direction to marketing education internationally and put some money into a secretariat that can help all

of the colleges. Canada should follow the Australian model. Australians really roll out the red carpet for international students.

The president of College U also acknowledged the outstanding job Australia has done in promoting its educational system, but is careful to point out that the Australian government has a very “different mandate in respect to international education and has given the educational system tons of support.” CP (U) points out that educational institutions in Australia have been told that “they must generate international revenue.” While CP (U) doesn’t believe that the Australian model should be adopted by Canada, he does suggest that some elements of the model, such as the 24 hour Australian immigration application process, versus the 12 month Canadian immigration processing, and the government support for international education should be carefully considered.

**c) The Role of the Association of Community Colleges Canada (ACCC) and the Canadian Bureau of International Education (CBIE) in International Activities**

Apart from the provincial and federal governments, there are two other bodies that play a role in the international activities of the CAATs. These organizations are the Canadian Bureau of International Education (CBIE) and the Association of Community Colleges Canada (ACCC). The study of Canada’s public colleges and postsecondary technical institutions involvement in international education, published by Jacques Hurabielle in 1998 reported discontent with ACCC and CBIE on the part of a few college presidents and international office chairpersons.

Interviewees in this study were told that discontentment had been revealed in Hurabielle's study and were asked to comment on what role they believe ACCC and CBIE should play in college international activities.

A number of interviewees affirmed that there was some discontentment with these organizations. Most of the criticism of ACCC focused on the process by which ACCC brokers international projects, and the fees charged by ACCC for their services. Several respondents criticized the high administrative overhead and the bureaucracy at ACCC. One IOC stated that:

though the projects brokered by ACCC are quite good, they end up costing the college money. The overhead for the project that is allotted to the college from ACCC is too low. There is a big expectation from ACCC that there will be a big [in kind] contribution on the part of the college but the college can not afford this. ACCC projects are not profitable and ACCC management fees are too high.

The criticism of ACCC was echoed by a president who stated that ACCC projects are "too much work for very small financial returns." This president revealed that his college has not worked with ACCC for several years because of these problems. The president went on to criticize what he sees as the "political agenda of ACCC," and worries that ACCC has captured all of the CIDA projects. This president was critical of the fact that ACCC has given projects to colleges that don't have the same level of expertise as his college. The president stated that while projects don't have to make money, colleges shouldn't have to subsidize projects.

Another college also expressed frustration with ACCC. The president stated that while their college is small and dependent on ACCC brokering projects for them, ACCC is taking a big cut of project dollars. The IOC of one college stated that ACCC projects are:

very hard to get, and if you get one there is not much of a financial gain as ACCC has its own staff and costs which eats up the project funding. It is too time consuming to apply for the projects.

High management fees and a cumbersome application process for projects cause another IOC to ask: "who is ACCC working for? Sometimes ACCC acts as if the colleges are working for them. It is not worth the while to apply for projects." One president who is also a board member of ACCC, acknowledges the criticism of the organization:

Some colleges are very concerned about the profit margin that accrued to the colleges. They are concerned that ACCC is competing with colleges for projects. ACCC's argument is that they are doing international in order to raise money to run the national organization. This argument did not satisfy complainants. In some cases, colleges are paying for ACCC projects.

This president goes on to point out that ACCC is in the process of re-organizing and refocusing in order to address these concerns.

Not all interviewees are critical of ACCC. One president points out that ACCC has worked hard and built a good reputation for Canada. Another president made the case that in the past:

the colleges needed ACCC desperately. ACCC has done good work in the past and has proven to be a good gatekeeper. However most of

the big colleges can make their own contacts now. There was a time when the colleges needed ACCC and many colleges still need it. There are still many colleges happy to work on ACCC projects.

While one president agreed that ACCC is valuable for small colleges, he/she stated that:

My college is competing with ACCC for projects and ACCC is skimming off the top of the funding pot. ACCC is spreading the wealth but this hurts the strongest colleges as they are seen by ACCC to be doing well, therefore it is hardly worth applying for projects. ACCC is a dinosaur, project application, implementation and follow-up is too cumbersome a process. ACCC tries to cut in on deals which is unethical behaviour.

While many of the interviewees were very specific in their criticisms of ACCC, most of them did not suggest a concrete example of what type of role the organization might play. The implication was that ACCC needs to overhaul its existing organization and eradicate some of the problems identified by the colleges. One IOC mentioned that ACCC can be useful as a representative of colleges at the federal level. Only one president had a concrete vision of an appropriate role for ACCC in international education and suggested that ACCC should promote Canadian education generally on a non-partisan basis and tell the world that Canadian education is a great deal.

Some of the same criticisms leveled at ACCC were also directed towards CBIE. One president stated that his college had ceased to be a member of CBIE because there are no benefits to being a member as CBIE is very university focused and does not

do anything for the colleges. The IOC at the same college stated that once CBIE stopped doing major projects geared towards the colleges it became less relevant to the college and they pulled out of the organization in the early 1990s. According to another president, his college has very little involvement with CBIE and the IOC of the college stated that he/she questions whether or not the high yearly membership fee of \$1150 is worth it as CBIE "is not leading edge, and colleges can make their own international contacts." The IOC at another college stated that while his college is a member of CBIE and goes to the annual conference, it is difficult to point to anything that CBIE had done for the college in the past ten years. According to another IOC the discontentment with CBIE may stem from the fact that CBIE:

promotes universities over colleges, so some colleges have withdrawn their membership. CBIE does not do much for the colleges. The scholarship plan is geared towards university students and projects are given more often to universities than to colleges.

It appears that, like ACCC, CBIE may no longer serve the needs of colleges the way it once did. One president points out that CBIE was once desperately needed by the colleges and was very useful in the realm of student recruitment, but colleges are doing much of the recruitment work on their own now.

The President of ACCC, Gerry Brown and Jennifer Humphries, a Program Director at CBIE were given the opportunity to respond to the criticisms leveled at their organizations by members of the college community.

Both Gerry Brown and Jennifer Humphries were asked to describe the role that their respective organization plays in student recruitment and educational export at the CAATs. Mr. Brown stated that ACCC has a very small role in international student recruitment. Because of the expense of recruitment activities, it is left to the individual institutions to undertake their own recruitment activities. Mr. Brown described that it is the role of ACCC to:

act as the national and international voice of the Canadian college system and promote the system. ACCC does not recruit individual students. However, ACCC does market the college system to embassies and ambassadors.

Mr. Brown indicated that ACCC plays a much larger role in education export and brokers many international project opportunities on behalf of the Canadian International Development Agency (CIDA). Mr. Brown described the Canadian College Partnership Program (CCPP) which is designed to enable institutions to develop international activities. According to Mr. Brown:

CCPP has given ACCC a high international profile and ACCC can position the whole college system then entertain bids and sub-contract projects to colleges. This gives a big organization such as the World Bank one organization to deal with and gives all of the institutions credibility. The CCPP program has enabled institutions to develop international capacity. Some colleges have now gotten enough experience that they can do projects on their own.

Mr. Brown stressed the strong advocacy role played by ACCC and pointed to its success in securing international projects for member colleges.

Jennifer Humphries of CBIE described the role of CBIE in international student recruitment at the colleges as the "generic promotion of education in Canada." According to Ms. Humphries, CBIE is not oriented towards individual student recruitment, but does information counseling for international students and produces brochures, web-sites and an e-mail list to give potential students a sense of life in Canada. The role of CBIE in educational export is limited to making contact with governments of other countries in order to facilitate the training of large groups of students. Ms. Humphries noted that CBIE used to do more work related to colleges, but presently, international students are more interested in M.A. and Ph.D. programs. Ms. Humphries stated that CBIE is working to develop projects for the colleges and has built a business climate for Canadian education and tries not to compete with member colleges.

When asked to respond to the criticisms made by some college presidents and international office chairpersons regarding management fees and competition, both Jennifer Humphries and Gerry Brown made some interesting comments. Ms. Humphries stressed that CBIE does not compete with member colleges, but works in an advocacy role to improve immigration policies and raise the Canadian education profile. Ms. Humphries pointed out that CBIE does not "put money into the coffers of member institutions" and thus if a "college does not get directly involved in a project, they don't see what the benefit is, which can lead to criticism of CBIE." Ms. Humphries acknowledged that on occasion CBIE competes with



ACCC for projects, but for the most part the two organizations try to work in such a way that they facilitate each other. Ms. Humphries stressed that it is important for Canada to have a united front as there is already so much confusion internationally about “who” the official voice of Canadian education is.

Gerry Brown appeared to be very familiar with some of the criticisms of ACCC. Like Ms. Humphries, Mr. Brown stressed that ACCC backs out of the bidding process if they find out one of their member colleges is bidding on the same international project. However, he pointed out that ACCC does not always know if one of their members is bidding against them. Colleges that bid against ACCC for a project and then don't get the project blame ACCC for their misfortune. Mr. Brown stressed that there is a bit of a “perception myth” regarding the CCPP process. Mr. Brown stated that many colleges apply for international projects and obviously not everyone will be selected to participate. ACCC demands high quality proposals for projects and, when people don't get these projects, there can be “sore losers.” Mr. Brown noted that in order to alleviate these tensions, ACCC has restructured the decision making process for CCPPs and made it an open, transparent, fair, peer judgement process, which will afford a college the opportunity to find out why it didn't get a project.

In regard to accusations of high management fees, Mr. Brown pointed out that ACCC has expenses and overhead to cover. The fact that ACCC gives out over

eight million dollars a year in project monies necessitates a large coordination network which is expensive to maintain. Project accountability rests with ACCC and the “rule is that ACCC takes what they need to operate and the rest goes to the institutions delivering the projects.” Ms. Humphries stated that membership fees for CBIE are very low, and in return colleges receive strong international representation.

Both CBIE and ACCC responded quite specifically to some of the criticisms made by college presidents and international office chairpersons, and it is clear there is some tension and confusion regarding the role of these organizations. However, it appears that both organizations have a genuine desire to work cooperatively with their members in order to ensure the success of international education activities. The attempts by ACCC to improve the CCPP decision making process may prove to ease some of the tensions between colleges and ACCC.

#### **Section 4: Organization of International Activities**

##### **a) Reporting structure of the International Office**

In order to determine how the colleges organize international activities, the interviewees were asked where in the college organizational structure international activities have been placed, and why they have been placed there. At College U and

College M, the chairperson of the international office reports to the president of the college. According to IOC (M) the IOC reports to the president because the:

President has a very strong interest in international and is very supportive. The president will back up the international office and will meet with international delegations. The dean of planning and international reports directly to the president of the college.

According to the president of College M, he/she has done a great deal of international work and it makes sense that he/she has a close involvement with the international office. However, CP (M) pointed out that he/she does not want to do all of the international travelling, but wants to show that international is an important aspect of the college and as a result has made sure that the people involved in international activities have "a real depth of experience, know the college and have credibility." At College U, the chairperson of international activities also reports directly to the president of the college. The current head of international also has responsibility for human resources and student services, but the position is being split so that the human resources component will be given to someone else. According to IOC (U), the IOC reports directly to the president because international is very important to the president and to the board of the college as "it is worth a lot of money."

Colleges X and W reported that the international activities fall into the purview of the vice-president academic. According to CP (X), the v.p. academic is very interested in international activities thus it makes sense that the international office

reports to him/her. According to CP (X) the success of international activities is dependent on:

whether or not international activities are supported by the college president and board, and by documents such as the mission statement and strategic plan. The success of international is very dependent on the support of the board, the president, senior management and personnel throughout the college. (These elements) are more important than where in the organizational structure international is placed.

The international office at College W also reports to the vice-president academic. According to IOC (W), this structure was established after a "complete reorganization of the college when they tried to bring together all of the revenue generating departments." IOC (W) noted that the international office reports to both the vice-president academic and the college president. IOC (W) stated that at College W, international activities are not easily identifiable, so recruitment, student counselling and contract work are all found in the same office, making it difficult to determine where international fits at the college.

College S provided an alternative picture of how international activities may be positioned within a college. According to the college president, responsibility for international activities resides with the executive director of community development and training and in the past the college president had been directly involved in international. However, the current president does not travel internationally and the figure head role of the president in international activities has diminished. According to the IOC (S) international activities have not been

given much importance in recent times as the college has experienced funding shortages and there has been a high turnover of presidents. These problems have resulted in international activities not being given an important place in the organizational structure of the college and has forced the international office to compete with other units for funding support. CP (S) explained the college is currently restructuring its international activities as it doesn't believe that full-time salary dollars should be spent on international activities. The college has decided to include international recruitment in the mandate of the recruiting officer responsible for Canadian recruitment and manage projects on a project by project basis and not use a full time staff member to do this. The reorganization and effective elimination of an international office at College S is an interesting phenomenon and one could argue that the fact that the college is very small and located in a relatively remote part of the province has limited its ability to successfully participate in international activities.

#### **b) Faculty and Staff Participation in International Activities**

College presidents and international office chairpersons were asked to comment on the fact that much of the literature regarding recruitment and export suggests that these activities are often dependent on the efforts and commitment of a few key faculty and staff members. All of the interviewees with the exception of CP (S) who stated that "it is the philosophy of the college to encourage participation in

international activities from a broad sector of the college community,” agreed that the efforts of a few key people were often instrumental to the success of international activities. IOC (U) agreed that a core group of people who are interested and committed to international activities are needed, and noted that not all of the people in the college are interested in international. CP (M) stated that some people are just not interested in international activities and College M is working on developing its pool of people. IOC (M) noted that there is a core group of people that is in demand for international projects, but broader projects attract a broader faculty base.

CP (W) and IOC (W) agreed that “you have to have your champions,” though IOC (W) stated that contract projects are secured in a number of ways and though some are dependent on the efforts of a few faculty and staff members, others are a result of the efforts of the international office. CP (W) pointed out that because international activities at College W had been dependent on a few key people who did an excellent job, when these people left it created a void.

The administrative staff at College W were the promoters of international and now that there are fewer administrators to pursue proposals there is a dip in international activities. The challenge now is to get more international interest and experience among the staff. The downsizing of administration has impacted international and tough economic times have resulted in small colleges getting out of international and some large colleges going full speed ahead.

CP (X) stated that:

The success of projects is often dependent on having a champion who has the energy, drive and ingenuity to make projects work. These champions help move the college's international activities in a certain way and as these personalities change, new areas are found. You need good people to represent the college internationally who are warm, patient understanding and culturally sensitive.

CP (U) also agreed that international activities are dependent on key people and expressed great pride in the excellent job done by the international staff who are organized on a "desk basis" with responsibility for student recruitment and business development in a particular part of the world. CP (U) also praised the efforts of dedicated student services personnel who work very hard to support international students. All interviewees were quick to praise the efforts of international office staff and the "champions" of international activities at their colleges.

The selection of faculty and staff to participate in international projects was described by most interviewees as a process which takes into account the needs of the client and the skills of the faculty and staff members. According to IOC (M), the needs of the client are assessed and then matched with the expertise of college staff and faculty. Often an advertisement is placed in the college newsletter describing the international project and asking for applications. The applicants are then interviewed. Applicants are assessed on the basis of their expertise in the area, whether or not they will be culturally sensitive to the needs of international hosts and trainees, whether or not they will be good representatives of the college and

Canada, and whether or not they are flexible. The faculty member must get the support of his/her supervisor in order to participate in the project and the international office pays the faculty member's replacement salary to the department. Often, the department finds it can hire a replacement instructor at a lower wage, or cover the teaching by redistributing the workload, and thus turn a small profit for the department. Other colleges select faculty members to participate in projects in much the same way.

College U selects participants on the basis of whether or not they have successfully participated in a project in the past and their level of expertise in the project area. The positions are not posted, and the international office directly approaches faculty and staff that they feel are appropriate for the position. According to IOC (U), many faculty and staff members are not interested in these projects and do not want to go to some of the countries where the projects are located, therefore it makes more sense to directly approach the people who are known to have an interest in and aptitude for international work. IOC (U) indicated that on occasion College U will hire people from outside of the college to deliver the export program. If it does not have the expertise in house, it will go outside to find the experts. College U was the only college that reported using non-college personnel from the private sector for international projects.



College W selects faculty and staff to participate in projects on the basis of their skills and the salary costs of the faculty are covered by the client. IOC (W) concedes that it can sometimes be difficult to find faculty and staff members to participate in projects, but for the most part instructors enjoy working with international personnel and trainees who are keen to learn. College S prefers to post the international positions in order to reduce resentment and envy that may occur if the position is simply assigned to an individual. However, if there is a particular person who is really well suited for the project, they are given the position automatically.

IOC (M) emphasized the need to be very careful in selecting personnel to participate in international projects and described an incident where a faculty member sent overseas openly questioned the values and culture of the country where he was a guest, creating great embarrassment for the college. All interviewees suggested that not everyone is suited to working overseas or locally with international students, and it is important to make faculty members aware of what the position will entail. As pointed out by several interviewees, it is crucial that the college protect its international reputation.

### **c) Recruitment and Export Methods**

The four international office chairpersons were asked to describe some of the methods that they use to recruit international students and secure educational export contracts. The IOCs reported a variety of methods for securing business, including attending international education fairs, placing college advertisements in foreign newspapers, advertising on the Internet, participation in Canadian Education Centres and the use of recruiting agents. Agents typically represent the college in a particular country and receive a finder's fee for students that they recruit for the college. College (U) pays the agent \$1000 per student if the student stays at the college beyond the first semester. According to IOC (S) the college has recently appointed approximately fifty agents in different countries in order to recruit international students. IOC (M) cautions that agents can "be tricky and risky and may ruin credibility of the college." IOC (M) states that the college is vigilant in protecting its credibility and "doesn't want to get hooked into a scam."

Though the four IOCs mentioned college attendance at educational fairs as a tool to recruit students, they noted that these fairs are not always the most effective tool. IOC (W) indicated that the international office participated in education fairs but it is very expensive to attend these fairs and it may be necessary to attend for several years before they generate any business, and, according to IOC (W), this approach can be difficult to sell to the administration. IOC (W) lamented that the college

participated in an expensive fair in Mexico and only managed to recruit one student.

All of the interviewees stressed the importance of personal contact and word of mouth advertisement to recruitment and export. According to IOC (M), the college is using its existing reputation to generate business and “doesn’t have to look for work, it is coming to the college.” IOC (M) stated that the college has built a strong reputation in Malaysia through its excellent work with two government ministries and “demonstrated respect for Malaysian culture and religion.” College M has built “a good relationship with Malaysia which has turned into a friendship.” This existing relationship provides ongoing export and recruitment opportunities for College M. IOC (U) stressed the important impact that College U’s word of mouth reputation has. According to IOC (U), international students who study at the college “spread the word” about the college when they return home. College U has 45, 000 alumni around the world who promote the reputation of the college. IOC (U) stated that the college has a full time employee in Brazil whose job it is to recruit students and develop export opportunities. College U also works with the international consulates to seek out business opportunities.

College W has also relied on its reputation to develop export contracts. One contract with Japan was the result of the efforts of a person working on behalf of College W in Japan. A second contract was the result of a College W graduate

teaching English in Japan who was asked by a work colleague to find a college that would accept international students. The student suggested his alma mater and a relationship was established. Like IOC (M), IOC (W) pointed out that the college benefits most from word of mouth recommendations, and satisfied customers who return to do business with the college. Clearly, the colleges use a variety of tools to recruit students and develop export contracts, and one of the most important tools is the reputation of the college and the personal relationships it fosters.

## **Section 5: Financial Aspects of Recruitment and Export**

### **a) Funding of the International Office**

Colleges S, U and X indicated that the international office was funded through central allocations from the college. IOC (S) stated that while the international office is currently funded through central allocations, that will change in the near future and no funding support will be provided. IOC (S) noted that the fixed international budget provided in the past has steadily decreased, and salaries for faculty members engaged in international projects are covered by project revenue. Though College X and College U fund their international office through central allocations, there is a clear expectation that these offices will generate a certain level of income. CP (U) pointed out that there is an acceptance of the fact that the international office will not become extremely profitable overnight. The college recognizes that it is

making a long term investment and will have to wait for it to develop. IOC (U) does not express the same level of “generosity” towards the international office. IOC (U) stated that despite the fact that the international office is funded through central allocations, he has a clear expectation that the college will get a return on its investment and the international office will not only cover its expenses but make a financial contribution to the college as well. The contribution made by the international office goes into the general college revenues. IOC (U) noted that most of the revenue is generated by international student recruitment, not contracts, and most students come from affluent families who can afford to pay the high tuition fees. The salary of faculty involved in export contracts is covered by contract revenue.

Two colleges indicated that the international office is self-funded. The expectation at College W is that the office will cover all of its own expenses and any additional revenues will be directed toward the general college revenues. The international office at College M is also self funded, however there is some money provided through central allocation for the recruiting of international students. In regard to export contracts, once the international office has paid all the expenses of the project, the surplus money is distributed to different departments, and the department where the faculty member for the project came from is usually a recipient of some of the monies. Once the international office has covered all of its expenses for the year out of the export project revenues, any surplus funds are

carried forward and used to seed new projects. The funds from international student tuitions go directly to central allocations and do not flow through the international office. The salaries of all international office staff, with the exception of the international recruitment officer, are covered by project revenues.

Though some colleges directly fund their international office from general revenues at the start of the fiscal year. There is a consistent expectation at all colleges that the international office will generate some revenues and these will flow back to the college. The interviewees were asked to elaborate on this expectation, and indicate whether or not the college set financial goals for international activities, and if so, what these goals are.

#### **b) Financial Goals of International Activities**

When asked if the college set financial goals for their international activities, three of the colleges indicated that their college did not set specific financial goals. CP (W) and IOC (W) explained that the international office operates on a break even model and is expected to contribute a small amount of money back to the college. However, because 1998 was a deficit year for the international office, the college will cover the shortfall. CP (W) noted that the international activities of the college have “never made any substantial amount of money.” IOC (W) explained that:

the financial goal for international activities is that the International Office covers its expenses and makes a small contribution to the

college. Quotas for contract revenues or number of international students are not set. It can be very difficult to set goals for international activities, the past year has been a real eye opener in terms of the fickleness of the economy."

The reluctance to set specific target goals is echoed by CP (S) who stated that "financial goal setting for international activities is not unlike gambling - not very easy to do. The expectation at College S is that, in general, the combined recruitment and project dollars will allow the office to break even. In an exceptionally good year the office can make a very small contribution, of perhaps \$30, 000 -\$40, 000, to the college."

College M also indicated a reluctance to set specific "targets" for international activities. CP (M) stated that the "college does not set financial goals for international activities in terms of "targets," but the international office needs to bring in more money than its spends." According to IOC (M) however, the international office has set its own goals and has made international student recruitment a high priority and set a goal that in five years time, 5% (600 students) of the students in regular college programs will be international. Currently this number sits at 180 students. According to IOC (M) the college is:

looking for the money that goes with recruitment. This is an area where there is an opportunity to bring money to the college. . . Export is a revenue generator and brings interesting people to Canada, however because of the downturn in economies, business has really slowed down.

IOC (M) indicated that the international office is budgeting for the position of an international student advisor as College M wants to provide good services to the

students, make them happy and build good will. According to IOC (M), it is important that the international activities don't get out of control as it is more important to look after existing international students than to make money.

Colleges U and X have much more concrete and clear financial goals for their international activities than do Colleges M, S, and W. CP (X) stated that the college had set a mid-term goal that ten percent of the student body (550 students) be international. According to CP (X):

This will generate approximately five and a half million dollars per year for the college. It will signal to the community and students that College X is global and students can get international experience which will aid them in the workplace. Ten percent would also give College X a good funding base.

In regards to the educational export contracts, CP (X) stated that it is the goal of "projects not to lose money. These contracts are not that lucrative and are regarded more as professional development activities for faculty than business ventures." College U, like College X, sets goals for its international activities. IOC (U) indicated that goal setting was done every year and the international activities grossed between ten and twelve million dollars per year. The majority of the revenue is generated by international student recruitment. IOC (U) stated that "business has leveled out over the past couple of years because of increased competition from countries such as Australia.



It appears that whether or not the colleges have set financial goals for international activities, the over-riding expectation is that international activities should not drain college resources. The targets for international student enrollments are calculated in terms of number of students, not revenue, and seem to represent wishes or "best case scenarios," not firmly entrenched business goals.

### **c) Cost of International Activities**

The international office chairpersons were asked to estimate how much money the international office spends on export and recruitment activities. IOC (W) stated that the marketing budget for the office for 1998 was a very modest \$15, 000. The budget for the entire international office at College S was \$100, 000 and eighty percent of the budget is spent on salaries and benefits for international office staff, and the remaining \$20, 000 is spent on travel and development of projects. IOC (M) reported an equally modest budget for its international office. The budget for student recruitment, which includes recruitment of local as well as international students is \$400, 000 per fiscal year. Out of this budget, the salaries of recruitment officers and operating expenses including promotional materials and travel costs, are paid. There is no allotted budget for export projects, and the international office needs to generate at least \$150, 000 in order to cover international office staff salaries and office operating expenses. The modest budgets of these three international offices are totally eclipsed by the budget of the international office at College U.

According to IOC (U), three million dollars per year is spent on student recruitment. This amount includes the salaries of the student services personnel at the college, the cost of the international students' health care premiums, and the costs of travel, advertising and publications. Less than one million dollars is spent on developing international export contracts. IOC (U) pointed out that this large budget also covers the salaries of ten full-time staff members, and this large investment generates tuition revenues in excess of ten million dollars. It appears that for College U, a large investment begets a large return.

The international office chairpersons were asked what they would do with extra financial resources if they were made available to the international office. Two of the IOCs stated that any extra resources would be directed towards marketing and recruitment. IOC (M) stated that "if there were additional resources, they would be used to hire people to travel around and rustle up business." IOC (W) indicated that additional resources are "desperately needed and though in the past the international office could usually cover its expenses and contribute to the college, things are getting tight and the impact of the Asian economic crisis is being felt." Though IOC (M) made similar comments about the need for additional resources he/she stated that "the international office can't really expect any funding, as the Canadian taxpayer really shouldn't be paying for the office."

Colleges U and S both indicated that any additional resources would be used to provide services for existing international students at the college. IOC (S) linked improved student services to an improved international reputation thus generating more business for the college, while IOC (U) made a similar link between good student services and increased business. IOC (S) pointed out that recruitment and export contracts are inextricably linked, and often feed each other, therefore it is important to treat international students well. Clearly, all of the international offices, regardless of their existing budget, could find uses for additional resources.

#### **d) Financial trends**

One financial trend that emerged during the interviews, is that in most cases the colleges are strategically focussing on the revenue generating activity which holds the most promise of generating revenues in excess of expenses for their college. College U and College X are clearly focussing on recruiting international students. Both colleges are directing most of their efforts towards recruitment, and participating in relatively few export contracts., College S and College W on the other hand are focussed on educational export. According to IOC (W) the college is focussing on export rather than recruitment because of the expense of recruiting students. IOC (W) feels that its rural location, the fact that the college does not offer summer English as a Second Language programs, and the fact that attending educational fairs and producing promotional materials are extremely expensive, has made international student recruitment far less lucrative than export contracts.

Similar sentiments were expressed by IOC (S) who pointed to the isolated, northern location of College S as a major hindrance to recruiting international students therefore making contract training more attractive. College M stated that because the downturn in the economy had a negative impact on export contracts, the college is stepping up recruitment efforts, though both activities continue to be important to the college.

There is a second financial trend that should be noted, as it was mentioned directly by two interviewees at two different colleges. These interviewees noted that their college has made a marked shift away from aid projects funded by such agencies as CIDA as these projects are difficult to get, less lucrative and therefore less attractive than privately negotiated contracts. CP (X) noted that there is a shift towards more lucrative private contracts which are usually not aid projects. IOC (W) stated that the college used to provide education to disadvantaged countries, but this is no longer the case and it is no longer a "do good" activity, but a business operation. IOC (W) worries that because international education has turned into a business, poorer countries will become more marginalized.

The explicit acknowledgement of this shift reinforces the findings of Daniel Schugurensky and Kathy Higgins in their article "From Aid to Trade," (1996), where they note this shift from philanthropic international activities to business activities. Though IOC (W) and CP (X) make the most direct statements regarding this shift,

the shift is implicit in the activities of the colleges which are working hard to recruit international students and secure private export contracts both of which are not development activities.

## **Section 6: Issues Affecting Recruitment and Export**

### **a) Degree versus Diploma**

The college presidents and international office chairpersons were asked to comment on whether or not they viewed the fact that the colleges do not issue an internationally recognizable credential as a significant problem in the context of international recruitment and export. All interviewees answered this question with a resounding "yes!" CP (U) referred to it as a "significant problem" while IOC (U) called it a "horrible impediment" and "totally unacceptable."

Many interviewees pointed to the fact that the "diploma" is not an easily understandable credential. According to CP (M), the "two and three year diploma is not even understood in North America, let alone internationally." CP (W) echoed these sentiments stating that "the degree is the currency of the world. The lack of degree granting ability "holds the college back from acquiring contracts and making links and colleges are placed in a secondary role." IOC (W) described the problems in marketing an institution that does not issue degrees and whose credentials are not understood internationally and noted that the students who eventually do come

to the college are shocked at how high the academic standards are. According to Jennifer Humphries, the lack of degree granting status makes it very difficult to “sell the colleges.” Humphries stated that “it would be much easier to sell colleges if they offered some sort of Associate Degree, people outside Canada don’t know what a college diploma means.” CP (X) pointed out that his/her college cannot recruit American students as the college does not offer Associate Degrees and this credential is important to employers and students.

The college presidents and international office chairpersons suggested several ways of dealing with this problem. IOC (S) pointed out that:

Nobody questions the validity of the program. However, the lack of a degree is the problem. Whether or not a university will recognize two years spent at College S is a big concern for the students. It is not a problem if they just want to do the program at the college and go home. The problem arises when they want to transfer to university. The American universities are much more accommodating for transfer, it is very difficult in Canada. There is a need to do something in Ontario to overcome this hurdle.

Some of the colleges have tried to overcome this hurdle by working with the “more cooperative” American universities to establish partnerships.

These partnership arrangements involve students completing a diploma program at the college, after which they are granted advanced standing at the university. College M reported linkage programs with Penn State University and Central Michigan University, and CP (M) stressed the fact that the college is eager to partner with other institutions in order to give students what they want and need. IOC (M)

reported that there are no existing partnerships with Canadian or Ontario universities as these institutions have expressed no real interest in linking and don't want to do it.

CP (X) reported several linkage programs with American universities, including a program with a German/American automotive company and an American university. This program involves the student studying at College X in a diploma program, apprenticing at the automotive company, and a period of study at the American university after which a Bachelor's degree is granted to the student. CP (W) indicated that the college is currently attempting to develop a linkage program with an Ontario university. Gerry Brown seems confident that linkages programs between colleges and universities will develop and that public perception and recognition of colleges is improving. Mr. Brown suggested that articulation between CAATs and universities is an attainable goal, and will help the colleges internationally.

While college presidents and international office chairpersons welcome the opportunity to develop more partnerships with universities, some regard the Applied Degree as the best solution to the problem. According to CP (W), if the colleges were given the power to grant Applied Degrees the problem of credential recognition would be greatly alleviated. CP (S) argued that an Applied Degree would not only be excellent in terms of marketing the colleges internationally, it

would be excellent for Canadian students who are often penalized for having a diploma and not a degree when they seek work outside Canada. IOC (U) expressed confidence that College U would secure the power to grant Applied Degrees. IOC (U) argued, however, that this power should not be granted to all colleges, but should be determined on a program by program basis at each CAAT.

The fact that the CAATs do not issue a recognizable credential is clearly a problem. Though there are attempts to link with universities, and lobbying efforts to convince the government to give the CAATs the power to grant Applied Degrees, the issue is a very significant one. Though individuals such as Gerry Brown and IOC (U) are confident that solutions to this problem will be found, it is apparent that most CAATs are frustrated by the situation and feel that it negatively impacts the success of their international activities. Ongoing work is needed in this area.

#### **b) Human Rights and Colonization**

A second issue that can potentially impact student recruitment and educational export concerns human rights and neo-colonialism. Many countries such as China, Indonesia and Thailand have terrible human rights records, and they also happen to be countries where CAATs are actively recruiting students and engaging in contract programs. College presidents and international office chairpersons were asked to describe how the college deals with the issue of human rights when undertaking



international activities. All of the interviewees acknowledged the importance of human rights concerns and most of the interviewees stated that they followed the Canadian federal government and CIDA policies regarding relations with countries with questionable human rights records. CP (M) stated that:

the college wouldn't do business where it is illegal. China is open for business. Why should colleges create new rules? We function under the guidelines of our government. We are trying to help people, we are not playing in the political arena.

Following the guidelines of the Canadian government or CIDA is the approach employed by many of the colleges. IOC (S) acknowledged that College S follows the guide of the Canadian government in its dealings with Saudi Arabia, and is careful to obey CIDA policies that stipulate that projects should help women and the environment. CP (X) stated that the if "the Canadian government is doing business with these countries, College X will go." One example of the college following the lead of the Canadian government was related by IOC (U). According to IOC (U), the college had:

developed a big deal with Pakistan last spring when the atomic weapons were detonated. This action strained the relationship between the Government of Pakistan and the Government of Canada, and College U axed the deal.

CP (U) stated that college seriously looks at the human rights records of countries it does business with, and has on occasion turned down certain countries.

CP (W) described the college's involvement with South Africa stating that the college was in the country during Apartheid to do an assessment, but did not carry out any of the work until after the demise of Apartheid. CP (W) described how the college severed its relationship with China after the Tienanmen Square massacre and did not return to the country until things "opened up a bit more there." IOC (W) stated that the college did not begin its work in Chile until after the country adopted democracy, and jointly with CBIE refused to carry out a project with Libya which involved teaching students how to make weapons. This type of educational program is contrary to the CBIE policy which according to Ms. Humphries states that CBIE will only deal with a country in non-sensitive educational areas.

Two interviewees stated that aside from the ethical issue of dealing with countries with poor human rights records, the college had serious concerns for the safety of the members of its own community working abroad. CP (S) stated that while it is very important to carefully examine the political situation in a country where you are doing business, very often you cannot predict how suddenly a situation can change. CP (S) described how two members of the college were in India during the time that Pakistan was detonating the atomic weapons. The college managed to keep in touch with the two individuals and facilitate their return to Canada, but it was a very frightening situation. CP (X) also expressed concern over potential risk to students and staff and stated that in some cases the college has chosen not to get

involved in countries that might be dangerous. For the most part, however, colleges are willing to do business with countries with poor human rights records.

Both Jennifer Humphries and Gerry Brown pointed out the positive impact that colleges can have by actively working with countries with poor human rights records. Mr. Brown pointed out that the reason that colleges are working in these countries is to bring outside perspectives and change things for the better. Mr. Brown described a positive project in China concerning the educational fields of women studies and law. The project utilized Canadian expertise in order to train teachers in China. Ms. Humphries emphasized that:

you do not want to ignore people who want to change their world. The projects try to encourage gender equity and help people by sharing Canadian values. These projects have positive impacts and incrementally more women participate in the projects. It is not productive to freeze people out, you share values by participating.

CP (W) agreed with the idea that through participating in projects in these countries, change can be affected. CP (W) argued that

it would be wrong to shut yourself off, that is giving in to the problems. It is part of education to open oneself up. By going you can help people - how you do it and what you do is key. You have to be conscious of your ethical decisions.

IOC (M) made much the same argument as CP (W) and stated that:

Education can effect change. You can act as role models and go into countries like China and Indonesia and leave a positive impression. You can teach by example and play a huge role in gradual change. Evolution not revolution. By open relations, maybe you can effect change, you can't do anything if you ignore them.

IOC (U) noted that when students study in Canada they return home with a different view of the world.

The fact that many of the interviewees stressed the important impact that the CAATs can have in “effecting change, “ providing “role models” and “spreading Canadian values,” raises some question of whether or not the CAATs are acting in a neo-colonial way, and attempting to “colonize” developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries. Neo-colonialism and cultural imperialism are best explained in the works of Philip Altbach (1971) and Martin Carnoy (1974), who describe education as the new tool for colonization. In 1998 Jacques Hurabielle argued that although Canadian educators had no conscious imperialistic notions, there was a trend of neo-colonial and imperialistic attitudes among college educators, and international education programs were often a transplant of Canadian values and ideas. When college presidents and international office chairpersons were asked whether or not they agreed that international education activities can serve as tools for developed countries to “colonize” developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries, very strong reactions were elicited.

IOC (U) and CP (M) had the strongest reaction to this question. IOC (U) responded:

This is crap! Our country celebrates cultural diversity. This is a ridiculous assertion. We run a huge diversity of programs, some technical, maybe these programs are transplanting western methods.

We do not offer “canned” programs, we provide customized training which is more expensive, but they get what they want.

CP (M) used similar words to describe his reaction to the assertion:

Sounds like Marxist crap. Western countries may have tied trade to projects, but it is not indoctrination, unlike what China and Russia have done. The democratic countries are really good - they are much more open. Most countries are not democracies. You need to provide a minimum standard of education before countries can move forward. It is a joke to think that we can take them over, we might make them a bit more democratic.

Gerry Brown was equally emphatic in his reaction to the assertion describing “it is a bunch of garbage.”

CP (X) expressed disbelief that international activities could be colonization tools.

CP (X) stated that the college has been involved in China for years, and it is hard to “believe that anything is colonization, the area of influence is so small.” CP (X) acknowledged that for some of the projects, “the Canadian government is spending money to achieve certain goals, but the people they are helping are running the show and have their own national plan and goals.” CP (X) pointed out that the people receiving the education are usually very highly educated to begin with and the country has the agenda, the college is simply helping to implement it. CP (X) noted that:

I have not seen any evidence of colonization. The Caribbean is very sensitive to these issues and will speak up about it and they still are willing to get assistance from Canadian and American colleges.

Some interviewees did acknowledge that there can be instances when the international activities are not sensitive to issues of neo-colonialism. IOC (W) agreed that:

It does happen to a certain extent, more so in the past with CIDA projects. A person went into a certain country and showed the people what he knew and left without leaving any supports in place. In the last couple of years there has been more of an effort to tailor the learning to the cultural context it will be taught in. However, there still will be rubbing off. This can be good and bad. Technology is a major influence in the world. Can you stop the tide?

IOC (M) also displayed some sensitivity to the neo-colonialism issues and stated that College M:

works with the country as a partner and helps tailor things to their needs. We do not go in all arrogant saying that we have all of the answers and the "only" way. We are culturally sensitive and fit what these people need. Imposition is a terrible way to go. We are not colonizers. Implantation of western values and ideas happens any ways through the media, you don't need the colleges to do it. We are not going to these countries in order to impose things, we are showing people how to adapt things to their needs.

Three interviewees argued that the transfer of western ideas is not necessarily a bad thing. IOC (S) pointed out that:

technology is being introduced to developing markets and some countries are so far behind technologically you are doing a good thing to help them and share better methods and ideas. We possess new modern techniques and sharing these ideas and techniques is helping people.

CP (U) made a similar argument stating that "many emerging nations need to understand how business is conducted in North America. We are helping them

learn the ways.” Gerry Brown pointed out that many of the so called “western” values which are being transplanted, are not exclusively western, and actually are United Nations human rights values. Mr. Brown did stress however that there needs to be on-going supports and linkages built into international projects in order for the ongoing cross-fertilization of ideas to continue. Mr. Brown emphasized that “training countries need to see the projects through and provide on-going support.”

One might point out that though most of the interviewees rejected that idea that international activities can serve to colonize developing countries, many of them stated that transplanting western ideas and effecting change is not such a bad thing. However, it is clear that there is no malicious intent imbedded in this belief. Many of the interviewees stressed that they make every effort to accommodate the needs and desires of their clients (which also happens to be good business practice) and respect their cultural needs and values.

## **Section 7: Future Trends in Educational Export and Student Recruitment**

At the end of each interview, participants were asked to share their perspective on what they believe to be some of the trends in educational export and international student recruitment. Many interviewees expressed concern that increased competition from other countries would have a serious impact on the international activities of Canadian colleges. IOC (U) noted that “more people are getting into the

business and there is increased competition.” IOC (M) pointed directly to the competition from Australia as a big threat to the Canadian share of the international education market. IOC (M) stressed that Canada has safety, cleanliness and multiculturalism working in its favour and needs to capitalize on these attributes. CP (M) stressed that international education is part of the global economy and education is a major industry in the twenty-first century. CP (M) suggested that Canada could be a giant in the marketplace and should flourish.

The need for Canada and colleges to organize in order to be successful in export and recruitment was mentioned by several interviewees. IOC (S) stated that:

In order to capture the international market we need to further develop networks with governments, NGOs and the private sector. Canadian foreign policies and procedures need to be more supportive of international initiatives. It has to be a priority for Canada so it can prosper in the new global economy. Export of goods and services is big business and Canada plays an international role. Colleges and universities have a role to play in this. We need to project our values, education and cultural internationally. We are a peaceful nation with a good image in the world, a great place to live. We are top in the world and we need to promote exporting our education goods and services. We should follow the Australian model. We need to **promote**. There is a lot of competition out there.

IOC (W) also emphasized the need for Canada to organize its international education activity and stated that “Canada could be a real contender if we got organized and got our name out there.” IOC (M) echoed these sentiments and stated that:

Canada is a major leader in the world and our education system is a major part of that. We are a role model. Colleges are effective at



providing good, relevant programs which can meet people's needs. International education is not going away, it will grow.

The need to foster and encourage the international education "business" was a trend also noted by CP (X). CP (X) stated that:

International is a business and has to be run like one. We need to find additional resources and bring them back to the college. The level of funding that the colleges are receiving from the government is inadequate. We are facing a huge increase in the number of students in Ontario and need the money to provide education to them.

CP (X) also noted that international was not a growth area for all colleges and not a lot of financial investment is being made in this area. CP (X) concluded that "some colleges will pursue international where it makes sense." One such college which has found that pursuing international does not make sense is College S. CP (S) stated that:

Size and climate are the two major factors hindering international activities. We need capital in order to make money. This (international) is not a big growth opportunity for College S. The value of international for the external and internal communities is high. International has been great for small town Ontario. The activities enrich the college's surrounding community, but it is not a big money maker and not a way for the college to overcome under-funding.

College S has made a conscious decision to limit its international activities and, according to the president, focus on a couple of "niche" programs.

Most interviewees stressed the need for colleges to continue preparing students for a global economy. CP (M) noted the need for his/her college to pay more attention

to home, to internationalize the curriculum, and to improve local students' foreign language skills. CP (M) also stressed that there is a need to provide more international exchange programs for students. IOC (M) noted the need to:

bring things into the classroom and prepare students for a global market. There is a need to broaden the horizons of the faculty, who will, in turn, transfer these experiences to the student.

CP (W) stated that while international activities go through cycles, they are bound to be important in the long term. Like CP (M), CP (W) stressed that the college needs to globalize and "get more local students out in the world - get them travelling." The need to foster appreciation of the new global economy and the fact that the world is inter-connected was also mentioned by CP (X) who stated that a trend he/she would like to see is a:

broader acceptance of the value of understanding people from other cultures and a better understanding of being sensitive to other peoples. There needs to be a greater emphasis on the study of language so that global competitiveness is achieved. You can not be parochial and survive.

CP (W) and IOC (W) pointed out that international activities in the future may not involve travelling, but instead will take advantage of the amazing advances in technology such as video-conferencing, and the Internet. IOC (W) questioned whether or not the present international activities will continue and how international activities will be defined in the future. IOC (W) stated that he/she could foresee a future where a student could make up a degree with courses from institutions in ten different countries, delivered electronically. The concept of international activities without travel is a very interesting vision of a future trend in

international student recruitment and educational export. Whether or not this vision will come to fruition remains to be seen.

Overall, interviewees had a very positive outlook regarding the future of educational export and international student recruitment. Interviewees stressed the need for colleges to continue to internationalize and provide local students with opportunities to gain the skills and experience necessary to working in a global economy. Interviewees expressed great optimism about the opportunities for growth in the international marketplaces and the strong position that Canada could have in the international arena. Many interviewees pointed out the need for Canada to work hard to highlight all of its positive attributes and strengthen and solidify its position as a viable player in the international education market.

## **CHAPTER V - DISCUSSION and RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **INTRODUCTION**

In Chapter One of this thesis, several key research questions were outlined. In this chapter, these research questions will be revisited and the survey results, interview data and in some cases relevant literature will be used to answer these questions.

The second section of the chapter offers some recommendations and suggestions regarding the marketing of the CAATs.

#### **Central Research Question:**

**How did international student recruitment and international export evolve at the colleges?**

According to the survey results, the majority of international offices were established after 1985, and over 33% were established between 1990 and 1994. The most important reasons for the establishment of these offices included the need to coordinate college's international projects, a desire to increase revenue at the college and direction from the college president. The three major initiators of international programming at the colleges were (a) the pre-existence of a few particular international projects, (b) a restructuring of the college organization which recognized internationalization, and (c) the efforts of a key individual at the college.

Three major themes concerning the historical evolution of international student recruitment emerged from the survey data: early activities tended to be sponsored by an agency such as CBIE, ACCC or CIDA; student recruitment activities often flowed out of faculty exchange programs; and colleges often formed linkages with one or two countries and recruited students from these countries.

Educational export followed an evolutionary process similar to international student recruitment. Respondents gave a variety of answers regarding the principal stimulus behind educational export activities and four major stimuli were revealed: a project or projects brokered by an NGO; the efforts of a single member of the college community; the desire for revenue for the college and the opportunity for professional development for faculty and staff. Many respondents noted that their earliest export activities were projects brokered through ACCC and sponsored by CIDA.

The interview data pointed out the importance of personal relationships in the evolution of international activities at the colleges. Some of the key features of the historical evolution of the international activities of the CAATs is that they started out very small, many of the international relationships were precipitated by the efforts of the college president or a key member of the college community, and many of the early projects were sponsored by organizations such as CIDA and brokered through a third party such as ACCC or CBIE.

The most interesting evolutionary trend in international activities at the CAATs is the shift away from government sponsored projects towards more lucrative private contracts. This trend was noted by several survey respondents as well as interviewees who acknowledged that the college was seeking out more lucrative contracts which most often are found in the private sector and not in development work that tends to be sponsored by third party funding agencies such as the World Bank or CIDA. This shift was documented by Schugurensky and Higgins (1996), Knight (1997), Leginsky and Andrews (1994), and by Ubadigbo (1997). The shift towards trade oriented rather than development oriented projects was noted by the survey respondents and interviewees, but survey respondents and interviewees did not express any concern regarding this shift. The prevailing attitude of interviewees and survey respondents is that the colleges need to engage in international activities that are profitable for the colleges and run their international activities as a business.

### **Central Research Questions:**

**Why are colleges engaged in international student recruitment and international educational export? How does visa student recruitment and international export of education fit within the mission and mandate of the college? What does the college hope to achieve by participating in these activities? What goals do the colleges have for these international activities?**

The survey results and interview data indicated that there are a number of factors that motivate CAATs to participate in international student recruitment and international educational export. The top three factors that respondents felt were very important for motivating college to participate in international student recruitment were: (a) the opportunity to generate revenue for the college, (b) the opportunity to bring foreign perspectives to the local student body and (c) the opportunity to foster international trade links. The top three factors that respondents felt were very important for motivating the college to participate in educational export were: (a) the opportunity to generate revenue for the college, (b) the opportunity to foster international trade links, and (c) the opportunity to foster professional development for the faculty. Interestingly, interviewees indicated that the overwhelming motivation were the internationalization benefits not the revenue that these activities can afford the institution. College presidents and international office chairpersons were quick to point out that international activities are not purely money making ventures, but internationalization opportunities for the colleges. Several interviewees pointed out that colleges are not making that much money from their international activities, but are doing them for “other” reasons such as faculty and student development.

Repeatedly, the interviewees stressed the importance of preparing local students for the global economy. The CAATs have sought to develop and increase their students' international awareness by giving them an opportunity to take language and cross-cultural education courses, to study abroad and to meet and interact with international students. Interviewees were clear in their view that international activities fit within the mission and mandate of the CAAT because they provide wonderful learning opportunities for students, and fantastic professional development activities for faculty members. It was stressed that it is an essential and obligatory function of the CAATs to recognize the implications of a global economy and prepare students for this environment.

One of the most interesting findings of the thesis concerns the colleges' motivation and rationale for participating in international activities. The motivating factor of generating revenue for the college stands out among the other objectives in terms of how important the respondents perceive it to be in motivating the college to participate in international student recruitment and educational export (**Tables 10 and 21**). It appears that international student recruitment and educational export are clearly undertaken as a means to generate revenue for the college. This finding is in keeping with other data, which illustrate the business role that the international office plays at the college. Over seventy per cent of the colleges expect that educational export projects will produce net revenue over expenses (**Table 23**) and



80.9% of the colleges require a business plan for each educational export activity (**Table 20**). A further 66.7% of respondents indicated that international offices were expected to cover their operating costs with money from project revenue (**Table 24**). Clearly, international education offices are expected to operate as businesses in the majority of cases.

When asked what functions the international office performs, 90.5% of respondents indicated that the office recruits international students to the college generally. Selling education and training programs to developing economies with funding support from non-governmental organizations was a function performed by 85.7% of the college international offices, and 76.2% of respondents indicated the office was engaged in selling education and training programs directly to foreign markets and recruiting international students into programs specifically designed for them (**Table 6**). These responses seem to indicate that the primary function of the international office is to recruit international students and sell education and training programs. The fact that such a high percentage (71.4%) of respondents indicated that internationalizing the college community was a function of the international office suggests that the revenue generating functions are seen as a means to internationalize the campus, or, it could indicate that the offices are engaged in activities beyond recruitment and export that serve to internationalize the college community. However, given that only 4 out of 21 respondents indicated that the international office had more than 20% of its activities concerned with

something other than recruitment and educational export (See Tables 7 & 8) indicates that the internationalization of the college community is a by-product of the student recruitment and educational export activities.

I contend that the international offices are not charged with the responsibility for internationalizing the college campus, but rather with developing and administering revenue generating activities. These activities may or may not have some additional internationalization impacts beyond generating revenue. For all intents and purposes international offices are operating as businesses: the offices tend to be self funded, they require business plans for projects, there is a move away from aid projects towards more lucrative direct contracts and survey respondents stressed the importance of revenue generation in motivating colleges to participate in international activities. However, the interviews with college presidents and international office chairpersons reveal that these are much more than business ventures and in fact, most colleges are not making all that much money from their international activities.

The majority of colleges reported total revenue of less than \$300, 000 and the average projected total revenue from educational export contracts for 1998 was \$574, 875 (Table 26). This is the total revenue and does not take into account the cost of running the export projects, the cost of salaries and equipment for international office staff, and the costs of research and development. As one

international office chairperson said, “if we can cover our expenses and make a little bit of money, we are happy.” College presidents echoed these sentiments and said that “while it is nice to make a little money, the international offices really don’t contribute that much money to the college and do not make a significant contribution to college budgets.” However, the presidents argued, the projects are a wonderful opportunity for faculty development, to enrich the student community and to enrich the community in which the college is located.

The president of College S mentioned the Mongolian students studying mining technologies, and how these visiting students had brought new perspectives to the local students, faculty and community in an isolated northern Ontario town. Other college presidents and international office chairpersons shared stories of how faculty had been transformed and enriched by their overseas teaching experience and how they had brought these new perspectives into the local classroom, enriching the educational experience of local students. One international office chairperson at a large urban college said that while their educational export projects were only making very small financial contributions to the college, and were certainly not indispensable to the economic survival of the college, the “other” benefits had been immeasurable. Local faculty and students were exposed to people from all regions of the world, lasting linkages had been formed between Canada and these various regions, and students and faculty were given insight into life outside of Canada. These benefits of international activities have been noted by

such authors as O'Banion (1992), Gleazer (1978), and Shannon (1978). Many college presidents and international office chairpersons echoed the sentiments of Maxwell King and Albert Koller who, in 1995, urged community colleges to "become true citizens of the world," and prepare students for a new global order. The benefits of international activities for developing students' international perspectives and broadening their horizons have been well documented by the above mentioned authors, as well as several others including Fersh and Fitchen (1981), and Raby and Tarrow (1996). The publications of such organizations as the Canadian Bureau for International Education, Community Colleges for International Development and the United Nations also link the importance of international activities to producing competent students. The positive impacts of international activities on local students, faculty, staff and the surrounding community were extolled by many of the interviewees.

From the perspective of survey respondents, revenue generation is one of the major motivations for participating in international student recruitment and educational export, and colleges are acting as businesses in their international ventures. However, interview data and other survey data indicated that revenue generation is not the sole or even primary focus of international student recruitment and educational export. It appears that while colleges are aware of the potential to generate revenue with these activities, they are also interested in the "internationalization" benefits. When interviewed personally, international office

chairpersons and college presidents acknowledged the potential financial benefits of these activities but were more focused and excited about the non-financial benefits of these projects.

This dichotomy between what survey respondents indicate is a major motivating factor for participation in international activities, and what interviews with college presidents and international office chairpersons reveal is quite contradictory. One possible explanation is that the survey format did not give respondents the opportunity to elaborate on why the college engaged in international activities and this information was only elicited in personal interviews. A second explanation could be that though the colleges aren't making tremendous amounts of money from their international activities, they are hopeful that the activities will become more profitable in the future and this is motivating current participation. This explanation has greater credibility when seen in light of the tremendous emphasis that both survey respondents and interviewees placed on the need for the CAATs, the province and the country to improve their performance in the international education market. While the non-monetary virtues of international activities were extolled by many of the interviewees, there clearly is a desire and a motivation to have these activities generate money.

The important emphasis that the CAATs place on using international activities as a means to generate revenue, supports the assertions of writers such as Kerr (1994),

Shumar (1997), Slaughter and Leslie (1997), Currie and Newson (1998), Slaughter (1998) and Cruikshank (1995) who argue that globalization has resulted in a dramatic decrease in public funding for higher education. The reduction in funding has forced institutions of higher education to seek out private sources of funding such as international recruitment and export. The behaviour of the CAATs in respect to their international activities is certainly business-like and entrepreneurial. The CAATs have expanded their domestic business into the international market and are responding to the impacts of globalization by selling market-oriented programming to those who can afford to pay. Not only are the CAATs responding to globalization by engaging in revenue-generating international activities, one could argue that they are providing education and training programs that serve a globalization agenda. The CAATs are selling “practical” training and education courses that are closely aligned to market needs. As pointed it out in Chapter Two, there is a certain irony in the fact that while CAATs extol the benefits of international activities and point out that these activities expose local students to international perspectives and prepare them to compete successfully in a global economy, at the same time the CAATs are selling international students training which will help them to compete successfully against Canadian students. One could argue that in essence the CAATs are serving the needs of opposing teams.

### **Central Research Questions:**

**What is the total revenue from educational export contracts? What are the financial expectations of educational export projects? Who pays the salary and coordinates the release time for faculty engaged in educational export activities? How are the operating costs of the international activities covered?**

As indicated in the second section of this chapter, the limited financial information that was gathered through the survey indicates that international export activities at the CAATs are not extremely profitable at this point in time, nor have they ever been. With the exception of one or two colleges which reported very high yearly total revenues, most colleges reported total yearly revenues from educational export contracts of less than \$500, 000 and the net gain might be even less than that (Table 26). In regards to student recruitment, the majority of colleges reported an international student enrollment of less than one hundred students (Tables 14 & 15). Given that the average combined tuition and incidental fee paid by an international student is \$9,646.56 (Table 16), a college with fifty international students would only receive \$482,328 in total revenue from its international students. This figure does not take into account the expenses that the college must cover in providing the actual education and support services to the students.

If it is assumed that the college has a profit rate of 50% on their international recruitment activities, their actual revenue would be approximately \$241 164. The total college system revenue from all sources, reported by the colleges to the

Ministry of Education, Colleges and Training by March 31, 1998 was \$1 522 691 334.<sup>7</sup> If the total revenue of the system was equally distributed to the twenty-five colleges, each college would have total yearly revenues of approximately \$61 million dollars. Therefore, international recruitment activity revenues are equal to approximately 0.4% of total revenues. It is very difficult to assess the significance of this amount of revenue, for although it is a very tiny fraction of total revenues, it is a source of discretionary funds which the college may use as they see fit. However, given that the interviewees indicated that international activities are not "huge money makers," and make rather small financial contributions to the college, it is probably safe to say that the financial contributions of international activities are quite small.

A number of interviewees pointed out that most of the international activities barely break even, and one college president cautioned that "there is a lot of smoke and mirrors regarding how much money the colleges are actually making from these activities, these are not extremely profitable ventures." However, most colleges expect that the international export project will produce net revenue over expenses (Table 23) and require a business plan for the projects (Table 20).

College resources are not tapped to pay the salaries of faculty members engaged in international activities, but instead are paid out of project revenue. Despite the fact

---

<sup>7</sup> Financial data from the financial statements of the CAATs reported by the CAATs to the Ministry of Education, Colleges and Training by March 31, 1998. Total Revenue includes tuition fees, operating grants and ancillary revenues. Financial data provided by Mr. Paul Bobbin, Ministry of Education, Colleges and Training, Colleges Branch



that most international offices are being run as businesses, it is clear from the interviews and survey data regarding yearly revenue that these “businesses” do not always produce a profit and are valued for the other contributions that they make to the “quality of life” at the college and the learning opportunities they afford students and staff.

### **Central Research Questions:**

**How does the college recruit visa students and secure educational export contracts? What does the organizational structure for visa student recruitment and international export look like? What types of projects and activities in visa student recruitment and international export are the colleges presently engaged in?**

The prevailing trend in the organizational structure of international activities is that there is no prevailing trend. Survey respondents reported a wide variety of organizational structures, and international office chairpersons reported to college presidents, deans, and vice-presidents. Though there is wide variation regarding where in the organizational structure of the college the international office is placed, it is interesting to note that the majority of international office chairpersons report to a college officer who is responsible for the financial activities of the college. The wide variety of reporting structures indicates that international activities tend to have an uncertain place in the college structure. When interviewees were asked to explain where in the organizational structure the international office had been placed and why, interviewees stressed that personal interest was a factor that was

taken into consideration when the reporting structure was determined. No interviewee could give a clearly detailed, rational explanation of the placement of international activities in the organizational structure, and it was clear that the placement tends to be made on the basis of "instinct" or because some college officer has a particular interest in international activities and thus it becomes part of his/her portfolio. Interestingly, the two colleges which reported the highest total revenue from educational export contracts have a reporting structure which makes the international office chairperson directly responsible to the college president. This finding supports the writing of several authors who have noted the importance of faculty, staff and senior administrative support to the success of internationalization activities.

In the literature, many authors such as Knight (1994), Raby (1996), Backman (1984), Emerson and Newsom (1995), and Greenfield (1990), emphasize that the success of internationalization activities is often dependent on the support that these activities have from members of the college/university community, particularly the president and board of the institution. These authors also cite the importance of the international office having a clearly defined mission statement. Interestingly, only a quarter of the colleges surveyed had a mission statement for the international office and there did not appear to be any correlation between the existence of a mission statement and the number of international students recruited and the level of revenue generated. Authors such as Knight and Greenfield also stressed the

importance of systematic planning and reviews and the setting of annual goals and objectives to the success of internationalization efforts. The majority of the colleges reported that there was a review process for each international export project (Table 19) and the majority of colleges reported that there was a business plan required for each project (Table 20). Clearly, colleges are taking their international activities very seriously.

The vast majority of colleges have centralized their international student recruitment activities in their international office which undertakes all of the recruitment activities. Colleges have adopted a similar structure for educational export projects and have centralized all of the administration of export projects in the international office. This highly centralized organizational structure for international activities supports the finding that the majority of colleges originally established an international programs office in order to coordinate existing international activities. Though almost every college stated that the international office is involved in both recruitment and export activities, recruitment activities account for more than forty percent of the activities performed by the international office, indicating that recruitment, rather than export tends to be a higher priority for the majority of colleges. This finding was somewhat supported by the interview data as interviewees pointed out that often a college focuses its energies on either recruitment or export depending on what area it felt they could be most successful in. Perhaps colleges are more focused on international student recruitment rather

than export as there are more existing channels such as education fairs, Canadian embassies and Canadian Education Centres, which colleges can use to recruit students. The interviewees pointed out that export contracts are secured in a very different way, and are often dependent on personal relationships, "cold calling," or third party funding agencies. The avenues for securing export contracts are less "clear cut" than the recruitment process and require a large investment of time and money. Educational export projects require that the college not only "hustle" up business which requires travel and networking, but in the case of projects which are brokered through an agency such as ACCC or CBIE, the college has to invest a great deal of time and effort in proposal development. These factors may indicate why the college international offices devote more time to recruitment activities.

Survey respondents were asked to indicate what strategies the college uses to recruit international students. All respondents indicated that the Internet was an important recruitment tool, and an overwhelming majority of respondents indicated that the college participated in education fairs abroad, and used the Canadian embassies and consulates to disseminate information. A very large percentage of survey respondents (70%) reported that the college participated in Canadian Education Centres (CECs). This is very interesting because not only did the interviews reveal a great deal of dissatisfaction with the CECs, a recent study by Steve Bolton (1997) on the international marketing activities of Canadian colleges found that over half of the study participants reported that the CECs were of limited or no use in the

marketing of the college's educational products. Anecdotal evidence collected by Bolton included comments that the "CECs are too expensive, risk money for unknown value," and are of "limited value" and "unhelpful." Despite these criticisms, colleges continue to participate in the centres. Perhaps the lack of alternate marketing devices has forced the colleges to "make do" with what currently exists. Despite the shortcomings of some recruitment strategies, they do appear to be working, and sixty-five percent of survey respondents stated that there has been an increase in the number of international students at the college.

The type of educational export projects that the colleges are involved in vary greatly. The range of projects included environmental technology training, teacher education projects, agricultural technology, business training, language training, and hospitality and health care programs. While some colleges have focused on a few project areas, most colleges are involved in a wide range of projects which is a reflection of the wide course and program offerings available at the CAATs. The bulk of the projects are of a duration of less than one year and are located in Asia, and the majority of the projects are initiated by members of the administration at the CAAT. Only thirty percent of the projects are initiated by CIDA or another NGO which supports evidence provided during the interviews that colleges are moving away from development projects funded by third parties, towards private contracts. Most of the projects involve fewer than ten faculty members (Table 29) and most of the projects do not involve any local students (Table 31). The majority of the

projects enrolled between one and twenty contract students, though there were almost an equal number of projects that enrolled more than twenty international students. Interestingly, over thirty percent of the projects did not enroll any contract students. The low participation rate of local students and faculty does call into question the type of impact that these activities have on the local college, given the fact that they involve so few members of the college community. One could posit however that a single faculty member may come into contact with as many as one hundred students during an academic year, and theoretically these students would benefit from the international experience of their instructor.

Though there is great diversity in the types of educational export projects the colleges are involved in, for the most part the projects tend to be of a short duration, involve very few members of the college community and are developed by members of the institution. The fact that many of the colleges reported running projects in three very different subject areas e.g., ESL, business technology and hospitality indicates that most colleges have not yet developed a “niche” market, but are prepared to offer a range of programs to international clients. The small numbers of faculty involved in these projects and the relatively small numbers of contract students enrolled does seem to support assertions made by interviewees that colleges are not making huge amounts of money from their international projects and tend to exaggerate the extent of their international activities.

### **Central Research Questions:**

**What are the trends in visa student recruitment and educational export? What are the major issues that the colleges are facing in educational export and visa student recruitment?**

The trends in visa student recruitment and educational export are fairly clear: there is an increase in the number of international students being recruited at the colleges, the international offices are increasingly acting as businesses in order to secure international projects and students, and one of the major motivations for this behaviour is the potential for generating revenue. The major issues that are faced by the colleges in the pursuit of these goals include world economics, the role of government in recruitment and export, and the marketing and promotion of Canadian education abroad.

The survey component of this thesis was completed in late summer of 1998, just as the full impact of the Asian financial crisis was becoming clear. The ramifications of this were of great concern to survey respondents who expressed a great deal of concern regarding the economic situation in Asia. Because so many of the international export projects take place in Asia, and it is a major source of international students, any change in the economic situation there has implications for Ontario CAATs. The fact that Ontario colleges are so susceptible to the “whims” of global markets clearly came as a shock to members of the college community and will be an ongoing issue for colleges if they wish to continue to participate in the global marketplace. As participants in the international arena, colleges are

vulnerable to worldwide shifts in economic conditions and need to establish contingencies plans to deal with these situations. Some survey respondents indicated that the Asian crisis has forced the college to diversify its market base and start to investigate business opportunities in other parts of the world such as Europe and South America.

The second issue that emerges as very important to educational export and recruitment involves government regulations. The often unwieldy Canadian immigration regulations have a negative impact on a college's ability to enroll international students and bring contract students to Canada. The immigration problems of potential students from China were specifically noted and present a significant problem not only because China and the rest of Asia is an important source of students and contracts, but also because other countries, notably Australia have removed these barriers and thus Canada cannot effectively compete.

Government regulations also figure prominently in another significant issue in educational export and recruitment, the inability of the colleges to grant applied degrees. This shortcoming is a major roadblock for the colleges when they attempt to market themselves internationally. The need for government to address this issue is clear, and the fact that colleges are being forced to partner with American universities in an attempt to give students a degree alternative should be seen as a major embarrassment and a poor reflection upon Ontario and Canadian



universities. This problem needs to be addressed if the CAATs are to become viable competitors with the rest of the world.

The need for an organised marketing strategy for Canadian college education programs is a very significant issue for the CAATs. The need to organise and to strengthen marketing initiatives was mentioned not only by survey respondents and interviewees, but also figures prominently in the literature on the international export and recruitment activities of the Canadian colleges. Steve Bolton (1997), wrote that:

there is a need to have a stronger unit or entity to market our strengths and to advocate our abilities and needs both at the government and NGO levels. This unit would need to have an understanding of the strengths of member colleges across the country. For example, such a unit could be an advocacy group which understands the niche that the college system fills, either actually or potentially, in exporting knowledge. Canada must do a better job selling college level educational services abroad. They are a positive national strength and they make good business sense. Ironically, as the global village shrinks, the competition for the education dollar increases (Bolton, 1997, p. 1).

Bolton suggests that CBIE can fill this advocacy and marketing role on behalf of the colleges. A second CBIE document also stresses the need to develop Canada's education export potential and argues that:

education and training programs and services comprise a commodity that has great potential for international trade. Canada has a strong reputation for high quality in this product, but we have not capitalised on it as an export; indeed, we are rapidly-losing market share to competing countries that are out-hustling us in terms of strategy, aggression and effectiveness. As one of the most trade-dependent nations in the world, we cannot afford such failure to exploit our strengths in the domain (Canadian Internationalist, Vol. 9, No. 4, Winter 1999, p. 2).

Ironically, in a different article in the same issue of *Canadian Internationalist* the results of a discussion group with international students is published and a comment made by a

number of the international students is that "Canada needs to be better known." Mary Kane, author of the article noted that "the international students know about the quality of their experience in Canada, but back home, a lot of people have no idea what Canada has to offer"(Kane, 1999, p.2).

The CBIE is not the only organisation that has suggested that it can fulfil the marketing and advocacy role for international activities of the colleges. In 1988, The Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario (ACAATO), established a sub-committee to respond to a need by the CAATs for a co-ordinated provincial effort to market their international export and recruitment activities. In 1991, the sub-committee, known as Ontario Colleges International Committee (OCIC), established several goals for the committee. These goals include the development and maintenance of a comprehensive marketing plan for OCIC, the fostering and enhancement of relationships between OCIC and the Governments of Ontario and Canada, and with international education agencies in Canada, the gathering, organisation and dissemination of information relative to international activities, and the establishment of professional development mechanisms for the development and sharing of expertise within OCIC. OCIC outlines a very comprehensive plan for achieving these goals. Unfortunately, according to Ms. Suzanne Woods, the current chairperson of OCIC, the committee has not been very successful. It appears that there has not been a strong initiative to get "the committee rolling," and thus a strong commitment has not been made to the goals. Ms. Woods attributes this state of affairs to the fact the colleges are

all at different stages of development when it comes to international activities. Some colleges are really involved in international education, while some have very little involvement. This diversity makes it hard for senior level administrators to come together. However, the committee does continue to meet and in 1997 a discussion paper entitled Increasing Ontario College's Market Share of International Students, prepared by the International Education Office of Conestoga College for OCIC was released.

The purpose of this document was to secure financial support for OCIC from the CAATs, the Ontario Application Service, ACAATO and the province of Ontario in order to implement OCIC initiatives to market CAATs internationally. In this document OCIC lists seven key marketing initiatives that are in need of financial support. These areas include the establishment of a web page for the Ontario College Application Service that is linked to the international section of each College's web page, the creation of an Ontario Colleges International Committee Web page that includes a description of the Ontario college system translated into key languages, the production of Ontario college system advertisements in key languages for international recruitment publications, production of a poster to attract international students to the Ontario college system, production of a one page summary of the Ontario colleges that could be distributed to Canadian Embassies, Consulates and High Commissions throughout the world to recruit international students who would be referred to individual Ontario colleges for additional information, establishment of a Province of Ontario presence at key education fairs, and facilitating the marketing of Ontario college education and

training services by the Ontario International Corporation. Unfortunately, the funding request was denied, and these activities have been put on the back burner. The majority of survey respondents indicated that they perceive the Provincial Ministry of Education to not be committed to the recruitment and export activities of the CAATs (Tables 11 & 22). This dissatisfaction with the provincial government appears to have a concrete basis given the reluctance of the province to fund initiatives that could help the CAATs.

Despite OCIC's good intentions and clearly stated goals and marketing ideas, OCIC has not emerged as the leading advocacy and marketing body of the CAATs. There continues to be a need for a comprehensive marketing strategy and support from a larger body. Interviewees and survey respondents were clear that in their view, the Provincial and Federal government should be providing the support to the marketing of Canadian and Ontario college education. The need for federal government support is echoed by many groups involved in international activities.

In the executive summary of the document, Turning the Forces of Globalization to Our Advantage. An International Learning Strategy for Canada, prepared by the Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada, the Association of Canadian Community Colleges, the Canadian Bureau of International Education, the World University Services of Canada, the International Council for Canadian Studies and the Canada-U.S. Fulbright Commission in October, 1998, a strong argument is made for much greater

federal government participation in educational trade. The document points out that "Canada's education sector is increasingly important to the country's overall trade effort, with its goods and services earning 2.5 billion dollars per year and sustaining 20, 000 jobs in Canada" (p. 5). The document states that:

Canadian federal investment is falling behind that of our international competitors in the race to position countries strategically in the global knowledge economy. . . Key competitors such as the United States, the United Kingdom and Australia make major public investments in marketing their education and training services world-wide. France is the latest country to move in this direction, recently creating a government supported consortium of key departments and higher education institutions in order to recruit international students and bid on contracts funded by international financial institutions (p. 8).

The document criticizes the current federal government approach to supporting international education activities as fragmented and under-resourced and calls for the development of a strong and comprehensive federal government strategy as:

the lack of a strategy for supporting international learning is a significant gap in public policy given the federal government's emphasis on education and innovation as engines of prosperity, on improving the employment prospects of young people, on trade promotion and on projecting Canada's culture and values abroad (pg. 3).

The report calls for the federal government to provide an adequate, ongoing level of support for implementing Canada's education marketing strategy "undertaken in partnership with education institutions which also contribute significant resources to the effort" (pg 21). The report strongly recommends that the federal government continue its contribution to current and future CECs, works to improve market intelligence and conducts research into effective approaches, and establishes a special export

development program for postsecondary institutions to offset market development costs and minimise risk to institutions entering into business ventures abroad"(pg 22).

It appears that the Federal government is finally taking heed for the call to offer more support to international export and recruitment efforts and in February 1999, The Ministry of Foreign Affairs and International Trade established a Education Marketing Advisory Council. The council has only had two meetings, but is working to form a government strategy. The council is chaired by a CAAT president and currently the council has split into four groups each of which is studying a particular area. The four areas that the council has identified as being particularly important to the formation of a government strategy include data collection and market intelligence, international funding agencies, student recruitment and distance learning. Though it is too early to properly assess the effectiveness of this council, the fact that the federal government is taking an interest in promoting educational trade is very encouraging.

In the following section I will outline some recommendations and suggestions that will be helpful in formulating a provincial and federal strategy for marketing the education and training opportunities available through the CAATs. Some of these recommendations are well anchored in the data and analysis presented in the thesis, while other recommendations are a result of having been immersed in these issues, and may be based on only partial data. For example, OCIC did not come up in the interviews, but was brought to my attention through documents that I received after the

interview process was complete. The recommendations pertaining to OCIC flow from the analysis of these documents.

**Recommendation One:** OCIC should be the official voice of the international activities of the CAATs. OCIC is the appropriate body to represent the international interests of the CAATs as it is made up of representatives of the colleges who have a vested interest in the success of educational export and recruitment efforts. The membership of OCIC could be expanded to include a member of the provincial Ministry of Education, Colleges and Training, and a member of the provincial Ministry of Trade. OCIC's primary goal should be to increase the international profile of the CAATs and advocate on their behalf in all matters pertaining to international education activities.

**Recommendation Two:** The provincial government should offer financial support to OCIC so that it can implement the goals outlined in their 1991 paper. The provincial government should offer funding support for the seven key projects outlined by OCIC in the 1997 discussion paper.

**Recommendation Three:** OCIC, with assistance from the provincial government should create a marketing strategy for the Ontario college system. This strategy should include elements which clearly explain the distinct features of the Ontario college system, highlight the benefits of an Ontario CAAT education and provide information about each CAAT.

**Recommendation Four:** OCIC should work with the provincial government to resolve the problem regarding the international recognition of the college diploma. The resolution of this problem may be the introduction of Applied Degrees, or the facilitation of better articulation agreements between colleges and Ontario universities.

**Recommendation Five:** OCIC and the provincial government should work with the federal government on a Canada wide education marketing strategy. OCIC and the provincial government should ensure that Ontario has input into this strategy and participates in all Federal government marketing and trade initiatives.

**Recommendation Six:** The participation of CAATs on provincial and federal international trade missions should be heavily subsidised by the level of government responsible for the trade mission.

**Recommendation Seven:** The federal government should support the recommendations in the 1994 Report of the House of Commons Standing Committee on Foreign Affairs and International Trade, Canada's Foreign Policy Principles and Priorities for the Future that recognises education as the "third pillar" of Canadian foreign relations and trade policy. The federal government should to develop a comprehensive international education policy which supports the recommendations of the report.



**Recommendation Eight:** The federal government should continue to support the efforts of the recently created Education Marketing Advisory Council, and work to establish a marketing strategy for Canadian higher education which will raise the profile of Canada and its educational institutions internationally.

**Recommendation Nine:** The federal government should undertake a review of immigration regulations pertaining to student visas. Where possible, the student visa application should be stream-lined and potential international students should receive a preliminary decision regarding their application within six weeks.

There are some other issues that the CAATs should keep in mind in their pursuit of international students and export contracts. Survey respondents were asked how committed they perceived college faculty and local students to be to export and recruitment. The majority of respondents indicated that they felt that most students and faculty were only moderately, or somewhat committed, and a significant percentage (35%) felt that local students are not committed to international student recruitment and export (Tables 11 & 22). The export projects include very small numbers of faculty and students, which may have a negative impact on how committed these two groups feel.

**Recommendation Ten:** Integrate the international export and recruitment activities into the “everyday” life of the college. International students and international export are

often tacked on to the list of ways in which to internationalize the college. Colleges need to ensure that these activities do indeed have some positive impact on the local institution and local students and faculty. International students are a wonderful resource and need to be supported with programs which are available to the entire student body. Export activities should make every possible attempt to include as many local students as possible, and should try to maximize the benefits that faculty and administrators involved with these projects receive in order that the college as a whole feel the “internationalization” benefits.

Though most of the interviewees were skeptical that international activities could serve as tools of colonialism, and the training provided by the colleges may not be of relevance in a foreign country, these potential dangers need to be avoided. Colleges also need to avoid any relationships which could be potentially harmful to the college, or unethical.

**Recommendation Eleven:** Issues of relevancy, quality and neo-colonialism need to be at the forefront of the planning process for international educational programs in order to ensure purchasers are getting a “quality” product relevant to their needs and situation. Mutual cooperation and design between vendor and purchaser is highly desirable.

**Recommendation Twelve:** All colleges should adopt an ethical review protocol which should be undertaken before the college engages in activities in countries with poor human rights abuse records.

**Recommendation Thirteen:** The final recommendation of this thesis is that colleges which are genuinely interested in pursuing international activities, make a conscious commitment to this goal. If the CAATs truly want to be successful in their international ventures, they need to have the support of the members of the college, and be willing to work with other colleges and both levels of government to develop a marketing strategy. While there clearly are a couple of “big name” colleges who can secure business on their own, the other colleges will have to trust and support each other in order to carve out a niche for the Ontario college sector in the international marketplace.

## **CONCLUSION**

### **Contribution to Knowledge**

This thesis makes a contribution to both applied and theoretical knowledge. It contributes to applied knowledge by providing the first comprehensive study of the international activities of the CAATs. It also provides the only comprehensive data on export and recruitment activities and provides insights and perspectives on the motivation of the CAATs to participate in these activities. This dissertation is a unique examination of operational and policy issues pertaining to international activities.

This work makes a contribution to theoretical knowledge by adding a perspective on two forms of internationalization in a conceptual framework that brings together the literature on internationalization and the literature on globalization. This thesis gives an insight into the impact of globalization on postsecondary education, and examines the financial motivation for internationalization, which is a subject that has received very little attention in the literature.

## **Directions for Future Research**

Ontario CAATs are involved in international student recruitment and educational export projects. Not all colleges are working at the same level, and in fact some colleges are much more involved in international activities than others are. The interviews and survey data indicated that the financial motivation to participate in these programs is strong, though the non-financial benefits of these activities are also perceived to be very important. It is apparent that the Ontario colleges and the education system of the country as a whole need to be better marketed. Canada, and the CAATs in particular need to improve their ability to tap into the international education market. Research into how to position the CAATs in the international arena is badly needed, and some comparative studies between Canada and other countries such as Australia and the United Kingdom may yield some important insight into how a country can position its educational system in the global marketplace.

More research is warranted in this area, and a detailed study of colleges that are highly successful in their international ventures would be very useful for colleges that are attempting to “break into” the international arena. Research into best practices, market needs and the impact of international activities on the purchaser is also needed. However, given the reluctance of some colleges to share their market-knowledge, this may prove to be a difficult task. Canada is facing strong

competition from Australia, the United States and the United Kingdom, if the Canadian education system wants to claim a piece of the international education market, it has to arm itself with information and market itself to the world.

For over thirty years the CAATs have provided Ontario students and businesses with high quality training and education programs. The CAATs are now sharing these programs with the world. The CAATs are not engaged in anything unusual, or extraordinary, as educational institutions all over the world are dealing with the impacts of globalization and the resultant commoditisation of education. The CAATs are becoming active participants in the global economy, which sets a fabulous example for their students who are facing a future which will see them working and living in this new, interdependent world.

## REFERENCES

- Advisory Panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education. (1996). Excellence Accessibility Responsibility Report of the Advisory panel on Future Directions for Postsecondary Education. Toronto: Ministry of Education and Training Ontario.
- Altbach, Phillip. (1971). Education and Neocolonialism. Teachers College Records, vol 72. no. 4. pp.1-16.
- Arthur, Nancy. (1994-95). International Training: The New Realities of Doing Business Internationally. ACCC Vol 8. No. 3 1994-95.
- Association of Universities and Colleges of Canada. (1998). Turning the Forces of Globalization to Our Advantage: An International Learning Strategy for Canada. Ottawa: CBIE.
- Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario. (1993). The Road Ahead Understanding the Finances of Ontario's Colleges. Toronto: Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario.
- Backman, Earl. Ed. (1984). Approaches to International Education, American Council on Education. New York: MacMillan Publishing Co.
- Bolton, Steve. (1997). Marketing our Education to the World, A Report on the Changing International Perspectives of the College/CEGEP Community in Canada. CBIE Research No.10. Ottawa: Canadian Bureau of International Education
- Burn, Barbara. (1980). Expanding the International Dimension of Higher Education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Calleja, James Editor. (1995). International Education and the University. Jessica Kingsley Publishers/UNESCO.
- Canadian Bureau for International Education. (1999). Canada's education export potential. Canadian Internationalist, Vol. 9 No. 4. p.1.
- Canadian Bureau for International Education. (1998). Annual Report, Education without Borders or Bounds. Ottawa: CBIE.
- Canadian Bureau for International Education. (1998). Destination Canada, Information for International Students. Ottawa: CBIE.

- Carnoy, Martin. (1974). Education as cultural imperialism. New York: David McKay.
- Council of Ontario Universities. (1998). Ontario Universities - 1998 Resource Document. Toronto: Council of Ontario Universities.
- Cruikshank, Jane. (1995). Economic globalization: which side are we on? International Journal of Lifelong Learning. Vol. 14, No.6. November-December, 1995, pp.459-470.
- Currie, Jan, & Newson, Janice Eds. (1998). Universities and Globalization: Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Currie, Jan. (1998). Globalization as an Analytical Concept and Local Policy Responses, in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization : Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Currie, Jan, & Newson, Janice. (1998). Globalizing Practices: Corporate Managerialism, Accountability and Privatization, in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization : Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Dennison, John, & Gallagher, P. (1986). Canada's community colleges: a critical analysis. Vancouver: University of British Columbia Press.
- Dennison, J., & Levin, J. (1988). Goals of Community Colleges in Canada A 1987 Perspective. The Canadian Journal of Higher Education, Vol.18. pp.49-62.
- Dodds, Dick, & McNeil, Gordon. (1994). East Asia International Education Project Report. Toronto: "Education Summit" in cooperation with the Municipality of Metro Toronto Economic Development Division and the Asia Pacific Foundation.
- Dudley, Janice. (1998). Globalization and Education Policy in Australia, in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization : Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Emerson, Mary. & Newsom, Ron. (1995). Further Defining the Role of the Community College: A Model Taxonomy for International Education Programs. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, Vol. 19 No.6, pp. 501-516.



- Fisher, Donald, & Rubenson, Kjell. (1998). The Changing Political Economy The Private and Public Lives of Canadian Universities, in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization : Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Fersh, Samuel. (1990). Adding an International Dimension to the Community College: Examples and Implications, in Greenfield, Richard. Ed., (1990) Developing International Programs, New Directions for Community Colleges. v18. No 2. Sum 1990. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass INC, Publishers.
- Francis, Anne. (1993). The Internationalization of Post-secondary Institutions in British Columbia, Task Force Report. Vancouver: British Columbia Centre for International Education.
- Gleazer Jr, Edmund (1978). "International Dimensions of Community Education," (p.9 - 29) in Yarrington, Roger Ed., Internationalizing Community Colleges. Report of the 1978 Assembly convened by The American Association of Community and Junior Colleges in cooperation with The Johnson Foundation at Wingspread Racine, Wisconsin: AACJC.
- Gleazer, Jr., Edmund. (1989). Initiatives in International Education in O'Banion, Terry. Innovation in the Community College. New York: American Council on Education, Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Goodwin, C., & Nacht, M. (1983). Absence of Decision: Foreign Students in American Colleges and Universities. New York: Institute of International Education.
- Greene, William. (1990). Developing American Two Year College Programs Abroad in Greenfield, Richard. Ed., (1990) Developing International Programs, New Directions for Community Colleges. v18. No 2. Sum 1990. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass INC, Publishers.
- Greenfield, Richard. (1990). Introduction to Greenfield, Richard. Ed., (1990) Developing International Programs, New Directions for Community Colleges. v18. No 2. Sum 1990. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- Harari, Maurice. (1989). International Integration of California State University, Long Beach. Washington, D.C.: Association of State Colleges and Universities.
- Harari, Maurice. (1992). Internationalization of the Curriculum in Klasek, Charles, Ed. Bridges to the Future: Strategies for Internationalizing Higher Education. Carbondale, IL: Association of International Education Administrators.

- Harper, Michael . and Finley, Linda. (1990). Improving College Effectiveness Through International Education. Presentation to the Community College Consortium, Summer Institute. Toronto, Canada.
- Hatton, M. (1995). Internationalizing the Community College. Community College Journal of Research and Practice, Vol.19. pp. 453-470.
- Holmes, Jeffrey. (1996). Export Readiness in the Canadian Education Sector. Ottawa: CBIE Research No. 8.
- Hurabielle, Jacques. (1998). Canada's Public Colleges and Postsecondary Technical Institutions Involvement in International Education. Ph.D Thesis, University of Alberta.
- Jones, Phillip. (1998). Globalisation and Internationalism: democratic prospects for world education. Comparative Education, Vol. 34 No. 2, pp. 143-155.
- Kane, Mary. (1999). Staying in touch with the international student experience. Canadian Internationalist, Vol.9. No. 4. p. 2.
- Kerr, Clark. (1994). Troubled Times for American Higher Education: The 1990s and Beyond. New York: State University of New York Press, SUNY Series, Frontiers in Education.
- Kerr, Clark. (1980). Introduction in Burn, Barbara. Expanding the International Dimension of Higher Education. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass Publishers.
- King, Maxwell. (1981). Speech quoted in Ferish, Seymour, & Fitchen, Edward. Eds. (1981). The Community College and International Education: A Report of Progress. Cocoa, Florida: Brevard Community College.
- King, Maxwell, & Ferish, Seymour. (1992). Integrating the International/Intercultural Dimension in the Community College. Washington: Association of Community College Trustees/Community Colleges for International Development Washington.
- King, Maxwell. & Koller, Albert. (1995). Emerging Opportunities in International Education. Community College Journal, Jun/Jul 1995. pp.20-25.
- Knight, Jane. (1994). Internationalization: Elements and Checkpoints. Ottawa: CBIE Research No 7.

- Knight, Jane. (1997). Introduction to Knight, Jane. and de Wit, Hans. Eds. Internationalization of Higher Education in Asia Pacific Countries. Amsterdam: European Association for International Education in cooperation with IDP Education Australia and the Programme on Institutional Management in Higher Education (IMHE) of the Organisation for Economic Cooperation and Development (OECD).
- Knight, Jane. (1997). A Shared Vision? Stakeholders' Perspectives on the Internationalization of Higher Education in Canada. Journal of Studies on International Education. Vol. 44 No1, pp. 27-31.
- Knowles, Janet. (1995). A Matter of Survival: Emerging Entrepreneurship in Community Colleges in Canada, in Dennison, John. Ed. Challenge and Opportunity Canada's Community Colleges at the Crossroads. Vancouver: UBC Press.
- Labelle, H. (1998). Meeting the Challenges of the 21st Century: Canadian Community Colleges in the Global Village. Sisco Address at the Annual Conference of the Association of Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology of Ontario, Ottawa, Ontario.
- Leginsky, K.B. & Andrews, M. (1994). International Education and Postsecondary Education: A framework for Analysis. The Canadian Administrator Vol 34, No 3, pp. 1-9.
- Marchi, Sergio. (1998). Department of Foreign Affairs and International Trade, News Release. October 7, 1998. No. 235.
- Ministry of Education and Training, Province of Ontario. (1996). Future Goals for Ontario Colleges and Universities. Discussion Paper. Toronto: Ministry of Education and Training.
- Newson, Janice. (1998). National Responses to Globalization in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization : Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- O'Banion, Terry. (1989). Innovation in the Community College. New York: American Council on Education, Macmillan Publishing Company.
- Ontario Colleges International Committee. (1991). Goals and Objectives, Planning Document for the Period 1991-1995. Toronto: OCIC.
- Ontario Colleges International Committee. (1997). Discussion Paper: Increasing Ontario Colleges' Market Share of International Students. Toronto: OCIC.

- Ontario, Legislative Assembly. (May, 1965). An Act to Amend The Department of Education Act. Debates, 27th leg., 3rd sess., 21 May 1965
- Ontario Ministry of Colleges and Universities. (1990). Vision 2000: Quality and Opportunity The Final Report of Vision 2000 A Review of the Mandate Toronto: Council of Regents.
- Pascal, Charles. Ed. (1980). The Year of the C.A.A.T. Toronto: Higher Education Colloquium Series.
- Raby, Rosalind, & Tarrow, N. Ed. (1996). Dimensions of the Community College: International, Intercultural and Multicultural Perspectives. London: Garland Publishing.
- Scanlon, David. (1990). Lessons from the Past in Developing International Education in Community Colleges, in Greenfield, Richard. Ed., (1990) Developing International Programs, New Directions for Community Colleges. v18. No 2. Sum 1990. San Francisco: Jossey-Bass INC, Publishers.
- Schugurensky, D. & Higgins, K. (1996). From Aid to Trade, in Raby, Rosalind, & Tarrow, N. Ed. Dimensions of the Community College: International, Intercultural and Multicultural Perspectives London: Garland Publishing.
- Shannon, William. (1978). A Survey of International/Intercultural Education in 2-Year Colleges: 1976, in Backman, Earl. Ed. (1984) Approaches to International Education. American Council on Education, New York: MacMillan Publishing Co.
- Shumar, Wesley. (1997). College for Sale: A Critique of the Commodification of Higher Education. London: Falmer Press Knowledge, Identity and School Life Series.
- Slaughter, Sheila. (1998). National Higher Education Policies in a Global Economy, in Jan Currie and Janice Newson Eds., (1998). Universities and Globalization: Critical Perspectives. Thousand Oaks: Sage Publications, Inc.
- Slaughter, Sheila & Leslie, Larry. (1997). Academic Capitalism Politics, Policies and the Entrepreneurial University. Baltimore: John Hopkins University Press.
- Special Joint Committee Reviewing Canadian Foreign Policy. (1994). Canada's Foreign Policy Principles and Priorities for the Future. Ottawa: Parliamentary Publications.

Task Force on Advanced Training. (1993). No Dead Ends: Report of the Task Force on Advanced Training to the Minister of Education and Training. Toronto: Ministry of Education and Training.

Ubadigbo, Fidelis. (1997). Recruitment Dynamic of Foreign Students in United States Postsecondary Institution: The Implications for Education and International Development. Paper presented at the 20th Annual Conference on International Education "Celebrating Excellence in International Development: Twenty Years of Exemplary Practices" February 2-4, 1997 Walt Disney World, Orlando, Fl.

## APPENDIX A

### International Export of Education and International Student Recruitment. Survey of CAAT International Offices

This survey concerns two types of international activities; 1. the recruitment of individual international students (active solicitation to attract international students to the college) 2. specific training or education courses that the college sells in foreign markets. The projects may be financed by third-party bodies such as CIDA or the World Bank and may be delivered locally at the college or in the foreign country.

No information will be printed in the thesis which identifies individuals who responded to this survey. Please indicate whether or not any of the material gathered through this survey which can identify the college can be published.

☐ Yes, any material gathered through this survey, which identifies the college can be included in the thesis

☐ No, material gathered through this survey which identifies the college cannot be included in the thesis

☐ Check this box if you would like to receive a copy of the survey findings

Name:

tel:

e-mail:

1. Does the college have an international programs office?

☐ yes      ☐ no

2. If yes, what is the name of the office? \_\_\_\_\_

3. When was the office founded? \_\_\_\_\_

4. To whom in the college organization does the head of the international office report?

☐ President of the College

☐ Vice President of Academic Affairs

☐ Chief Financial Officer of College

☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

**(If possible, please attach a copy of the college organization chart, or simply sketch out the first 3 levels of the organization system below)**

5. What were the factors that prompted the creation of the international office? (check as many as apply). Please circle the most important factor in prompting the creation of the international office.

- ☐ Direction from the board
- ☐ Direction from the college President
- ☐ Pressure from faculty
- ☐ Pressure from administrators
- ☐ Need to coordinate college international projects
- ☐ Desire for more enrollment
- ☐ Desire to increase revenue
- ☐ Outlet for faculty expertise
- ☐ Need to compete with other colleges
- ☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

6. What functions does the office perform? (check as many as apply) Please circle the most important function the office performs.

- ☐ Recruit international students to the college generally
- ☐ Recruit international students into programs specifically designed for them
- ☐ Sell education and training programs to developing economies with funding support from NGOs, e.g. CIDA
- ☐ Sell education and training programs directly to foreign markets
- ☐ Internationalize the college community
- ☐ Internationalize the college curriculum

7. Does your international office have a formal mandate approved by the Board of Governors?

- ☐ yes (please attach) ☐ no

8. Was there a key initiative (i.e. key person, key event, key project) that initiated international programming at the office? Please specify.

9. What were the earliest international programs or initiatives to recruit international students?

10. During the last 12 months, approximately what percentage of the activities of your international office concerned:

- a) international student recruitment \_\_\_\_\_%
- b) training and education programs delivered in a foreign country \_\_\_\_\_%
- c) training and education programs

for a specific group of foreign  
students delivered at the college

d) Other \_\_\_\_\_

\_\_\_\_\_ %  
\_\_\_\_\_ %  
Total: 100%

### **INTERNATIONAL STUDENT RECRUITMENT (questions 11-20)**

"International students" refer to individual students who are non-residents of Canada and are studying at the college, with the intention of returning to their home country. **This group does not include international students who are studying at the college as part of an educational export activity.** For the purposes of this survey, international students are those students studying in an approved diploma program or college preparation program such as English as a Second Language.

11. Identify the statement which **best** summarizes how your college organizes international student recruitment:

- ☐ One international office undertakes all the international student recruitment activities
- ☐ Different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives to recruit international students and undertake all the administration and organization of the recruitment activities
- ☐ Department undertakes its own initiatives and central international office undertakes all the administration and organization of the recruitment process
- ☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

12. Has recruitment policy and practice changed since 1996 when the government gave the college the right to keep the monies from international student tuition fees? Please explain why or why not.

13. How many international students were enrolled at the college in approved college programs and preparatory programs such as ESL, in the previous academic year? (1997-1998)

14. How would you describe the trend in international student recruitment over the **past ten years**?

- ☐ Slow increase in the number of international students enrolled at the college
- ☐ Rapid increase in the number of international enrolled at the college
- ☐ Decrease in the number of international students enrolled at the college
- ☐ No change in the number of international students enrolled at the college



☐ Slow increase in the number of international students enrolled in the college, followed by a rapid increase in international student enrollment in the past four years

☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

15. What is the average tuition and incidental fee paid by an international student in a standard diploma program?

Tuition Fee: \$\_\_\_\_\_/academic year Incidental Fee: \$\_\_\_\_\_/academic year

16. Is Health Insurance included in the incidental fee?

☐ YES

☐ NO

17. Please rate on a scale of 5-1 with 5 being not important and 1 being very important, the following objectives of international student recruitment according to the importance, in your opinion, of the objective of:

	Not Important	Some what Important	Moderately Important	Important	Very Important
Bringing foreign perspectives to local student body	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering international trade links	5	4	3	2	1
Bringing foreign perspectives to curriculum	5	4	3	2	1
Generating revenue for the college	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering sense of world community	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering Professional Development for Faculty	5	4	3	2	1

Creating Exchange Opportunities for Faculty and Students	5	4	3	2	1
Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs	5	4	3	2	1

Additional Comments About the Above Question:

18. Please rank order the 8 objectives listed in question #18 in terms of their importance to the college and its goals for international programming: (1 being most important and 8 being least important)

- \_\_\_ Bringing foreign perspectives to local student body
- \_\_\_ Fostering international trade links
- \_\_\_ Bringing foreign perspectives to the curriculum
- \_\_\_ Generating revenue for the college
- \_\_\_ Fostering sense of world community
- \_\_\_ Fostering professional development for faculty
- \_\_\_ Creating exchange opportunities for faculty and students
- \_\_\_ Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs

19. What strategies does your college use to recruit foreign students? (Check as many as apply)

- ☐ Attending education fairs in foreign countries
- ☐ Using print advertisements in foreign markets
- ☐ Attending federal or provincial trade missions to foreign countries in order to promote the college
- ☐ Using the Canadian embassies/consulates to disseminate information about the college
- ☐ Advertising on the Internet/Website
- ☐ Using professional marketing firms
- ☐ Collaborating with other institutions in order to recruit students
- ☐ Participating in Canadian Education Centres (CECs)
- ☐ Other \_\_\_\_\_

20. Please rate on a scale of 5-1 with 5 being not committed and 1 being very committed, the commitment to foreign student recruitment of:

	Not Committed	Somewhat Committed	Moderately Committed	Committed	Very Committed
Your college president	5	4	3	2	1
College faculty	5	4	3	2	1

College administration including deans and department chairpersons	5	4	3	2	1
Students at the college	5	4	3	2	1
The Board of the college	5	4	3	2	1
Provincial Ministry of Education	5	4	3	2	1

ADDITIONAL COMMENTS ON THE ABOVE QUESTION:

### **EXPORTED EDUCATION & TRAINING PROGRAMS (questions 21-31)**

The following questions apply to training and education programs (**block placements**) the college is supplying to a foreign country and delivered in the foreign country or delivered at the college in Ontario. Students enrolled in these block placements are not considered part of the college's regular international student enrollment.

21. Identify the statement which **best** summarizes how your college organizes educational export activities:

- ☐ One international office secures the contracts and undertakes the administration and organization of contracted programs
- ☐ Different departments in the college undertake their own initiatives to develop and deliver contracted programs and undertake all the administration and organization of contracted programs
- ☐ Department undertakes its own initiatives and central international office undertakes all the administration and organization of contracted programs
- ☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

22. What was the principle stimulus that led the colleges to become involved in exporting training and education to foreign markets? (e.g. a critical incident, the initiative of an individual administrator or faculty member, a connection with a foreign institution, a request from an NGO, etc...)

23. How have educational export activities evolved at the college over the years since they first started? (answer the question on the back of questionnaire if necessary)

24. Please rate on a scale of 5-1 with 5 being not important and 1 being very important, the following factors for their importance in motivating the college to participate in educational export:

	Not Important	Somewhat Important	Moderately Important	Important	Very Important
Bringing foreign perspectives to local student body	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering international trade links	5	4	3	2	1
Bringing foreign perspectives to curriculum	5	4	3	2	1
Generating revenue for the college	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering sense of world community	5	4	3	2	1
Fostering Professional Development for Faculty	5	4	3	2	1
Creating exchange opportunities for Faculty and Students	5	4	3	2	1
Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs	5	4	3	2	1

25. Please rank the 8 factors listed in question 24 , according to the influence they have on motivating the college to participate in educational export: (1 being most important and 8 being least important)

- \_\_\_ Bringing foreign perspectives to the local student body
- \_\_\_ Fostering international trade links
- \_\_\_ Bringing foreign perspectives to curriculum
- \_\_\_ Generating revenue for the college
- \_\_\_ Fostering sense of world community
- \_\_\_ Fostering Professional development for faculty
- \_\_\_ Creating exchange opportunities for Faculty and Students
- \_\_\_ Maximizing underutilized college facilities and programs

26. Is there a post project evaluation of each training activity?

☐ Yes (please briefly describe, or attach an example)

☐ No

27. Using the chart below, please describe three of the major projects that your college has been involved with during the past three years. These can be completed and/or currently active projects. Who or what initiated these activities? How many faculty, local students and college administrators are involved with these projects, and how many contracted students are enrolled?

Title or major theme of project	Year project began	Initiator of project	# of faculty, local students and college administrators involved	Number of contracted students enrolled	Length of program
		<input type="checkbox"/> faculty member <input type="checkbox"/> college president <input type="checkbox"/> administration <input type="checkbox"/> CIDA/NGO <input type="checkbox"/> Purchaser of Program <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER _____ -	Faculty _____ Local Students _____ College Administrators _____ _____		
		<input type="checkbox"/> faculty member <input type="checkbox"/> college president <input type="checkbox"/> administration <input type="checkbox"/> CIDA/NGO <input type="checkbox"/> Purchaser of Program <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER _____ -	Faculty _____ Local Students _____ College Administrators _____ _____		
		<input type="checkbox"/> faculty member <input type="checkbox"/> college president <input type="checkbox"/> administration <input type="checkbox"/> CIDA/NGO <input type="checkbox"/> Purchaser of Program <input type="checkbox"/> OTHER _____ -	Faculty _____ Local Students _____ College Administrators _____ _____		

		<input type="checkbox"/> OTHER _____	trators _____		
--	--	--------------------------------------	---------------	--	--

**PLEASE ATTACH ANY DESCRIPTIVE MATERIALS PERTAINING TO THE ABOVE PROJECTS**

28. Please rate on a scale of 5-1 with 5 being not committed and 1 being extremely committed, your perception of the commitment to education export of:

	Not Committed	Somewhat Committed	Moderately Committed	Committed	Very Committed
Your college president	5	4	3	2	1
College faculty	5	4	3	2	1
College administration including deans and department chairpersons	5	4	3	2	1
Students at the college	5	4	3	2	1
The Board of the college	5	4	3	2	1
Provincial Ministry of Education	5	4	3	2	1

29. What is the estimated total revenue from the international educational export contracts of the college during each of the last five years?

Fiscal Year 1994 \$ \_\_\_\_\_  
 Fiscal Year 1995 \$ \_\_\_\_\_  
 Fiscal Year 1996 \$ \_\_\_\_\_  
 Fiscal Year 1997 \$ \_\_\_\_\_  
 Fiscal Year 1998 (projected) \$ \_\_\_\_\_

30. Does the college require a business plan for each project?

☐ Yes ☐ No ☐ Other (please specify)

\_\_\_\_\_

31. Projects are expected to: (check most applicable option)

- ☐ Produce net revenue over expenses
- ☐ Pay for expenses only
- ☐ Occasionally operate in the red
- ☐ Projects are generally expected to produce net revenue over expenses, but occasionally some projects are expected to operate in the red
- ☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

32. How are the operating costs of the international office covered? (Check as many as are applicable)

- ☐ % of recruitment money allocated to cover costs of international office
- ☐ Money provided by central allocations
- ☐ Money from project revenue
- ☐ Other (please specify) \_\_\_\_\_

33. What do you see as some of the major issues in international student recruitment and educational export?

**PLEASE INCLUDE THE FOLLOWING DOCUMENTS WITH THE SURVEY**

1. A LIST AND BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF CURRENT EDUCATIONAL EXPORT PROJECTS
2. COPY OF COLLEGE ORGANIZATION CHART
3. COPY OF INTERNATIONAL OFFICE MISSION STATEMENT OR MANDATE
4. ANY DOCUMENTS PERTAINING TO THE HISTORICAL EVOLUTION OF INTERNATIONAL ACTIVITIES AT THE COLLEGE

## **APPENDIX B**

**ADRIENNE GALWAY**  
86 Rosedale Heights Drive  
Toronto, Ontario M4T 1C5  
tel: (416) 485-2378 fax: (416) 485-8990  
e-mail: agalway@oise.utoronto.ca

**August 12, 1998**

As per the attached letter to President from Dr. Robert Gordon, Chairperson of the Council of Presidents, please find enclosed a copy of the survey that is part of the study which I am conducting for my doctoral dissertation. I am a student in the Department of Theory and Policy Studies at OISE/University of Toronto and my dissertation will examine the participation of the Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology in international student recruitment and the international export of education.

The purpose of the study is to establish a picture of what is happening in the CAATs in these two areas, document how international student recruitment and educational export has evolved at the CAATs, and identify the major issues involved in these areas of college activity. This study will generate information that will highlight the important work that the colleges are carrying out in the area of international contract education programs and in international student recruitment. It is important to the college system as a whole that these activities be documented and examined.

Data for the study are being collected in two ways. The survey which I have enclosed has been sent to all twenty-five CAATs in order to gather as much factual information as possible. The second data collection method involves interviews with a sample of college presidents, chief financial officers, and individuals like yourself from the colleges' international offices.

Your time and effort in completing and returning the survey and requested documents is greatly appreciated. The survey has been pre-tested with a former college president, an international office chairperson such as yourself, and two other individuals from the college and international education community. It should take you only about twenty minutes to complete the survey. Based upon the results of the survey a representative sample of colleges will be selected for follow up interviews.



The research proposal has been through an ethical review. Please be assured that your responses will be kept confidential, as explained in greater detail on the first page of the survey.

If you have any questions about the survey or the research project, please do not hesitate to contact me. If you return a completed questionnaire, that will be deemed informed consent to participate in the survey.

Please return the survey and any accompanying materials, to me by September 21, 1998, in the addressed, stamped envelope included with the survey.

Thank you again for participating in this study, I believe that it will generate some interesting and important data about the international activities of the CAATs.

Sincerely,

Adrienne Galway

## **APPENDIX C**

### **Interview Questions for International Office Chairpersons:**

1. Could you tell me a little about how your college got involved in international educational export and international student recruitment, and then maybe something about how you see it fitting into the overall college mission?
2. What impacts positive or negative do you think these activities have on your college?
3. Given that the mandate of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology is to provide education and training to Ontario citizens and businesses, how do international activities fit into the mission and mandate of your college?
4. How did international activities evolve at the college?
5. What does the college hope to achieve by participating in international activities?
6. Do you believe that colleges are beginning to act as businesses in the international marketplace? Do you see any problems with this?
7. Do you think that there are any significant consequences of the lack of coordination among colleges for international activities?
8. What should the role of the provincial government be in college international activities?
9. What should the role of the federal government be in college international activities?
10. In a recent study of the international activities of Canadian community colleges, significant discontent on the part of the colleges with organizations such as ACCC and CBIE was revealed. What role do you believe these organizations and other NGOs should play in college international activities?
11. Where in the organizational structure of the college have international activities been placed? Why?
12. If the international education office received additional resources, what would these additional resources be used for? Is the current level of funding for the office adequate?

13. How are personnel selected to participate in international activities?
14. How is the international office funded? What happens to the revenue that the office generates? How is the salary of faculty engaged in educational export activities covered?
15. How does the college go about (a) recruiting international students and (b) securing educational export contracts?
16. How much money does the college spend on foreign student recruitment and on securing educational export contracts?
17. Has the college set financial goals for its international activities? What are the financial goals? Have these goals changed over time?
18. Would you agree with the statement that the purpose of international activities is financial rather than educational? Are these international activities making major financial contributions that the college cannot do without in the absence of increased government funding?
19. In the literature on international education, it appears that the success of educational export is often dependent on a handful of faculty and administrators interested in international export. To what extent has this been the experience at your college?
20. What areas/disciplines are international activities concentrated in?
21. Do you view the fact that colleges do not issue an internationally recognizable credential as a significant problem?
22. How does your college deal with issues of human rights and political regimes when considering/undertaking a project in a foreign country?
23. Some authors have suggested that international education activities can serve as tools for developed countries to "colonize" developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries. How do you feel about this assertion?
24. What do you see as some of the future trends in international education activities?

## **APPENDIX D**

### **Interview Questions for College Presidents:**

1. Could you tell me a little about how your college got involved in international educational export and international student recruitment, and then maybe something about you see it fitting into the overall college mission?
2. What impacts positive or negative do you think these activities have on your college?
3. Given that the mandate of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology is to provide education and training to Ontario citizens and businesses, how do international activities fit into the mission and mandate of your college?
4. Do you believe that colleges are beginning to act as businesses in the international marketplace? Do you see any problems with this?
5. What does the college hope to achieve by participating in international activities?
6. How did international activities evolve at the college?
7. In the literature on international education, it appears that the success of educational export is often dependent on a handful of faculty and administrators interested in international export. To what extent has this been the experience at your college?
8. Where in the organizational structure of the college have international activities been placed? Why?
9. What should the role of the provincial government be in college international activities?
10. What should the role of the federal government be in college international activities? .
11. In a recent study of the international activities of Canadian community colleges, significant discontent on the part of the colleges with organizations such as ACCC and CBIE was revealed. What role do you believe these organizations and other NGOs should play in college international activities?

12. Has the college set financial goals for its international activities? What are the financial goals? Have these goals changed over time?
13. Do you view the fact that colleges do not issue an internationally recognizable credential as a significant problem?
14. How does your college deal with issues of human rights and political regimes when considering/undertaking a project in a foreign country?
15. Some authors have suggested that international education activities can serve as tools for developed countries to "colonize" developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries. How do you feel about this assertion?
16. What do you see as some of the future trends in international education activities at the colleges?

## **APPENDIX E**

### **INTERVIEW QUESTIONS FOR ACCC**

1. Given that the mandate of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology is to provide education and training to Ontario citizens and businesses, how do you see international activities such as international student recruitment and the international export of education (contract training) fitting into the overall mission and mandate of the colleges?
2. What do believe that colleges can achieve/gain by participating in international activities?
3. Do you believe that colleges are beginning to act as businesses in the international marketplace? Do you see any problems with this?
4. Do you think that there are any significant consequences of the lack of coordination among colleges for international activities?
5. What should the role of the provincial government be in college international activities?
6. What should the role of the federal government be in college international activities?
7. What role does ACCC play in international student recruitment at the CAATs?
8. What role does ACCC play in educational export at the CAATs?
9. There has been some criticism of the role that ACCC plays in international educational export and I would like to give ACCC a chance to respond to some of these criticisms. Some of the colleges were critical of the membership fees charged by ACCC, and felt that they did not experience "value" for their membership dollar. A few of the larger colleges expressed concern that they are finding themselves in competition with ACCC for projects. Other colleges expressed concern that ACCC is "shutting them out" of projects in favour of "spreading the wealth" to smaller colleges. What is your reaction to these comments and criticisms?
10. Do you view the fact that colleges do not issue an internationally recognizable credential as a significant problem?

11. Many of the countries where the CAATs are conducting projects, have very poor human rights records. Do you see any problem with Canadian colleges participating in projects in countries with repressive political regimes, or poor human rights records?
12. Some authors have suggested that international education activities can serve as tools for developed countries to “colonize” developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries. How do you feel about this assertion?
13. What do you see as some of the future trends in international student recruitment and educational export?

## **APPENDIX F**

### **INTERVIEW QUESTIONS FOR CBIE**

1. Given that the mandate of the Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology is to provide education and training to Ontario citizens and businesses, how do you see international activities such as international student recruitment and the international export of education (contract training) fitting into the overall mission and mandate of the colleges?
2. What do believe that colleges can achieve/gain by participating in international activities?
3. Do you believe that colleges are beginning to act as businesses in the international marketplace? Do you see any problems with this?
4. Do you think that there are any significant consequences of the lack of coordination among colleges for international activities?
5. What should the role of the provincial government be in college international activities?
6. What should the role of the federal government be in college international activities?
7. What role does CBIE play in international student recruitment at the CAATs?
8. What role does CBIE play in educational export at the CAATs?
9. There has been some criticism of the role that CBIE plays in international educational export and I would like to give CBIE a chance to respond to some of these criticisms. Some of the colleges were critical of the membership fees charged by CBIE, and felt that they did not experience "value" for their membership dollar. Other colleges felt that CBIE was not helpful to them in the recruitment process.
10. Do you view the fact that colleges do not issue an internationally recognizable credential as a significant problem?
11. Many of the countries where the CAATs are conducting projects, have very poor human rights records. Do you see any problem with Canadian colleges



participating in projects in countries with repressive political regimes, or poor human rights records?

12. Some authors have suggested that international education activities can serve as tools for developed countries to “colonize” developing nations by transplanting western ideas and values into these countries. How do you feel about this assertion?
13. What do you see as some of the future trends in international student recruitment and educational export?

**APPENDIX G****CONSENT FORM FOR OTHER INTERVIEWEES**

Adrienne Galway  
86 Rosedale Heights Drive  
Toronto, Ontario M4T 1C5  
tel: (416) 495-2378 fax: (416) 485-8990  
e-mail: agalway@oise.utoronto.ca

DATE, 1999

Thank you for agreeing to participate in an interview regarding international student recruitment and the international export of education at the Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. The data collected during this interview will be incorporated into the dissertation. Please note that you have the right to withdraw from the study at any time.

Please choose one of the following consent options:

\_\_\_\_I hereby give my consent to have my name, position and organizational affiliation identified in the thesis.

\_\_\_\_I hereby give my consent to have my position and organizational affiliation identified in the thesis.

\_\_\_\_I hereby give my consent to have my organizational affiliation identified in the thesis.

Signature \_\_\_\_\_

Date\_\_\_\_\_

**APPENDIX H****CONSENT FORM FOR COLLEGE PRESIDENTS AND INTERNATIONAL  
OFFICE PERSONNEL.**

Adrienne Galway  
86 Rosedale Heights Drive  
Toronto, Ontario M4T 1C5  
tel: (416) 495-2378 fax: (416) 485-8990  
e-mail: agalway@oise.utoronto.ca

DATE, 1999

Thank you for agreeing to participate in an interview regarding international student recruitment and the international export of education at the Ontario Colleges of Applied Arts and Technology. The data collected during this interview will be incorporated into the dissertation. Please note that you are free to terminate the interview at any point.

Please choose one of the following options:

\_\_\_ Information gathered through this interview that identifies me by name, my position at the college, and the college that I represent, may be included in the thesis.

\_\_\_ Information gathered through this interview that does not identify me by name but that identifies my position at the college and the college itself, may be included in the thesis.

\_\_\_ The only information collected during this interview that can be included in the thesis is information that does not identify myself or the college.

SIGNATURE \_\_\_\_\_

DATE \_\_\_\_\_